

**Trumpet in Transition:
A History of the Trumpet and its Players in the United Kingdom
through the Music and Relationships of Sir Edward Elgar**

Paul Leonard Nevins

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of
Birmingham City University
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

March 2017

The Faculty of Arts, Design and Media, Birmingham City University
(Birmingham Conservatoire)

Contents

Abstract	X
Acknowledgements	XII

Volume 1

Introduction to the project	1
Methodologies	5
Structure of the thesis	7

The context to the study

Chapter One - Musical life in the United Kingdom during the Nineteenth Century	
Amateur music making	11
The growth of military music	15
The establishment of public concerts in the nineteenth century	17
The trumpets and cornets in general use during the later half of the nineteenth century	22
The leading trumpeters in the United Kingdom during Elgar's career	31
Conclusions	36
Chapter Two - The Hallé Orchestra during the career of Elgar	
The formation and rapid establishment of the Hallé Orchestra	38
Hallé Orchestra Season 1884/85	40
Works with demanding trumpet parts played by the Hallé Orchestra during Elgar's career	51

Hallé Orchestra Trumpet/Cornet section 1884-1934	55
Conclusions	58

The analysis of works by Elgar and his contemporaries

Chapter Three - Elgar's trumpet writing in compositions up to and including

1896	60
Elgar's early career	60
Elgar's compositions 1888-1894	62
Elgar's compositions of 1896 - a momentous year	65
Conclusions	75

Chapter Four - Elgar's compositions from 1897 78

Elgar's compositions from 1897 to 1900	79
The works scored for both trumpets and cornets	84
The final oratorios - <i>The Apostles</i> and <i>The Kingdom</i>	89
The symphonic works	93
The concertos for violin and for cello, and orchestral song cycles	96
Theatre music	97
Conclusions	100

Chapter Five - Compositions by a selection of composers from the United Kingdom who were contemporary with Elgar 103

The trumpet writing in compositions before 1890	104
The trumpet writing in works by Holst and Delius	108
The trumpet writing in works by two other younger contemporaries of Elgar	114

Conclusions	118
-------------	-----

Playing styles and performance practice during Elgar's career.

Chapter Six - Brass playing styles in Elgar's time	120
---	-----

Playing styles described in secondary sources	120
---	-----

Playing styles described and inferred from primary sources	124
--	-----

Brass playing styles identified in literature concerning early recordings	137
---	-----

The analysis of a selection of early recordings	139
---	-----

Conclusions	147
-------------	-----

Chapter Seven - Performances using instruments from the early twentieth

century	149
----------------	-----

Preparations for the recordings	154
---------------------------------	-----

Performing and recording using three historic instruments	163
---	-----

Comparisons between the instruments: are the statements of Harper Jnr. and Morrow corroborated?	176
--	-----

Conclusions	179
-------------	-----

Conclusions to the project and areas for further research	181
--	-----

Areas for further research	186
----------------------------	-----

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Composers whose music was performed by the Hallé Orchestra

1884/85 47

Table 2.2 The Trumpet/Cornet section of the Hallé Orchestra in chronological order

55

Bibliography 189

Scores Studied 205

Selected Discography 208

Web sites quoted 211

Volume 2

Appendices	213
1 The Harmonic Series	214
2 Notes Capable of Being Played on the Slide Trumpet from Harper Jnr. tutor-book	215
3 Keyed Bugle Fingering Chart from Harper Snr. tutor-book	216
4 Trumpeters listed in the programmes of first performances of Elgar's works	217
5 Trumpeters and cornettists in Worcestershire and Midlands orchestras	218
6 Selected list of trumpeters and cornettists working in the United Kingdom	221
7 Helmholtz system of pitch notation	222
8 Musical examples for Chapter Three	223
9 Selected Concert Programmes discussed in Chapter Three	227
10 Letter from August Manns to Elgar	230
11 Two letters from Walter Morrow to Elgar	232
12 Musical Examples for Chapter Four	236
13 Selected Concert Programmes discussed in Chapter Four	239
14 Musical Examples for Chapter Five	241
15 British Imperial to Metric Conversion Chart	244
16 Photographs of Historic Instruments used	245
17 Scores of the Music Performed and discussed in Chapter Seven	248
18 Extracts from an interview with Arthur Butterworth	288

CD Track listing

Track 1 – *Serenade* by Gounod performed by Sergeant Leggett on the cornet (1911).

Track 2 – *Cleopatra* by Damaré performed by Edwin Firth on the cornet (1914).

Track 3 – “Hallelujah” chorus from *Messiah* by Handel performed by the Royal Choral Society and the Royal Albert Hall Orchestra conducted by Malcolm Sargent (1926).

Track 4 – extract from the fourth movement of Symphony in E flat (Symphony No.2) by Elgar performed by the London Symphony Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1927).

Track 5 – extract from the first movement of Symphony in E flat (Symphony No.2) by Elgar performed by the London Symphony Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1927).

Track 6 – extract from the second movement of Symphony in E flat (Symphony No.2) by Elgar performed by the London Symphony Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1927).

Track 7 – 2nd extract from the first movement of Symphony in E flat (Symphony No.2) by Elgar performed by the London Symphony Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1927).

Track 8 – extract 1 from *Cockaigne* by Elgar performed by the BBC Symphony Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1933).

Track 9 – extract 1 from *Cockaigne* by Elgar performed by the Royal Albert Hall Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1926).

Track 10 – extract 2 from *Cockaigne* by Elgar performed by the BBC Symphony Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1933).

Track 11 – extract 2 from *Cockaigne* by Elgar performed by the Royal Albert Hall Orchestra conducted by Elgar (1926).

Track 12 – Ex.17.1: exercise No.1, page 1 from *Julius Kosleck's School For The Trumpet* adapted by Walter Morrow performed on the F trumpet.

Track 13 – Ex.17.2: exercise No.2, page 7 from *Julius Kosleck's School For The Trumpet* adapted by Walter Morrow performed on the F trumpet.

Track 14 – Ex.17.3: exercise No.7, page 10 from *Julius Kosleck's School For The Trumpet* adapted by Walter Morrow performed on the F trumpet.

Track 15 – Ex.17.4: exercise 14, page 14 from *Julius Kosleck's School For The Trumpet* adapted by Walter Morrow performed on the F trumpet and multi-track recorded.

Track 16 – Ex.17.5: excerpt from *The Light of Life* No.1 after rehearsal letter D performed on the F trumpet and multi-track recorded.

Track 17 – Ex.17.6: excerpt from *The Light of Life* No.1 after rehearsal letter H performed on the F trumpet with slurs and multi-track recorded.

Track 18 – Ex.17.6: excerpt from *The Light of Life* No.1 after rehearsal letter D performed on the F trumpet with no slurs and multi-track recorded.

Track 19 – Ex.17.7: excerpt from *The Light of Life* No.6 from the beginning performed on the F trumpet and multi-track recorded.

Track 20 – Ex.17.8: excerpt from the end of *The Light of Life* No.1 performed on the F trumpet and multi-track recorded.

Track 21 – Ex.17.9: excerpt from *The Dream of Gerontius* before rehearsal figure 55 performed on the F trumpet and multi-track recorded.

Track 22 – Ex.17.10: excerpt from *Enigma Variations* at rehearsal figure 14 performed on the F trumpet and multi-track recorded.

Track 23 – Ex.17.11: excerpt from *Legend* by Morgan performed on the F trumpet.

Track 24 – Ex.17.12: exercise No. 27 page 16 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the B flat trumpet.

Track 25 – Ex.17.13: excerpt from the second movement of Symphony in E flat (Symphony No.2) at rehearsal figure 67 performed on the B flat trumpet.

Track 26 – Ex.17.14: exercise No. 12 page 11 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the B flat trumpet.

Track 27 – Ex.17.15: exercise No. 13 page 12 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the B-flat trumpet.

Track 28 – Ex.17.16: exercise No. 14 page 12 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the B-flat trumpet.

Track 29 – Ex.17.17: exercise No. 20 page 14 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the-B flat trumpet.

Track 30 – Ex.17.18: excerpt from *Falstaff* before rehearsal figure 126 performed on the B-flat trumpet and multi-tracked recorded.

Track 31 – Ex.17.19: exercise No. 34, page 21 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the B-flat trumpet.

Track 32 – Ex.17.20: exercise No. 20, page 14 from *Otto Langey's Practical Tutor for the Cornet or Trumpet Revised and Enlarged* by Ernest Hall performed on the cornet.

Track 33 – Ex.17.21: excerpt from *Froissart* before rehearsal letter N performed on the cornet and multi-track recorded.

Track 34 – Ex.17.22: excerpt from *Cockaigne* from rehearsal figure 36 performed on the F trumpet and the cornet multi-track recorded.

Track 35 – Ex.17.23: excerpt from *Legend* by Morgan of the lyrical opening played on the cornet.

