Mary-Rose Puttick

Language Issues Journal

Community languages edition: issues and opportunities
Title:

“It's like raising someone you don’t understand.”

‘A fine balance: cultural and linguistic barriers shaping the lives of Somali refugee families in Manchester’

Abstract

Wide-ranging educational, political, economic, social, and cultural factors have an influence on the extent of marginalisation to integration experienced by newly-arrived refugee families to the U.K. This study focused on Somali refugee families in Manchester, U.K., many of whom were illiterate in their first language (L1) or had low levels of previous education. An inter-disciplinary approach was utilised drawing primarily from the fields of applied linguistics, education, and refugee and migration studies to identify the specific needs of refugees. The study addressed the linguistic and cultural discourses and challenges which arise in the global context of acculturation. It considered how such factors could lead to conflict between diverse communities, focusing on the situational context of the U.K. primary education system. Conflict was shown to arise, to different extents, from a lack of understanding regarding legislation, school safeguarding laws, school attendance and punctuality procedures, and curriculum delivery. Practical suggestions were made to address these issues as well as the needs of illiterate parents. Recommendations were also made regarding improving communication methods between schools and second language (L2) parents and developing an inter-agency approach, particularly through family learning and ESOL provision.

Introduction

The experience of diverse cultural groups relocating to a new society is a powerful process influenced by a multitude of factors, from the circumstances of their exit to the interactions they encounter on arrival. In many cases this coincides with relocation from a non-Western to Western society. This process can be viewed as a continuum of marginalisation to integration, which when successful can see groups establish themselves economically whilst enjoying the benefits of living in a democratic society. At the other extreme, when people become isolated and vulnerable it can result in them turning away from the new culture and adopting an antagonistic, extreme version of their own (Home Office, 2011).

Culture is a complex term, influenced by wider societal processes including political, economic, social, and educational aspects. When individuals and groups from different cultural backgrounds communicate, an element of adaptation and negotiation is required from both parties in order for communication to be successful, and conflict and misunderstandings avoided. Based on my observations and teaching experiences in family learning, I suggest there are numerous ways communication could be developed to improve the relationship between families and schools. Illiteracy can be a root cause of marginalization resulting in a lack of engagement with children’s learning, less opportunities to gain from family learning initiatives, and unequal access to key information from schools, such as those concerned with British laws and core ‘British values’.

Schools are national, state-managed socio-political institutions, communicating messages within the dominant culture hegemony, under a mandate to project values of citizenship and collective identities (Scherr, 2009). Inner-city primary schools in the U.K. have increasing numbers of ethnic minority students from diverse cultures, with parents for whom English is an L2. This brings with it wide-ranging positives, such as the promotion of respect and tolerance for different cultures, as well as the need for certain adaptations on the part of both the schools and the parents, particularly in the realm of effective communication methods. It
is paramount that the relationship between schools and parents is as positive as possible in order to ensure the best possible experience for the children as well as minimising the chance of the parents becoming isolated.

The study began as a response to real concerns raised by the head-teacher of one Manchester primary school regarding communication and conflict issues with Somali parents resulting from two safeguarding referrals. This paper takes the position that improvements in how government policy agendas, such as Safeguarding and Prevent, are communicated to L2 parents are vital, and that the responsibility for communicating should be a multi-agency approach, with the welfare of children as the central focus (DFE, 2015).

Barriers facing refugees

Analysing the experience of refugees at a macro or global level initially, the study examined the overall acculturation process, when a particular cultural group relocates from a familiar to an unfamiliar environment (Ting-Toomey & Chung, 2012). Many studies in the field of L2 acquisition merge immigrants into one group, however those based on the language acquisition of refugees call for distinguishing between different types of immigrants: trans-migrants; voluntary immigrants; and involuntary immigrants, of which refugees fit into the latter (De Costa, 2010). It is useful to begin with a definition of a refugee:

Owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, [a refugee] is outside the country of his nationality, and is unable to, or owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country (UN Refugee Agency, 2011).

Whilst sharing many similarities with other ESOL learners in terms of socio-cultural barriers, it is considered that refugees additionally have hidden or internal barriers caused by cognitive and psychological stress. Boyle and Ali’s (2009) research calls for a revised conceptualisation of acculturation which takes into account the unique experience of refugees, particularly with regards to the societal upheaval from which they left, which will have an influence on the refugee community formed in the new society. In terms of how this can then affect their experience of education in the new society, Thomas and Collier’s (1997) research links traumatic experiences, low literacy levels, and interrupted education, to an increased length of time of up to ten years for people to catch up to the average level of cognitive and academic language level. Further studies found common issues faced by adult refugee students including the school curriculum being too fast-paced, and students encountering difficulties with academic skills such as critical thinking, note-taking, and organisation (Bobrow Finn, 2010; Elmeroth, 2003; Kleinmann, 1984). Furthermore, these studies implied that it is virtually impossible for those who are illiterate in their L1 to develop this language output, with the primary need to be taught literacy skills first in their L1 rather than the L2.