ABSTRACT

The life and career of Sir Edward Elgar (1857-1934) coincided with a period of significant change in the development of the trumpet and the music scored for it. A professional musician from the provinces, mostly self-taught, Elgar slowly gained recognition and ultimately international fame. In the United Kingdom for most of the nineteenth century the pre-eminence of the slide trumpet, which was not a fully chromatic instrument, made for a unique situation, leaving the ubiquitous cornet to fill the gap when a fully chromatic instrument was required. The valved trumpet, at first in the form of the large F trumpet, only gained a foothold in the last decades of the nineteenth century.

This thesis examines the development in the trumpet and cornet scoring of Elgar throughout his career and correlates this with the trumpeters he worked with both in the provinces and in London. This is set in the context of the instruments that were available to, and promoted by, these trumpeters. The analysis leads to an original theory of Elgar being both a reflector and a driver of change in the turbulent world of the trumpet. A review of the trumpet writing of composers contemporary with Elgar from the United Kingdom corroborates this theory.

The playing styles of Elgar's trumpeters are investigated, and the sonic and playing qualities of the instruments explored. These qualities are related to the advocacies of the leading trumpeters and commentators of the time, and are illustrated on the accompanying CD which contains contemporary exercises and excerpts performed by the author on historic instruments with original, or copies of, contemporary mouthpieces. This study, relating the music, circumstances of composition, performers involved and the instruments available presents significant new knowledge of the trumpet world in the late nineteenth

and early twentieth centuries. The conclusions challenge certain anecdotes that have been passed from generation to generation concerning trumpeters of Elgar's generation. I draw attention to evidence suggesting a hitherto little-researched continental influence.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I owe thanks to many people in the preparation of this thesis. Firstly, my supervisors Professor Peter Johnson and Professor Ronald Woodley for their patience, understanding and faith that this work would be completed.

I have visited many libraries in the process of my research and particular thanks are due to the staff of: Birmingham Conservatoire Library; the library of Keele University; the library of the Royal Academy of Music; the Hive, Worcester; the Library of Birmingham; the British Library and the Music Library of the Barber Institute, University of Birmingham.

I have greatly enjoyed visiting various archives and museums. I must thank in particular: Sue Fairchilds of the Elgar Birthplace Museum, Eleanor Roberts of the Hallé Orchestra, Dr. Bradley Strauchan-Scherer formerly of the Horniman Museum, Andy Lamb of the Bate Collection and Professor Arnold Myers, of the University of Edinburgh who also shared his research into the Boosey & Co. workshop records with me. Professor Myers afforded me the opportunity to present at the joint HBS and Galpin Society conference, and promptly answered any questions I asked, via e mail. I gratefully acknowledge the permission given by the Elgar Birthplace Museum to reproduce correspondence and concert programmes.

I would like to thank Matthew O'Malley and his team for their expertise in the recording of the CD that accompanies this thesis, and Joanne Sealey for accompanying me so sympathetically. Luke Priest provided extremely useful help with typesetting and other ICT issues.

The acquisition of historic instruments and mouthpieces was problematic and thanks must be offered to Jeremy Montague, the late John Webb and Crispian Steele-Perkins for their help in pointing me in the right direction to purchase these essential items.

In addition to Crispian, a number of other trumpeters have taken an interest in this project: John Dickinson, my teacher whilst at school, Michael Laird and Paul Benistone. The late Arthur Butterworth generously let me interview him and his memories of the trumpet world of the 1930s and 1940s were clear and vivid.

However, my greatest thanks must go to my wife, Jill, whose assistance with the final proofreading was invaluable. The period of this research coincided with many of life's ups and downs and Jill's insistence that this must be finished was the encouragement I needed to keep going.

Introduction to the Project

Throughout my forty-year career of playing and teaching the trumpet the practice of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century composers to write for trumpets pitched in many different keys has been a source of endless fascination. The only trumpet available to composers during the seventeenth, eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries was without valves; this instrument could only play the notes of the harmonic series¹ and was, therefore, pitched in the main key of the music, and used mostly to reinforce tonic and dominant harmonies. Numerous attempts were made to increase the number of notes the trumpet could play. A notable example was the invention of a keyed trumpet at the end of the eighteenth century, the instrument for which Haydn wrote his concerto in 1796 and Hummel his concerto in 1803. The keyed trumpet was made fully chromatic by the use of between three and five keys, depending on the individual instrument, which opened vent holes, as on a woodwind instrument. Kozeluch, Weigl, Fiala and Neukomm also wrote solo and chamber music works for the instrument in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries (Wallace & McGrattan 2011: 177/189/190). However, Crispian Steele-Perkins believes the instrument “was never accepted into the symphony orchestra because it lacked the penetrating ring of a true trumpet” (Steele-Perkins 2001: 46-47). An alternative solution to extending the chromatic range of the trumpet was through the use of an extending slide that lowered the notes of the harmonic series by a semitone and/or a tone, depending on the key of the instrument, but the instrument was not fully chromatic across its entire compass. However, the sound of the slide trumpet was not compromised by the opening of a vent hole. This instrument became fashionable from the late eighteenth century in the United Kingdom. A third method was to use valves which opened extra

¹ A diagram of the harmonic series for a trumpet pitched in C (eight feet in length) is included as Appendix 1.

lengths of tubing. Valves were developed from the early nineteenth mostly in continental Europe, enabling the trumpet to become a fully chromatic instrument, with a consistent sound quality that was easier to manage than the slide trumpet. However, the key of the valved trumpet was not standardised.

The transition from instruments pitched in various keys to the valved B-flat trumpet, the standard professional trumpet of today, has received only limited attention by researchers. Richard Birkemeir, in a series of articles written in the 1980s, recognised this, and states: “The overall lack of knowledge concerning the history of the nineteenth-century trumpet often results in questions regarding peculiarities found in the writing of certain nineteenth century composers” (Birkemeir 1985(1):23).

One such peculiarity can be seen in two large-scale compositions by the English composer Edward Elgar (1857-1934) first performed just weeks apart in 1896: *The Light of Life* was premiered in September, and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* in October. The former is scored for two trumpets pitched in four different keys, F, E flat, D and C in various movements. *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* is scored for three trumpets but pitched in B flat and A at various times. Elgar composed these two pieces in parallel during the spring and summer of 1896, erecting a bell tent in his garden so that he would suffer from less distraction (Hunt 1999: 41-2). The difference in the trumpet scoring in these two works was the inspiration for this project.

Elgar had composed a number of large-scale works prior to 1896. He was an experienced orchestral player and conductor, so knew what instruments were in use at the time. Why did he write for such differing trumpets in two pieces composed at the same time? To answer this question it was necessary to study these pieces in the context of Elgar’s total

output. However, this raised further questions, as both earlier and later works are scored for trumpets in different keys, and in a small number of works Elgar scores for the cornet in addition to, or instead of, the trumpet. Comparing Elgar's writing with that of his significant contemporaries in the United Kingdom provided evidence which further underlines the complexity of trumpet usage during Elgar's lifetime. To fully investigate these differences in scoring a number of further factors were taken into account. Who were the trumpeters with whom Elgar was working? What were the instruments available to these players? What music by other composers were they required to play on a daily basis? Was there a distinct playing style adopted by these trumpeters? There are many instruments from this period still in playable condition: what are they like to play? Finally, did the playing characteristics of the instruments have an effect on what was written for them?

A study of the trumpet scoring of Elgar, related to the trumpeters with whom he worked, the instruments they played, and the style in which they played, is an ideal case study because of both the chronological convergence of his output with this period in the development of the trumpet, and the practical aspects of the composer's working life. Elgar received little musical education and was self-taught as a composer. His daughter Carice gives some useful insights into Elgar's early life in his father's music shop in Worcester:

Here he was able to learn all about pianos and any other musical instruments which happened to be about, and all the music in stock; he was close to the Cathedral, where he could study the Church of England services. Meanwhile my grandfather had been appointed organist at the Roman Catholic church [*sic*], so of course my father was expected to blow the organ. But he not only blew, but learned to play it and to know the liturgy of the Catholic church [*sic*]. I would like to stress that this, with lessons on the violin with local teachers whom he soon outstripped in knowledge,

and a week's tuition with Adolf Pollitzer, was the only musical education as such that he received. (*Music and Musicians*, June 1957, cited in Redwood 1982: 165-166)

This lack of a formal musical education implies that Elgar was not carrying with him the ideas, and possible prejudices, of the musical establishment. From practical experience he knew at first hand the development of the trumpet during those years: performing as a violinist with the finest trumpeters of the day as well as local players; conducting amateur and professional orchestras and bands; attending concerts in the provinces, London, and Europe. His compositions were influenced by what he heard and read and not by formal training as a composer, and his trumpet writing appears to have been strongly influenced by what he heard and saw as a practising musician.

The compositions of Elgar make frequent and extensive use of the trumpet. His output of large-scale choral and symphonic works which span the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries have been little studied in relation to the trumpet parts, and to date these compositions have received limited interest from researchers in this trumpet-related field. Art Brownlow, who wrote an extensive study of the slide trumpet in the United Kingdom during the nineteenth century, makes only one reference concerning Elgar: "composers such as Strauss, Mahler, Debussy and Elgar began treating the trumpet like other melodic instruments" (Brownlow 1996: 151). Birkemeir looks in detail at the music of specific, and mostly German composers, and refers only once to the works of Elgar, writing: "*Enigma Variations* Op. 36 (1899) was scored for F trumpets and judging by the high degree of technical prowess demanded, was intended to be played with valves rather than a slide" (Birkemeir 1985(2): 18).

Methodologies

A number of methodologies have been used in this project. The secondary source material is limited, mostly comprising complete histories of the trumpet, and other accounts of the history of the trumpet tend to be anecdotal in content, as I shall demonstrate. A number of journal articles provide some starting points to aspects of this research. There are articles written during Elgar's career, in such publications as the *Proceedings of the Musical Association* and early editions of the *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, which are useful. However, as with many books written at that time, they are infused with the personal views of the authors and are limited in their objectivity. Consequently this project has been more reliant on primary source material found in archives and private collections, such as concert programmes, correspondence, newspaper and magazine articles, marketing material and other historical papers.

There has been little written concerning the trumpet writing of Elgar or other British composers of the period. Consequently it has been the analysis of the musical scores themselves that has been a crucial and integral part of this project. The characteristics of the trumpet and cornet writing in all Elgar's major compositions have been identified. A comparison of these is made with regard to both the instrument scored for, and the trumpeters who played in the respective first performances of each work, where possible.

The playing style of trumpeters during Elgar's career is an important strand of this thesis and the influence these styles may have had on contemporary composers is explored. Instrumental tutor-books of the day contain some explanations of playing style and with the analysis of some early recordings an insight has been gained into the performance practice of the time. Performance has been integral to this project to fully understand the

limitations experienced by trumpeters of Elgar's time, and the changes in both the instruments and performance practice during his career. As John Humphries argues:

The lack of recordings from earlier periods makes it very much more difficult to capture the unnotated essence of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century music today, so players who wish to give well-informed and historically aware performances need to be familiar with the history of the instrument itself, the equipment which was available or preferred in different times and places, player's techniques and musical style in general. (Humphries 2000:1)

The attached CD contains recordings of my attempts to perform exercises from the leading tutor-books of the period, extracts from orchestral works by Elgar and a solo work of the period, on the designated instruments. Performing on historic² instruments, with contemporary mouthpieces or copies of contemporary mouthpieces, has identified the playing characteristics of these instruments, which informs and illustrates this thesis.

These three strands of historical research, analysis, and performance practice provide some answers to the questions outlined above. Furthermore, the case study of a composer and the players with whom he worked gives an insight into the turbulent world of the trumpet at a time of great technological, social and artistic change.

The transition to the almost universal use of the B-flat trumpet beginning at the end of the nineteenth century but only complete after World War 1 was multifaceted. This thesis does not explore the subject in its entirety, and is self-limiting by the use of the works and career

² The words 'historic' and 'historical' are used as defined by Trevor Herbert: "An 'historic' instrument is a surviving specimen of an old form of instrument. An 'historical' instrument is a modern instrument that is copied from or inspired by an older model." (Herbert 2001: 131).

of Elgar as the skeleton upon which the flesh is attached.

The Music Hall was a popular form of entertainment during Elgar's career and would have been an important source of income for musicians. In his early career he did take part in entertainments at the Worcester Glee Club, and together with friends performed at other social functions, but his compositional ambitions were aimed at more serious and substantial works. However, Elgar did compose some incidental music to accompany theatrical productions in the latter part of his career, and the trumpet writing in these works is considered with that of his major compositions.

One more general aspect of trumpet playing in the early twentieth century was the influence of jazz styles which emerged from the United States of America. Elgar visited that country four times after he had achieved international recognition in the early twentieth century. His compositional style was well established by this time, and there is no evidence that he was influenced by the emerging musical style of jazz. The influence of jazz may have been an important factor in the history of the trumpet in the United Kingdom after World War 1 but I regarded this as beyond the scope of this study.

Structure of the thesis

The thesis divides into three parts, after this introduction, and finishes with a concluding section which also identifies areas for future research and discussion.

Part 1: The context to the study

Chapter One provides a description of the changes in the musical life in Britain during this period and relates these to Elgar's career as a professional musician. The trumpets and cornets that were available during the later nineteenth century are described, and the leading trumpeters of the period identified.

Chapter Two is a case study of the Hallé Orchestra during Elgar's career. The Hallé was established in the year after Elgar's birth and performed a twenty-week season of concerts every year during Elgar's life. The daily workload of the orchestra in a season during the 1880s, the first decade of Elgar's career, is analysed and set into the context of the instruments available at the time. The trumpeters of the Hallé are catalogued and the backgrounds of some of the principal players are explored.

Part 2: The analysis of works by Elgar and his contemporaries

Chapter Three analyses the trumpet writing of Elgar up to and including the compositions of 1896. Particular attention is given to the relationship of the writing in *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* with his previous compositions, including the early arrangements for the Powick Asylum Band and his first two major works, *Froissart* and *The Black Knight*. The development of Elgar's trumpet writing, particularly the stark contrast between the two works of 1896, is then related to the trumpeters with whom he worked at that time.

Chapter Four concerns the trumpet writing in the compositions of Elgar from 1897 to the end of his career. The cantata *Caractacus* (1898) displays further development in Elgar's

writing for the trumpet which continues in both the *Variations on an Original Theme* (1899) (later known as the *Enigma Variations*) and the oratorio *The Dream of Gerontius* (1900). In works written in 1901 Elgar scored for both trumpets and cornets but returns to writing for trumpets only from 1903, in *The Apostles*. There is some variation in the key/pitch of the trumpet for which Elgar scores, and the developments in his trumpet writing are explored with reference to the major works, the lesser-known works, and the music to accompany theatrical productions. The theme of relating Elgar's writing to the players of the day is further developed in this chapter.

Chapter Five synthesises the data obtained in the previous chapters regarding Elgar's trumpet writing and compares this to the trumpet writing of other composers from the United Kingdom, including composers who were born before him, his exact contemporaries, and some of those who were born after him who achieved recognition during his lifetime.

Part 3: Playing styles and performance practice during Elgar's career.

Chapter Six addresses the development in trumpet playing styles during Elgar's career. The evidence advanced in the available literature concerning both the trumpet and early recordings is compared with evidence gathered from primary sources, namely tutor-books by leading contemporary trumpeters and a selection of early recordings.

Chapter Seven begins with an evaluation of some previous research into the playing characteristics of brass instruments in general, and the F trumpet in particular. It continues by describing the three historic instruments and mouthpieces used in the performance element of this project. The playing characteristics of each instrument are identified and

demonstrated in the performance of exercises from the contemporary tutor-books described in the previous chapter, orchestral excerpts and extracts from a solo work. In addition, these characteristics are related to the trumpet and cornet writing in the compositions of Elgar and are demonstrated with multitrack recordings of the excerpts. Discussion of these performed exercises, excerpts and extracts, regarding the way the instruments play, their relative qualities and what effect these qualities have on contemporaneous playing styles, adds a further dimension to this research.

Conclusions

The final conclusions section draws together the strands of research, reviews the evidence presented, and identifies potential areas for further research.

The CD

The contents of the CD supports the arguments advanced in Chapters Six and Seven. The first eleven tracks are copies of and extracts from the early recordings discussed in Chapter Six. This is followed by twenty-four tracks of performances on three historic instruments supporting the discussions in Chapter Seven.

Chapter One

Musical life in the United Kingdom during the Nineteenth Century

The introductory chapter identified the need for this project. It outlined the reasons why the analysis of the music and life of Sir Edward Elgar is an ideal case study to illustrate the significant changes that occurred within the trumpet world of the United Kingdom, at the end of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries.

This chapter provides the background and context for the detailed study of Elgar's trumpet writing in the following chapters. The musical life of the United Kingdom is described with particular reference to Elgar and what he experienced musically. Amateur music making as well as professional, military bands, brass bands and choirs were all part of Elgar's career at one time or another. Following on from this is a description of the trumpets that were in general use during Elgar's career. Finally, the chapter details the leading trumpeters of the time, specifically those who worked with Elgar.

Amateur music making

This section provides an overview of the growing opportunities to make music during the nineteenth century, with particular reference to Stoke-on-Trent, as an example, an area of the Midlands where Elgar would achieve success at the end of the century. The formalisation of music education was required to enable the public to participate in these music-making opportunities and this is discussed in terms of both choral and instrumental activities.