Intercultural communication

One of the main theoretical frameworks utilised in the study was a discourse approach to intercultural communication, linking language behaviours to social actions. Social actions are considered in a variety of contexts, including intra-culturally between parents and children, and inter-culturally when parents communicate in British society, and specifically with primary school staff and community organisations. Discourse relates to the act of communication and shared interaction. This communication can be produced in a variety of ways, such as spoken, textual, and visual, which are interconnected to factors such as context, shared background, and cultural knowledge, all of which have an influence on comprehension (Bloor & Bloor, 2007; Koller, 2009). The study encompasses wide-ranging discourses including for many of the Somali parents a shift from a strong oral communicative
tradition (Bentley & Wilson Owens, 2008) to the new oral and written discourses of the host-culture. Additional discourses include: a unique mixed discourse used inside the home with their children consisting of two or more languages; the discourses which result from twenty-first century global communication including the internet, text messaging, and satellite broadcasting; political discourses such as safeguarding legislation; and school discourses with specialized language related to education which is communicated orally such as in teacher-parent interaction, visually through school websites and notices, and textually through text messages, newsletters, and letters to parents.

Additional theories addressing identity as a socio-cultural phenomenon were analysed, which focused on the intersection of language, culture, and society (e.g. Bucholtz and Hall, 2005). The cultural and linguistic challenges facing Somalis in the U.K. affecting communication are multi-layered, influenced by the differing roles of the participants, such as the role of parent, professional roles, roles within Manchester’s diasporic Somali community, and fluctuating gender and religious roles as a result of living in a Western society. Furthermore many participants do not have a social structure to which they can relate aspects of British society. This is both because of their reference to past experiences, such as the education system in Somalia, or similarly because of a lack of reference due to 14 years of political unrest in Somalia. The Somali parents were also negotiating and accepting that their children, many of whom were British-born, would inevitably have very different concepts of identity to their own, influenced by their social and cultural upbringings.

A multi-agency approach

Although conflict is mostly seen in a negative sense, van Meurs and Spencer-Oatey (2009) emphasise the opposite; that it can actually be seen in a positive light when viewed as a catalyst for change, reflection, and a means to integrate groups who were not in the past cohesive. This fits in with the overriding aims of the current research; to manage and develop intercultural communication strategies for L2 refugee parents within the contexts of primary and community education and to improve links and support between these two educational contexts. It is useful to first consider recommendations made by existing relevant studies, in order to consider how these can be applied in practice.

In terms of macro-level intervention Mohamed and Yusuf (2012) reflect on the need for development of specific programmes and policies to suit the needs of Somali refugees, specifying the role of service providers in this, such as developing community education and inter-agency collaboration. Fangen’s (2006) study of Somali refugees in Norway, which could be considered in some respects a comparable democratic society to the U.K., led to a series of recommendations for newly-arrived refugees. These include the need to communicate citizenship rights; to exercise communicative clarity with regards to official procedures; to implement ongoing monitoring and support related to language and cultural misunderstandings; and to develop self-help groups amongst these communities to support and overcome intra-cultural conflicts.

Although macro-level developments in this area are integral to the long-term experience of L2 parents, it would take a much larger and in-depth study for such changes to be made. This may prove difficult in the current political and economic climate which sees ongoing funding cuts in community and adult education provision. Despite this, there are changes which could be implemented at the micro-level immediately which could start to improve the lives of newly-arrived refugee families. In order to investigate this further I focused on three research questions and addressed these questions through concepts derived through the interview coding process: ‘adapting to acculturation’, ‘clashing of cultures’, and ‘building bridges’.

Research questions
1- What cultural and linguistic discourses and challenges emerge from the process of acculturation?

2- What are the nature and scope of intercultural conflict between Manchester primary schools and Somali parents?

3- What measures could be taken to manage conflict and develop successful intercultural communication?