The growth of choral singing

The changes that occurred in everyday life in the nineteenth century had a great effect on the musical life of the United Kingdom, and encompassed amateur as well as professional music making. Amateur music making flourished in the nineteenth century: the formation of choral societies, amateur operatic societies, diocesan choral festivals and brass bands all added to the opportunities available to amateur musicians. It is interesting to note that these are all group activities and this coming together of people was undoubtedly due to the increasing urbanisation of the population. Reginald Nettel, writing in 1944 about musical life in Stoke-on-Trent,³ sums this up:

The influx of workers during the nineteenth century to the new industrial towns from the old rural areas meant that they entered the century a nation of folk singers but their descendants emerged from it a nation of choirsingers. (Nettel 1944: 1)

and

every large industrial centre had its own musical life from middle of nineteenth century. (Nettel 1944: 116)

The first few performances of oratorio in Stoke-on-Trent were given in the 1840s but some singers had to be imported from Birmingham to make up sufficient numbers (Nettel 1944: 5). However, the development of choral singing in the area was rapid both in quantity and quality. The first performance of Elgar's *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* was given at

³ The borough of Stoke-on-Trent was formed in 1910 with the coming together of six towns, Stoke-upon-Trent, Hanley, Longton, Fenton, Tunstall and Burslem. The borough was granted city status in 1925.

the Victoria Hall, Hanley⁴ in 1896, and other composers who later conducted their own large-scale choral works there included Delius performing *Appalachia* in 1908 (Nettel 1945: 65).

Music education in the nineteenth century

The music education Elgar received was outlined in the Introduction. This section describes what was generally available to the working and lower middle classes from which he emerged. Education, in general, became more formal during the latter half of the nineteenth century, particularly with the passing of the 1870 Education Act, the first piece of legislation concerning the provision of education in England and Wales. However, music education was to be found both inside and outside school.

Whilst everyone can sing on their own, to sing together requires a more disciplined approach, and the ability to read notation is required to perform long and complex works. The answer to this problem was found in tonic sol-fa. It is a method of reading pitches without the complexity of staff notation, and was immensely successful. Developed during the nineteenth century by John Curwen (1816-1880), a Congregationalist minister, from the sol-fa invented by Sarah Ann Glover (1785-1867) of Norwich, it is described by Nettel as the music education system for the masses (Nettel 1944: 8-9), and he goes further, stating “it was estimated that in 1891 two million children were learning to sing by the tonic sol-fa method” (Nettel 1944: 14).

⁴ Hanley, as one of the towns that make up Stoke-on-Trent, is regarded as the city centre for shopping and culture.

Opportunities for young people to become competent instrumentalists evidently depended both on their chosen instrument and their social position. Percy Young believes apprenticeships for organists “strengthened” during the nineteenth century (Young 1967: 502). For example, Charles Swinnerton Heap, the organist and choirmaster to whom Elgar dedicated *The Light of Life*, enjoyed the privilege of an apprenticeship at York Minister, followed by a Mendelssohn Scholarship at Leipzig Conservatoire and finally became a pupil of W. T. Best in Liverpool (Nettel 1944: 32-33). As we have seen Elgar’s early musical training was far more humble.

The music conservatoires in Britain were all founded in the nineteenth century. The Royal Academy of Music was the first, formed in 1822. However, it was unlike the institution that became famous in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries. Percy Young describes it as, “half charity school” and “until 1853 was a 10-15 co-educational boarding-school” (Young 1967: 436/495). The National School of Music was a short-lived venture in the 1870s but did spawn the Royal College of Music which was founded in 1883. Trinity College of Music was founded in 1875 and the Guildhall School of Music and Drama in 1887. All of these institutions, it needs to be emphasised, were located in London.

In the provinces a music college was founded in Manchester in 1893 at the instigation of Sir Charles Hallé, and the Midland Institute⁵ (which provided courses in Science, Literature and the Arts) in Birmingham in 1854. However, all of these institutions provided very limited opportunities for players of wind instruments. For example, at the Royal Academy of Music in 1865 no student was studying a wind instrument as first study (Herbert & Barlow 2013: 147).

⁵ Midland Institute was later renamed the Birmingham School of Music and is now known as the Royal Birmingham Conservatoire, part of Birmingham City University.

The growth of military music

The most important institution for the training of wind players in the late nineteenth century was the Royal Military School of Music at Kneller Hall in the London suburbs, described by Cyril Ehrlich as “the most successful of the nineteenth-century British music colleges” (Ehrlich 1985: 97). This was founded in 1857 (the year of Elgar’s birth) following a report written by the Duke of Cambridge the previous year, concerning the state of military music at the time. This report estimated that there were 9000 military musicians and found the training of these musicians varied from band to band. Consequently from the outset a structured curriculum was followed at Kneller Hall, which included the learning of more than one instrument (Herbert & Barlow 2013: 65/84).

The extensive research by Trevor Herbert and Helen Barlow found that the formation of bands of music in the military from the late eighteenth century to 1857 had involved the most celebrated players of the day, but also included regular soldiers being trained to play instruments, and even boys from the workhouse being trained as musicians. Furthermore, concerning the period up to the 1840s they state:

the military was the principal producer of expert wind instrumentalists ... The trumpeter Thomas Harper, who became trumpet professor at the Royal Academy of Music, was a product of the Royal East India Volunteers Band. (Herbert & Barlow 2013: 59)⁶

⁶ Thomas Harper (1786-1853), like Elgar, was born in Worcester. Elgar performed with his son, Thomas Harper Jnr., also a trumpeter, when both were members of the orchestra for the Three Choirs Festival in the 1870s and 1880s.

Music in the military had an increasing effect on professional music making during the nineteenth century and was sometimes seen as a threat to the status quo. Military musicians posed a threat to professional instrumentalists, not only by their expertise but also by their willingness to perform for less remuneration, as the fees for these performances was in addition to their military pay. The newly-formed Amalgamated Musician's Union was compelled to intervene. For example, Joe Williams, leader of the AMU, wrote to the Commanding Officer of Salford Barracks in 1894 to complain about four cornet players from his barracks performing with the Carl Rosa Opera Company, in Manchester's Prince's Theatre, for substantially less than professional musicians would be paid (Williamson & Cloonan 2016: 46). Amateur performers were seen as less of a threat because of their limited abilities.

There are many examples of a military bandsman beginning a family tradition of membership of the music profession. The family history of arguably the United Kingdom's finest horn player, Dennis Brain (1921-1957), shows the influence of the military, as his grandfather Alfred Edwin Brain (1860-1920) was a military bandsman who later played in London orchestras. His father Aubrey Brain (1893-1955) was also a celebrated horn player and teacher (Herbert & Barlow 2013: 74).

The various bands and choral organisations described above not only provided opportunities to take part in music making but also opportunities for the general public to hear music. In addition, they provided professional musicians with another opportunity to earn their living by performing with, and coaching, these groups.

The coaching and conducting of amateur music makers was a major part of the early career of Elgar. As a boy he had accompanied his father to the Worcester Glee Club, but

his first position in leading an amateur group was in the summer of 1877 when he was appointed as “Leader and Instructor” of the Amateur Musical Society in Worcester. Elgar was an immediate success in this role and after a few months in post the members presented him with a new violin bow accompanied by a glowing address (Moore 1984: 76). In January 1879 Elgar was appointed Musical Director of the Powick Lunatic Asylum Band. The band was made up of staff members and on appointment consisted of flute, clarinet, two cornets, euphonium, bombardon, violins 1 and 2, bass and piano. The post was for one day a week and included instrumental instruction, conducting, composing and arranging music for the patients’ Friday dances (Moore 1984: 82). Jerrold Northrop Moore states: “Edward cultivated his band at Powick … It challenged him … to find every possibility in every instrument at his command” (Moore 1984: 87).

The establishment of public concerts in the nineteenth century

The previous section examined the growing opportunities for participation in musical activities. Alongside this expansion in active music making there was also a growing demand for opportunities to listen to music.

After the industrial revolution of the eighteenth century the middle class increased greatly in size and, in addition to the aristocracy, they also desired entertainment. To satisfy this demand concert-giving societies were formed. For example, the Gentlemen’s Concerts in Manchester began at least as early as 1745 (Fuller Maitland 1906 [1922], III: 36-37) and in London, The Philharmonic Society was inaugurated in 1813 (Young 1967: 424). Amongst the many concerts given in London, those organised at Crystal Palace were an important influence on Elgar when he was a young man. In a speech given in 1927 Elgar describes attending these concerts:

I rose at six - walked a mile to the railway station; the train left at seven; arrived at Paddington about eleven; - underground to Victoria; on to the Palace [Crystal Palace] arriving in time for the last three quarters of an hour of the rehearsal; if fortune smiled this piece of rehearsal included the work desired to be heard; but fortune rarely smiled and more often than not the principal item was over. Lunch, - Concert at three; - at five a rush for the train to Victoria; then to Paddington; - on to Worcester arriving at ten-thirty. A strenuous day indeed; but the new work had been heard and another treasure added to a life's experience. (Reported in Kelly 2013: 24)

August Manns became conductor of the Crystal Palace concerts in 1885. He expanded the Military Band that gave the concerts into an orchestra (Young 1967: 482-484), and later included some of Elgar's works in his concerts. This expansion of a band into an orchestra also occurred at the New Brighton Pier Concerts when, in 1898, Granville Bantock took over the conductorship (Kelly 2013: 51). However, military band concerts, particularly outdoors, remained an extremely popular form of concert-going, available to all.

In Liverpool and Manchester (both cities where Elgar would later achieve success) orchestras were formed that have existed continuously to this day. The Liverpool Philharmonic Society was formed on 10 January 1840 and gave four concerts in their first season (Henley & McKernan 2009: 17). The orchestra was a mixture of amateur and professional musicians until 1853 when it became fully professional. The Hallé Orchestra is also one of Britain's oldest professional orchestras, having been formed in 1858, in Manchester, by the German Charles Hallé. During the latter half of the nineteenth century

many players were shared between the orchestras of Liverpool and Manchester. For example, the trumpeters listed in the orchestra for the concert in Liverpool on 18 November 1879 were “Herr Jaeger” and “Mr Scotts” who are also listed as the trumpeters in the Hallé Orchestra at that time.⁷

With the advent of better transport systems in the nineteenth century, touring theatrical and opera companies were formed. Musical life, according to Simon Bradley, was “transformed” by the railways (Bradley 2015: 99). Companies could take their personnel, props and staging from town to town by rail, with special trains sometimes engaged to move companies on Sundays when theatres were closed (Bradley 2015: 98).⁸ Touring companies, such as the Carl Rosa Company, which gave its first performance in Manchester on 1 September 1873 (Young 1967: 503), not only provided opportunities for the general public to hear opera, but they also disseminated musical skills across the country by their members giving private lessons. Nettel notes how musicians from Stoke-on-Trent took lessons from members of the Carl Rosa Opera Orchestra when they were performing locally, and later became professional players themselves in Manchester and Birmingham (Nettel 1944: 14).

The expansion of provincial music festivals

Arguably the most significant musical events in Elgar’s career, as both a performer and a composer, were the provincial music festivals. By the accident of being born in Worcester Elgar was geographically close to two significant music festivals, the Three Choirs Festival

⁷ An analysis of the work of the Hallé Orchestra is undertaken in the next chapter.

⁸ Bradley gives a comprehensive account of the changes to all aspects of life in Britain during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries that were made possible by the invention and expansion of the railways (Bradley 2015).

and the Birmingham Triennial Festival. Music festivals of this kind originated in the eighteenth century and were held across the country; Young comments that music festivals “abounded” during the 1820s and 30s (Young 1967: 430). These festivals were based around a choir assembled from both local singers and those from further afield. Pippa Drummond, in her study of these festivals (Drummond 2011), states:

at the height of the festival movement there were more than 100 towns and cities in England which promoted music festivals. (Drummond 2011: 3)

and concerning their importance locally:

represent the high point of a town’s social and cultural calendar. (Drummond 2011: 191)

The Three Choirs Festival may have begun before 1724 but it was held annually from that year (Husk 1906 [1922], V: 97). The name is taken from the coming together of the choirs from Gloucester, Hereford and Worcester Cathedrals, and by the time Elgar first played as a member of the second violin section, in 1878, it had grown to be four days long and gave the public the opportunity to hear music professionally performed. Young comments that the Three Choirs Festival provided “a reasonable barometer of English average taste” (Young 1967: 558). Musicians of international renown performed at the festival. For example, Dvořák conducted his *Stabat Mater* at the Worcester Festival of 1884, with Elgar a member of the first violin section on that occasion.

The first Birmingham Music Festival was in 1768 (Sutcliffe Smith 1944: 10) and was held intermittently until 1834, after which it occurred triennially until the early twentieth century,

its venue being the Town Hall. The festival attracted such international musicians as Mendelssohn, who conducted the first performance of his oratorio *Elijah* at the festival of 1846.

Two other music festivals were to become important in Elgar's career, the North Staffordshire Music Festival and the Leeds Triennial Music Festival. The developing musical life of Stoke-on-Trent has already been outlined, and the North Staffordshire Music Festival began much later than either the Birmingham or Three Choirs Festivals. The first festival was held in 1888, with four subsequent festivals occurring within the nineteenth century. The Leeds Festival was first held in 1858 but there was then a gap of sixteen years until 1874 before its next meeting, after which it was held triennially into the twentieth century.

Music festivals remained popular across the country throughout the nineteenth century and relatively small towns proudly held their festivals along the lines of the large city festivals. An example from the last decade of the century is the annual music festival held in Bridlington, a small fishing port on the east coast of Yorkshire. Catherine Dale describes how the festival was held from 1894 to 1901 and again in 1903.⁹ It was a grand affair for a town with a population of about 16,000. The chorus ranged from 147 at the first festival to a maximum of 201 in 1900 and the orchestra from 58 in 1894 to 69 in 1900. The first Yorkshire performance of Elgar's *The Black Knight* was given at the Festival in 1899 (Dale 2007: 337).

To summarise: the musical world Elgar was born into was growing. The increasing urbanisation of the population created an environment where mass music making,

⁹ Dale surmises that 1902 was missed because the main driver of the festival, Sir Alexander Bosville, was High Sheriff of the county that year and did not have the time to devote to an event (Dale 2007: 349-350).

particularly choral, could flourish. Although Elgar was born in the provinces the musical world of the nineteenth century was not all capital city-orientated; Worcester and the surrounding area provided many opportunities to make music and hear music performed at the highest level.

The trumpets and cornets in general use during the latter half of the nineteenth century

This thesis concerns the history of the trumpet during the career of Elgar. The introduction gave a brief outline of the turbulent world of the trumpet at the end of the nineteenth century and beginning of the twentieth century. This section looks briefly at the trumpet before Elgar's birth, describes the trumpets that were in use during his career, and finally considers the organological developments that changed the instrument both in capabilities and appearance.¹⁰

The trumpet, in its various forms and functions, has an ancient pedigree, which it is not necessary to outline here.¹¹ By the sixteenth century it had evolved into a tube with two 180-degree bends, as illustrated by Sebastian Virdung in 1511 (reproduced in Tarr 1988: 61). One end was slightly flared (the bell) and the other open to receive the mouthpiece, which channelled the vibrating air column, instigated by an initial impetus from the player's lips, into the instrument. The bore of the trumpet was mostly cylindrical. An instrument 8 feet in length would produce the note C (as would an organ pipe of the same length). In addition, the notes of the harmonic series could also be obtained (for a diagram of the

¹⁰ Detailed descriptions of three specific instruments used in the recording of the CD that accompanies this thesis, an F trumpet, a B-flat trumpet and a B-flat cornet, are included in Chapter Seven.

¹¹ Tarr provides a detailed history of the trumpet from ancient times in his book *The Trumpet* (1988).

harmonic series please refer to Appendix 1). This instrument has come to be known as the natural trumpet due to the absence of any mechanisation.

Later eighteenth-century commentators sometimes remarked on the inherent limitations of the natural trumpet. For example, Charles Burney writes of “the natural imperfection of the instrument’ due to the difficulty of tuning the ‘fourth and sixth of the key … no player can make them perfect” (quoted in Brownlow 1996: 1). The context of this critique is the rendition of “The Trumpet shall sound” during a performance of Handel’s *Messiah* in Westminster Abbey on 29 May 1784,¹² although Burney applies his criticism to both trumpets and French horns.

The problem of tuning the fourth and sixth degrees of the scale may in fact have been the reason for the invention of the slide trumpet. John Hyde claims this invention for himself (Hyde 1799: 51 quoted in Brownlow 1996: 35),¹³ and this is confirmed by William Parker, in whose memoirs the 1784 performance of *Messiah* is again discussed. Parker comments that:

The imperfect note on the fourth of the key on the trumpet has since been rendered perfect by Mr Hydes’ [sic] ingenious invention of a slide. (Quoted in Brownlow 1996: 36)

¹² The trumpeter performing the trumpet solo was James Sarjant (Brownlow 1996: 1).

¹³ Brownlow believes that the “gradual adoption of equal temperament during the last half of the eighteenth century” was a possible reason for these “out of tune” notes to be so prominent, since trumpeters were unable to bend the notes sufficiently using only their lips (Brownlow 1996: 16). However, Ross Duffin has shown that the evolution of different kinds of temperament occurred from the fifteenth to the twentieth centuries and equal temperament was not fully adopted until 1917 (Duffin 2007: 138).