The study

30 participants were included in the original study: 20 parents; 6 educational professionals from 3 primary schools (including 2 head-teachers, an assistant-head, a teaching-assistant, and 2 family support workers); and 4 representatives from a Somali adult social care agency, a national African children's safeguarding charity and an international African charity. Of the parents, 16 were from Somalia and 4 were from other African countries. However, for the purpose of this article I will solely focus on the results from the Somali participants. The Somali parents had lived in the U.K for differing lengths of time, ranging from 2 to 15 years, had all arrived in the U.K as refugees, and all had different levels of spoken and written English. This group were selected because they constituted a large proportion of the primary school population in Moss Side, Manchester, and all of the parents had attended my family literacy courses provided through the adult education service. Moss Side is in the bottom 5% of the most economically deprived areas of Manchester and has a larger proportion of ethnic minority groups than other groups; 58.3% (Roy, 2010).

The empirical research was conducted through 27 semi-structured, qualitative interviews which averaged 33 minutes. The majority of interviews were conducted with individual participants. The minority of parents who had low levels of spoken English were interviewed in pairs with a parent with higher level English acting as an interpreter. All interviews were recorded using a voice recorder and subsequently transcribed by hand, in verbatim. Using constructivist grounded theory as a framework (Charmaz, 2006) I carried out a thorough coding procedure. Each transcript was initially-coded using a short phrase, beginning where possible with an action verb, and the results were then collated into focused coding to inductively build theory. This involved deriving broader themes under which relevant initial codes could be placed, assisting in the process of linking and comparing codes.

Adapting to acculturation

Parents were asked questions about their arrival in the U.K. and regarding their feelings about theirs, and their children’s, changing identities. Answers indicated a definition of culture experienced within the context of living in a Western society which is in constant fluctuation according to the circumstances within which they are operating. This signified an acculturation process taking place, defined by the interview results as the ability or willingness to let go of parts of their home culture and absorb new influences, whether it be societal or generational, to allow for a new form of the culture. The conditions under which religion and language as aspects of culture are maintained are also likely to change as length of residence in the U.K. increases, with two participants using the phrases ‘fading’ and ‘shedding away’ with regards to these aspects of their culture. Many participants stressed the need for both parents and children to adapt. Factors influencing their ability to adapt appeared in terms of their previous life situations, their willingness to learn the language, and their views towards their changing identities, with one participant stating:

Being a parent, if you don’t have the language, you don’t understand where the child is coming from and the child doesn’t understand where you are coming
from...it is a barrier...it's like you are raising someone you don't understand.

(Esra, 33-year-old, Somali mother, and Teaching Assistant in primary school)

The results suggest that the degree of acculturation is dependent on the individual and as such can be viewed as a continuum which changes over time. Further results highlighted multilingual households, with the majority of parents observing that despite children understanding the parents’ L1, their preference was to respond in English. This resulted in some parents adapting and using a mixture of both languages when speaking to their children. The consequences of this linguistic variation included some children being unable to communicate with their grandparents or the older generation. Shifts also occurred in the responsibilities of parents and children, with some parents relying on their children to interpret for them, which in some cases meant children acting as gatekeepers to information and misinterpreting communication from the school. This was particularly true for parents who had no literacy in their L1 or L2 when they arrived in the U.K. Some parents spoke about their previous illiteracy and praised the educational opportunities provided to them at their children's school in family learning classes, which had helped them to progress onto mainstream adult education:

When I was back home in the countryside as a farmer it was like coming from the dark into the light, I didn’t know anything about the outside world...now I have realised a lot of things, going to school, learning something...so like dark and light. (Cali, 55-year-old, Somali father)

The data highlighted that questions concerning identity were frequent in participants’ households, with many referring to questions from very young children. The overall feeling of parents was that they did not view their children growing up in a Westernised society as a problem at present, but they worried about the influences their children would experience as teenagers, particularly through social media. Furthermore, they were aware of the extreme differences in their own upbringing compared to their children's and were struggling to adjust to this. One charity worker working with African families in Manchester viewed the way children are expected to conform culturally inside/outside the home as creating an extremely challenging situation for children, which resulted in clashes between African/Western upbringings:

So children don’t know...and the conflict for children is that when they're at home they're expected to be proper African; when they step outside they’re expected to be proper British. For me it’s the children that are struggling because they have to be able to live in both worlds. (Dembe, 40-year-old, Ugandan mother, and African charity worker).

**Clashing of cultures**

Examining clashes between the parents and schools, results indicated that this occurred to different extents, due to a difference in understanding or opinions concerning what are considered acceptable cultural practices in the U.K., as well as the British laws which govern these practices. Issues highlighted by both the school staff and the charity workers included: discipline measures and Female Genital Mutilation (FGM), which are both part of school safeguarding procedures; curriculum delivery; punctuality; and recognition of religious festivals.