The Slide Trumpet

The shape of the slide trumpet is similar to the natural trumpet and many of the early instruments were conversions from a natural trumpet. It has two bows and, unlike the trombone, the slide is attached to the backbow, extending backwards past the performer's ear. By extending the slide to lower the pitch when playing the fourth and sixth harmonics the problem highlighted by Burney is solved.

The shortest crook supplied with the instrument produces a trumpet pitched in F,¹⁴ so that the overall length of the tubing is 6 feet. In this key the slide can also be used to lower the pitch of the instrument by either one or two semitones when half-extended or fully-extended respectively. Additional crooks were usually supplied to lower the key of the instrument to E, E flat, D, D flat, C and, when used in combination, even lower to B flat and A.¹⁵ However, this reduces the ability of the slide to lower the pitch, progressively, to just a semitone in the lowest keys. Even in the highest key of F the slide trumpet was not fully chromatic except in the highest register where the intervals of the harmonic series are less than a minor third apart.

The slide trumpet remained in use to the end of the nineteenth century in the United Kingdom and the last one to be made by the instrument makers Boosey & Co. was in 1913.¹⁶ Ebenezer Prout, who re-orchestrated Handel's *Messiah* in the late nineteenth century, was an advocate of the slide trumpet, describing it as "the best, as regards purity

¹⁴ A crook is a short additional length of tubing inserted between the mouthpiece and the main body of tubing to complete the instrument.

¹⁵ The overall length of the slide trumpet when crooked in B flat, which would require both the C and D crook to be employed together, would be 9 feet.

¹⁶ I am grateful to Professor Arnold Myers for sharing the fruits of his extensive research into the workshop records of Boosey & Co.

of intonation and quality of tone”, and comments further that “the slide trumpet … is peculiar to this country, and is unfortunately falling into disuse even here” (Prout 1898: 203). Thomas Harper Jnr. wrote a tutor-book for the slide trumpet which was published in 1875 and is discussed in Chapter Six (a diagram of the notes that can be played on the slide trumpet, taken from this tutor-book, can be found in Appendix 2). However, in other European countries the long-lasting supremacy of the slide trumpet, over other types of trumpet, was not established, with both keyed and valved instruments being considered superior.

The Keyed Trumpet and the Keyed Bugle

As was stated in Chapter 1 the keyed trumpet was the instrument for which Joseph Haydn wrote his Concerto in E flat major, in 1796. The first performance was given by Anton Weidinger four years later, in Vienna. In 1803 Hummel also composed a concerto for a similar instrument, pitched in E, and this was first performed on New Year’s Day 1804, also by Weidinger. There is little evidence that the instrument was widely used in the United Kingdom and Hipkins states that “the keyed trumpet soon died out” (Hipkins 1906 [1922] II: 556). However, the keyed bugle, an instrument that uses the same mechanical principle as the keyed trumpet, keys opening vent holes, but is otherwise unrelated, did gain widespread use in the United Kingdom, particularly in the theatre and in wind bands. For example, Henry Bishop directs the first trumpet to change to a keyed bugle in the overture to his opera *The Miller and his Men* (1813) (Steele-Perkins 2001: 49-50). This instrument had a wide conical bore and was first patented in the United Kingdom in 1810. The instrument was twice wound, like a military bugle, and initially had five keys enabling a chromatic scale to be played. The keyed bugle was a shorter instrument overall than the slide trumpet, being 4 feet 6 inches in length when crooked in B flat - that is, half the length

of the slide trumpet when pitched in the same key. Crooks were used to change the fundamental key of the instrument, as with the slide trumpet.

Ralph Dudgeon believes English professional trumpeters doubled on the keyed bugle during the first decades of the nineteenth century (Dudgeon 1997: 136). This was a necessity, as composers, such as Henry Bishop, were writing especially for this instrument as outlined above. The writing for the keyed bugle is melodic in nature and some analysis of this has been undertaken by Brownlow (Brownlow 1996:100-104). A section in the tutor-book (*Instructions / for / the Trumpet / with the use of the Chromatic Slide, / also the / Russian Valve Trumpet, / the small Cornet à Pistons or Small Stop Trumpet, / and the / Keyed Bugle ...*) by Thomas Harper Snr.(1786-1853), published in 1835, is devoted to this instrument.

The instrument Harper Snr. wrote about has seven keys and is chromatic from *a* to *b flat*" just over two octaves higher.¹⁷ Harper's instructions include a fingering chart (see Appendix 3) which uses the four fingers and the thumb of the right hand and one finger and a thumb of the left hand, and gives twelve one-octave scales, both major and minor, and eight pages of exercises and pieces. This instrument did provide trumpeters with a means to play melodically and chromatically. It was adopted across Europe, with composers such as Rossini scoring for the instrument in *Semiramide* (1823). Steele-Perkins believes the keyed bugle was a requisite for trumpeters working in the theatre until about 1850 (Steele-Perkins 2001: 50). The instrument was also widely used in military bands and it is highly likely that Elgar would have been familiar with it.

¹⁷ All pitches in this thesis are given in concert pitch, to aid clarity, as many instruments in different keys were scored for by Elgar and his contemporaries, and the Helmholtz system of pitch notation is used throughout: see Appendix 7.

The development of the valve

The use of crooks has been described earlier with regard to both the slide trumpet and the keyed bugle. The invention of the valve also provided a means of adding short pieces of tubing to the overall length of the instrument. The valve was the answer to the problem of how to make the trumpet fully chromatic. Arnold Myers describes the valve as “a mechanical device having the effect of an instantaneous crook change” (Myers 1997(2): 121), and “the most important innovation for brass instruments in this period was the invention and adoption of the valve” (Myers 1997(2): 120).

The invention of the valve occurred in various places at around the same time, 1814 to 1833, which led to variations of the mechanism. By the start of Elgar’s musical career these mechanisms could be divided into two: rotary and piston. As their names imply, a rotary valve turns to open up the additional tubing whereas the piston has a vertical motion to achieve the same. The piston valve mechanism that is the norm in the twenty-first century was invented by Périnet in Paris and patented in 1839 (Myers 1997(2): 122). Rotary-valved instruments were mostly made by German manufacturers and rotary-valved trumpets are widely used in Central Europe today and increasingly in other parts of the world, particularly for the performance of German music. However, in the United Kingdom the valve was used firstly on other brass instruments rather than the trumpet, and it led to some new instruments being developed, most notably, for the purposes of this study, the cornet.

The Cornet

The cornet has a bore that is mostly conical in shape and is most often crooked in B flat, although additional crooks are normally supplied to change the key to A, A flat and G. The overall length of the tubing when in B flat is 4 feet 6 inches – also the main key of the keyed bugle. It is a compact instrument with more bows in the tubing than the trumpet. The cornet has a fully chromatic range of approximately two-and-a-half octaves. The actual form of the instrument did go through a short period of metamorphosis, but by the 1840s the design became standardised. The cornet was an immediate success. Myers has related the growth in brass playing to the increasing mechanisation of production, leading to the mass production of instruments at a price that was more affordable to people lower down the income scale (Myers 1997(2): 115). Many thousands of cornets were made during the nineteenth century.

The Valved Trumpet

In the United Kingdom the trumpet in use when the valve was invented was the slide trumpet. It would seem logical that the first trumpets to be equipped with valves should be crooked at the same pitch, six-foot F, with the valves merely replacing the slide. These instruments were provided with additional crooks to lower the overall pitch; these, however, were really superfluous since the instrument was fully chromatic, as will be discussed in Chapter Three. The first year of surviving Boosey & Co. workshop records was 1876, with nineteen F trumpets made that year, nineteen more the following year, and eighteen in 1878 (author's research in to the Boosey & Co. workshop records held at the Horniman Museum, London). Production continued during the nineteenth century but

diminished considerably in the early twentieth century. The final F trumpet was manufactured by Boosey & Co. in 1926.¹⁸

The change to the shorter instrument pitched in B flat did not occur until the early twentieth century. The first record of a B-flat trumpet (serial number 23875) being produced by Boosey & Co. was in November 1879, with a further instrument (serial number 27093) made in December 1882 and two more produced in July 1886. Limited production continued for the rest of the century, and even in 1910 Boosey & Co. produced only nineteen B-flat trumpets in a variety of models. After WW1 the B-flat trumpet was manufactured with an additional rotary valve to change the overall pitch of the instrument to A, and the use of crooks became redundant. However, crooks were supplied with cornets even after WW2. It is significant to note that the Boosey & Co. workshop records indicate that the trumpet was a much rarer instrument than the cornet. For example, in 1876 only nineteen F trumpets were made by Boosey, but hundreds of cornets were produced that year. Overall the production by Boosey & Co. of the slide trumpet, the valved trumpet pitched in F, and the B-flat trumpet was very limited during the last quarter of the nineteenth century. The main rival to Boosey & Co. was Besson (Myers & Eldredge 2006: 48) but their workshop records are less complete than Boosey's. Eight stock books have survived but these do not detail any production of trumpets, flugel horns, baritones, tenor horns or French horns. However, four of the extant stock books record the production of cornets between 1868 and 1891 (Myers & Eldredge 2006: 44). The Besson records also show that the cornet was manufactured in large numbers: for example, in 1890, 1084 cornets were produced out of a total of 3032 instruments recorded in the extant stock books (Myers & Eldredge 2006: 46). Myers & Eldredge state that after a visit to the Besson factory in 1893 Algeron Rose reported that Besson made 100 instruments

¹⁸ I am again grateful to Professor Arnold Myers for sharing his research details with me.

per week. Assuming the levels of production were similar in 1890 and 1893, a fifth of all the instruments made by Besson were cornets. There were other makers active during these years across the country, but their workshop records have not survived. However, it is a fair assumption that their balance of output between trumpets and cornets would have been similar to those of Boosey & Co and Besson.

The change to a physically smaller, higher pitched trumpet did not stop at the manufacture of the B-flat trumpet. During Elgar's career higher pitched trumpets in C and D were made, and Elgar wrote for these instruments in a limited number of works, which will be discussed in Chapters Three and Four. According to their workshop records Boosey & Co. did not manufacture a C trumpet until 1909. However, Bate believes that the C trumpet was introduced in Britain in 1905, but he offers no evidence to support this assertion (Bate 1966: 44). The yet smaller D trumpet, perhaps the more useful instrument in realising the high-pitched parts written by Bach and the ever-popular Handel, was in use in continental Europe in the last decades of the nineteenth century. Myers believes the first short D trumpet may have been made by the Belgian maker Mahillon, in 1871 (stated in private correspondence with the author), and Tarr believes that Ferdinand Weinschenk, principal trumpet in the Leipzig Gewandhaus Orchestra, performed the first trumpet part of Bach's B minor Mass in February 1890 on the short D trumpet (Tarr 1999: 14). Boosey & Co. made their first short D trumpet in 1922 but other British manufacturers may have made short D trumpets earlier.

In summary, the instruments with which Elgar would have been most familiar at the start of his career in the Midlands during the 1870s were the slide trumpet and the cornet. In addition, there may have been some keyed bugles being played in local bands. Later he became familiar with the valved F trumpet but he is unlikely to have seen a valved B-flat

trumpet until the twentieth century in the United Kingdom. As was stated in the Introduction, Elgar did visit other countries, including a three-week holiday in Leipzig in 1882-83. It is likely that he would have seen and heard the rotary-valved trumpet played when attending concerts and opera performances in that city. During the first decades of the twentieth century Elgar would have witnessed the gradual adoption of the B flat/A trumpet and the use of smaller, higher-pitched trumpets in C and D. Writing in 1914 Cecil Forsyth sums up the trumpets in general use in the United Kingdom as: "In our own orchestras a few players use the F trumpet, while the majority use a trumpet crooked in C, B flat or A" (Forsyth 1914: 90).

The leading trumpeters in the United Kingdom during Elgar's career

There is considerable variation in the amount and scholarly quality of the literature concerning trumpeters who were active at the end of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries. There are many quoted and often repeated anecdotes which are illuminating, though they do vary from author to author and are therefore only of limited value to this study.

The most recent survey of the history of the trumpet, from ancient times to the present day, was written by John Wallace and Alexander McGrattan in 2011 (Wallace & McGrattan 2011). Their focus includes organology, repertoire and the most notable performers. Edward Tarr published his history of the instrument in 1988 (Tarr 1988) covering similar strands to Wallace & McGrattan, but with less detail, particularly concerning the later twentieth century. Richard Birkemeir in a series of articles written for the International Trumpet Guild provides an extensive study of the trumpet, the music written for it and trumpeters of the Romantic period; there is, however, only a limited amount concerning the

British Isles (Birkemeir 1985(1): 23-39/1985(2): 13-27). The early twentieth century is beyond the scope of that study but his article concerning the life of Walter Morrow for the *Brass Bulletin* does give some coverage to this (Birkemeir 1989: 34-45). Art Brownlow deals exclusively with the slide trumpet in the United Kingdom and this present study effectively begins where his study ends.

Wallace & McGrattan identify ten leading British trumpeters active during the period 1885-1934, and in addition three visiting foreign performers. Some of these players taught at the newly formed music colleges. They and their pupils who eventually succeeded as players themselves are mentioned in some detail. They postulate that Thomas Harper Jnr. (1816-1898), who succeeded his father, Thomas Harper Snr. (1786-1853), as Trumpet Professor at the Royal Academy of Music in 1845, and became the first Trumpet Professor at the Royal College of Music in 1884, influenced the players of the day (Wallace & McGrattan 2011: 212). Both Steele-Perkins (2001: 65) and Tarr (1988: 151-152) concur with this view, believing that the influence of the Harpers helped the slide trumpet, their favoured instrument, to be used almost to the end of the nineteenth century.

Wallace & McGrattan have alluded to the different instruments that these players advocated. They mention Walter Morrow (1850-1937), a pupil of Harper Jnr. and the teacher of Ernest Hall, as being a proponent of the long F trumpet after rejecting the use of a combination of slide trumpet and cornet by 1895 (Wallace & McGrattan 2011: 214). Birkemeir has written comprehensively, in considerable detail, about the life and career of Walter Morrow, and agrees with Wallace & McGrattan regarding the date by which Morrow publicly announced his decision to advocate the F trumpet in a lecture to the Musical Association, entitled "The Trumpet as an Orchestral Instrument", in June 1895. In addition, Birkemeir outlines how Morrow influenced others to use this instrument (1989: 40).

However, Steele-Perkins believes that Morrow did retain the slide trumpet for performances of Handel's music (Steele-Perkins 2001: 25).

Wallace & McGrattan describe the extent to which Ernest Hall (1890-1984) favoured the B-flat trumpet over the F instrument. Their description includes the anecdote that Hall, who was a pupil of Morrow at the Royal College of Music, "took lessons ... on the F trumpet by day, and performed on the B flat trumpet at night" (2011: 201). Tarr goes further, proposing that Hall "first definitively introduced the B-flat trumpet in England around 1912" (1988: 171). Steele-Perkins relates an alleged incident in 1912 that may have been the motivation for Tarr's statement. He claims that during rehearsals for a performance of *An Alpine Symphony* by Richard Strauss with the London Symphony Orchestra, the principal trumpet, John Solomon, playing the very high first trumpet part on an F trumpet, is said to have "encountered such difficulty ... that enquiries were made whether there was a trumpeter in London capable of playing it with safety". The story continues that Ernest Hall, then a pupil of Morrow, was "proud to own a smart new B-flat Mahillon trumpet" and was duly summoned (Steele-Perkins 2001: 71). However, this anecdote cannot be correct as Strauss did not complete *An Alpine Symphony* until 1915.¹⁹

The available literature presents a limited description of the trumpet world at the end of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries, concentrating on only a few, mostly London-based, trumpeters. However, a "school of trumpet playing" is identified by Tarr with the influence of teacher to pupil leading to the establishment of a recognisable lineage of trumpet playing: Harper to Morrow, Morrow to Hall "an exponent of the traditional trumpet

¹⁹ The author has heard this anecdote many times from numerous sources. It is often alleged that Strauss himself was conducting, and during a trumpet class at Birmingham Conservatoire on 18 October 2007 Michael Laird entertainingly related the story by dramatising it as a dialogue between Mr Solomon and Maestro Strauss. However, this also cannot be entirely correct as Strauss conducted the London Symphony for the first time in 1918 (The information is visible on the LSO website at <http://www.lso.co.uk/orchestra/history/chronology-alt/1910s.html>).

school with straight, even tone" (Tarr 1988: 183). John Solomon was also a pupil of Thomas Harper Jnr. The tonal characteristic of this school of trumpet playing, as identified by Tarr, is further explored in Chapter Six. However, it is interesting to note that the Harpers preferred to play the slide trumpet; Morrow became an advocate of the long F trumpet and Hall the foremost proponent of the B-flat trumpet.

Elgar knew and worked with these leading trumpeters. Available in libraries and archives are many concert programmes from performances involving Elgar that list the members of the orchestras involved. These show that the London-based players mentioned above did not restrict their work to the capital, but performed nationally. For example, towards the end of his career Thomas Harper Jnr. was the principal trumpeter at the Three Choirs Festival, held in Worcester, in 1878, 1881 and 1884. Also performing in the violin section of the orchestra at those festivals was Elgar himself. In later Three Choirs Festivals held in Worcester during the 1890s the trumpet section included both Walter Morrow and John Solomon (see Appendix 9 and 13). In addition, at the first performance of Elgar's *Caractacus* during the Leeds Festival of 1898 Morrow and Solomon are again listed in the trumpet section. However, these programmes also list other trumpeters who are not mentioned in the available literature. Some of these may have been locally based in the Midlands or the North of England.