The consequences of such misunderstandings led to two child protection referrals of Somali children at one of the schools, which resulted in the Somali community challenging the way the school had dealt with the referrals, and requesting that the school had instead approached their elders first. Thirteen parents and all the school staff confirmed the continued significance of elders in dealing with conflict within the Somali culture and that this still applies strongly in Manchester. The process for safeguarding referrals followed by the
school resulted in the Somali community feeling excluded, with many misunderstanding the legal obligations of the school to act in this way. The Somali community coming together as a group when faced with a situation of conflict also occurred at one of the other primary schools. There a large group of Somali parents gathered outside the school to express their anger regarding the scheduling of the annual trip on the same day they were celebrating their Eid festival.

The interview results highlighted that the Somali culture is a strongly communal society, with all parents referring to the importance of group support and emphasising the continued importance of dealing with issues as a collective. One Somali parent referenced the traditional system of always consulting elders in the community first with any problems, as they were held in the highest regard by the hierarchical system. However, the majority of participants recognised and accepted the fact that the status and use of elders was changing and acknowledged that the elders were generally not aware of British laws. As a result of these incidents, both schools had negotiated with the Somali community, asking them to select their own representatives who would meet with the head-teachers on a monthly basis or whenever an issue concerning any Somali parents arose.

Several participants mentioned a fear amongst parents of Children’s Services and a deepened suspicion of the school, particularly the home visits two schools were conducting prior to children starting in the nursery. The issue of FGM was raised amongst all of the charity and educational professionals, excluding the Somali staff, as a cultural practice still prevalent in some communities. They felt many parents, particularly those newly-arrived, were unaware FGM was against the law in the U.K. This is a particularly pertinent and urgent issue as the charity worker spoke of research conducted by her employer in the previous year which had found the practice being conducted in Manchester (AFRUCA, 2015). As the issues raised are culturally sensitive and with regards to FGM, an unknown in British culture, staff were aware of the need for careful planning to address these issues with parents, with each of the three schools operating in different ways regarding this.

Regarding delivery of curriculum content, there was little evidence of disagreements, other than that raised by an assistant-head of one school, who discussed conflict arising amongst the parents about how the SRE curriculum should be taught, which is determined by each school. At present this part of the curriculum is currently under negotiation as to whether it will become compulsory in primary as well as secondary schools (Burns, 2015). This could be viewed as the government reacting to global media discourses of dangers to children, such as sexual behaviour through social media. It is also symbolic of the delicate balance between schools’ priorities of teaching children about safe sex, particularly in the secondary education system where this is compulsory, which may juxtapose with some Muslim parents’ interpretations of the Quran regarding contraception.

**Building bridges**

The final results category was titled using the in-vivo term ‘building bridges’ as the phrase arose in several interviews in relation to building bridges in different contexts: between the school and community; between family learning provision and under-represented groups in the community; and intra-culturally, between the Somali leaders/representatives and the Somali parent community. Several participants also discussed the need to build trust, confidence, and relationships in both intra and intercultural contexts. The results in this section led to an analysis of the possible solutions to manage and address such issues such as: developing appropriate school/parent discourses; expanding community links; and improving family learning provision. All these stages are intrinsically linked and it could be argued all are essential in order for these solutions to occur most effectively.

It was evident that the three schools had a strong ethos of inclusion and already had significant measures in place to assist L2 parents, with the main strategies being the use of
in-house interpreters amongst the school staff and the written translation mechanism on the school websites. Furthermore, school staff spoke of the necessity to carefully word educational discourses such as letters, text messages, and school reports, avoiding the use of jargon. Similarly, they spoke of the need for careful oral communication by teachers to parents at the end of the school day and at parents’ evenings. For those parents who do not have any or only limited experience of the education system in their country of origin, this would be of particular importance. Family learning teachers could liaise further with school staff to keep abreast of terms used in schools and then adapt these to suit low-level L2 parents, incorporating role plays, pragmatic features, and body language with the aim of building confidence for L2 parents in both language development and interactions in wider society.

Finally, perhaps one of the most significant areas to address is how illiterate parents are most effectively taught. Without previous formal experience in the classroom, language output would be extremely challenging in the second-language classroom, due to the student being unable to monitor their own learning and apply specific rules. One way to address this would be to collaborate with Somali trainee teachers to set up a mixed-programme, in which parents could practise speaking English but learn to read and write in Somali. This would take extensive long-term planning, and is an area which would need to be researched in considerable depth within a language acquisition framework. However, in the short-term there are many varying practical ideas which could be easily implemented, and which are outlined in Tables 1 and 2.

To summarise, the qualitative interview results demonstrated an inter-connected process in which Somali families, newly-arrived in the U.K., adapt to a new language, Western culture and way of negotiating relationships both inside the home with their children and outside the home with their children’s school. This experience has the potential to lead to conflict or cohesion on a continuum, which in turn requires careful adaptation and negotiation on the part of educational providers.

**Conclusion**

The study does not provide definitive answers, and it should be noted was small-scale and limited to Somali families. However, it is a provisional investigation into an area of intercultural conflict which could possibly be applied to other cultural groups if, as expected, the experience of the participants in this study is similar for other L2 parents, although care must be taken not to generalise. The implementations suggested from the study’s conclusions have the potential, particularly if extended, to lead to improved experiences for newly-arrived international families in the U.K. by improving the confidence and well-being of these groups, and improving the citizenship skills of parents with low-levels of previous education including essential knowledge of British laws as well as skills for work.

From a personal perspective, the research has been useful as a practitioner working with refugee families. It has deepened my own understanding of challenges many people face in the process of migration, and has inspired the incorporation of new aspects into courses with these families. Such measures include topical discussions as a means of building the confidence of parents, and including current news stories related to young people, which has facilitated discussion of different legislation. Also, I have encouraged Somali parents to set up their own autonomous projects, such as supporting other parents who have no literacy skills, in order for them to develop L1 skills in conjunction with learning the L2. Overall, the study has shown that a holistic approach is essential, taking into account the past and present conditions of diverse parents and challenges they may be experiencing both inside and outside the home. This would be best achieved through an inter-agency approach at the local level to better support diverse ethnic minority parents as well as schools. The research has highlighted some of the significant cultural and linguistic challenges and has
emphasised some practical implementations which could result in parents feeling less alienated from their children. This would hopefully, in turn, facilitate the parents’ own integration into the British education system and wider society.

Table 1

**Recommendations for schools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Share good practice between schools in terms of parental / community involvement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Encourage L2 parents to elect a representative to communicate with the school on behalf of different groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Provide space where possible for community groups / parental groups to meet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Use a software package on the school website which reads translations aloud in different L1s for illiterate parents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Incorporate a video or presentation on the school website relating to rules around safeguarding, with an oral translation made in each L1. If schools want this to be for parental-only viewing, they can have a locked area with password-access for parents on one part of their website.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Organise special induction days/evenings for parents from newly-arrived families to give detailed and directed support, such as explanation of expectations on the part of parents and children, as well as local community information, and procedures to deal with conflict issues. Use interpreters where possible in addition to school family support workers to ensure clarity in motives, explanations, and procedures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Encourage parents to attend a drop-in advice clinic once a month provided by school family support workers/community workers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Develop relationships with local mosques and community centres, such as through shared family events days.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2

**Recommendations for family learning / community ESOL provision**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Incorporate a safeguarding video/presentation for parents with oral translation in the L1 in all family learning / ESOL induction sessions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Family learning teachers to research local community support organisations for families in each area where classes are provided and then distribute these to parents, ideally in the L1 and L2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Include role-plays in classes based on real-life school situations such as parents’ evenings, asking for information at the school office, meeting child’s teachers at the beginning and end of the school day.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Adapt existing confidence-building sessions to suit low-level L2 parents, possibly using a Somali volunteer to assist in delivery. Incorporate body language customs and discussions around cultural pragmatic mismatches.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Incorporate topical news issues into classes relating to young people in order to encourage openness around legislation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Encourage culture sharing from all levels of parents in classes, such as drawing on Somali oral traditions of story-telling.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Provide differentiated classes for illiterate parents, focused on developing basic literacy skills first and encourage development of L1 literacy skills as a tool for empowerment.

- Sign-post L2 parents to other courses to encourage collaboration, such as directing illiterate parents to the ‘Talk English’ community programmes. Encourage volunteers from the accredited Volunteering, Community Interpreting and Teaching Assistant courses to support in community ESOL / family learning classes.

- Develop family learning provision for L2 parents and teenagers.

- Explore possibility of using an online forum for community practitioners to share good practice.

- Increase training for family learning teachers around FGM and other culturally-sensitive issues affecting newly-arrived families.

Total words: 4,528

**Acknowledgements**

I would like to thank all the interview participants and Dr Huw Bell (Manchester Metropolitan University) for supervising the research.
References


**Bio**

**Mary-Rose Puttick** has 12 years experience as a family literacy / ESOL practitioner. In September 2015 she completed an MA Applied Linguistics at Manchester Metropolitan University and in February 2016 started a PhD at Birmingham City University. Her research will focus on young Muslim mothers and the government’s Prevent strategy.

Email: maryroseputtick@gmail.com