Provincial directories of musicians were becoming available at the end of the nineteenth century. From an unnamed directory of 1900, Ehrlich quotes the following figures for professional musicians active in the provincial cities of the United Kingdom: Liverpool 318, Manchester 315 and Birmingham 273 (Ehrlich 1985: 52). However, the number of 273 active in the Birmingham area is partly contradicted by a directory self-published by Luke Corfield, a trumpeter/cornettist active in the city, in 1903. *Corfield's List of Local*

*Instrumentalists containing the Names, Addresses, Instruments etc., of a Thousand and one of the Best Known Players in Birmingham (Professional and Amateur)*²⁰ illuminates the state of the musical world in the English Midlands in the early twentieth century. Of great interest to this study is the listing of trumpet and cornet players. Only seven trumpet players are named and some of these correlate with those named in the programmes of concerts involving Elgar.²¹ For example, in the first performance of Elgar's *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*, conducted by the composer in October 1896 at the North Staffordshire Music Festival, the trumpeters are listed as J. Freeman, W. Moore, and D. G. Rabjohns. Freeman²² is listed in the Corfield directory as a trumpeter and separately as a cornettist living at 77 Wakeman Road, Balsall Heath. D. G. Rabjohns is listed as a cornet player residing at 144 Latimer Street, St Thomas's. W. Moore is not listed in Corfield; this player will be explored in more detail in Chapter Three.

As has been stated, Corfield's directory contains the names of only seven trumpeters; however, one hundred cornet players are listed. The cornet had become an extremely popular instrument in less than eighty years since its invention. It is also significant to note that cornet players comprise approximately 10% of all the musicians of Birmingham. All seven of the trumpeters are also listed as playing the cornet. This directory gives some indication, by implication, of how scarce trumpet players were in the country at the turn of the twentieth century. Birmingham was already England's second city, yet few trumpeters are listed in this local musicians' directory. Brownlow lists British trumpeters in an appendix and found only five active during the later nineteenth century (Brownlow 1996: 233-234).

²⁰ This directory is held in the reference section of The Library of Birmingham, under the number 177856.

²¹ The trumpeters in the Corfield directory are listed in Appendix 5 in addition to the trumpet/cornet sections listed in various concerts held in Worcestershire and Midlands orchestras.

²² Joseph Freeman taught trumpet at the Midland Institute in the early years of the twentieth century. His grandson, Richard "Bob" Walton became principal trumpet of the Royal Philharmonic Orchestra and professor of trumpet at the Royal College of Music in the second half of the twentieth century.

They are Harper Jnr., Morrow, Solomon, Freeman and William Ellis, this last-named appearing in the programmes of the Three Choirs Festivals of 1892, 1893, 1894 and 1895. The assertion that there were only a small number of trumpeters active during this period is also corroborated by the workshop records of Boosey & Co., which, as has already been outlined, show very few trumpets being manufactured, particularly when compared with the number of cornets. Prout, writing in 1898, also confirms that there were fewer trumpet players available and claims that the cornet is “so much easier to play than the trumpet, that parts written for the latter instrument [trumpet] are very often performed on the cornet. In some cases, especially in provincial orchestras, this may be a necessity, as it is not always possible to find trumpet players” (Prout 1898: 215).

However, as has been stated, all the trumpeters listed by Corfield are also listed as cornettists, and it would be fair to assume that this was also the case nationwide. Furthermore, as will be discussed in Chapter Four, the cornet was used extensively in the theatre in preference to the trumpet. Consequently, as cornettists performed in a greater variety of bands and orchestras, there would be a much wider market for cornets than for trumpets. Myers & Eldredge analysed the 1890 cornet production of Besson, mentioned earlier, and found that 37% went to dealers, 24% to individuals, 23% to brass bands, 8% to companies, 5% to the military and 2% to export, leaving the remainder going to schools or presented as prizes (Myers & Eldredge 2006: 48).

Conclusions

Musical life during the nineteenth century developed with the formation and growth of a variety of musical groupings, both choral and instrumental. Choral music education became available to the public but instrumental tuition was limited. Private lessons and the

formation of music colleges provided some opportunities to learn instruments. However, it was the military bands that offered the most opportunities for brass, woodwind and percussion players to develop their skills. Furthermore, it was military music that expanded opportunities for instrumental tuition to people from more humble backgrounds. This expanding musical world provided Elgar, even though he had little formal musical education, with the opportunities to establish a musical career.

The changes in musical life and the organological development of instruments during the nineteenth century coincided with vast changes in musical style, for example from Haydn to Elgar. In the next chapter I set out to amplify our knowledge of orchestral practice during the late nineteenth century with particularly reference to the trumpeters of the Hallé Orchestra, one of the few permanently contracted orchestras in the United Kingdom during Elgar's career.

Chapter Two

The Hallé Orchestra during the career of Elgar

This chapter examines the work of the Hallé Orchestra, as a case study, to investigate aspects of the professional trumpet player's life during the period of Elgar's career. Firstly, a detailed catalogue of the works performed in the season 1884/1885 provides evidence of the regular workload that orchestral trumpeters had to cope with in the early part of Elgar's career. This leads to a theory of how those trumpeters were able to fully realise this repertoire. Secondly, the trumpet and cornet personnel during the period of Elgar's career are listed, which gives an indication of the security and tenure they enjoyed in Manchester.

The formation and rapid establishment of the Hallé Orchestra

Charles Hallé came to settle in Manchester in 1848 after a successful career as a pianist across Europe. He took charge of the Gentlemen's Concerts, which were member-only events, in 1849. An Arts and Treasures Exhibition was held in Manchester in 1857 for which Hallé expanded the Gentlemen's Concerts orchestra to play every afternoon during the six months of the exhibition. The notes of the executive committee detailed this undertaking:

Mr Charles Hallé was accepted ... in consideration of the payment of £4,515, he undertook to form an efficient orchestra of 50 musicians for the daily performances, and provide eminent talent and a large chorus for the more important musical festivities. (Quoted in Kennedy 1960: 29)

The success of these performances led Hallé to organise his own concert series the following year which the public could attend by ticket. The first of these concerts took place in the Free Trade Hall, Manchester, on 30 January 1858; there were sixteen concerts in the first Hallé Orchestra season. This increased to a twenty-week season starting in October and ending in March with the repertoire changing weekly. This pattern continued for the half-century which is the focus of this study.

The notion of salaried employment for orchestral musicians did not exist at the end of the nineteenth century. For the trumpeters and cornettists of the Hallé Orchestra to have a twenty-week engagement year after year, which was often supplemented with extra concerts, must have brought some financial stability to their family lives, and having a position in the orchestra was an attractive proposition.

The orchestra also visited other cities particularly in the North of England, and was employed as the orchestra for various provincial music festivals (Drummond 2011: 234).

The orchestra performed in London where it championed the music of Berlioz:

On several occasions, he [Hallé] brought up the Manchester Orchestra to London, with the special object of performing important works of Berlioz. The last three series of these concerts ... [began] in the autumns of 1889, 1890, and 1891. (Fuller Maitland 1906 [1922], II: 276)

Later, after the death of Sir Charles Hallé in 1895 the orchestra was conducted by Hans Richter, from 1899 to 1911, and gave two first performances of Elgar's works, *In The South* in 1904 and the *Symphony in A flat* in 1908, and under the name of the Birmingham Triennial Festival Orchestra two more first performances, of *The Apostles* in 1903 and *The*

Kingdom in 1906. However, Elgar had been familiar with members of the orchestra from the earliest stages of his career when he performed as a member of the Three Choirs Festival Orchestra in Worcester from 1878. For example, the second trumpet in the Festival Orchestra in the years 1878, 1881, 1884, 1887 and 1890 was a Mr J. Scotts and since so few trumpet players were working at that time, it can be safely assumed that this was the same J. Scotts who was second trumpet in the Hallé Orchestra.²³

The next section analyses the Hallé Orchestra season 1884/1885, a season of concerts in the first decade of Elgar's career.

Hallé Orchestra Season 1884/1885

From the surviving programmes of the Manchester concerts, I have assembled a comprehensive list of the repertoire of the 1884/85 season. This provides evidence of what music trumpeters in this provincial orchestra were required to perform on a day-to-day basis.

Week-by-week repertoire

Week One 30/10/84

Overture *Oberon* - Weber

Scena 'Ardon gl'incensi' (*Lucia di Lammermoor*) - Donizetti

'Romanza' and 'Rondo' from *Concerto in E minor* - Chopin

Air 'I mourn as a dove' (*St Peter*) - Benedict

Grand Symphony in C minor - Beethoven

²³ Scotts could fit in the Three Choirs Festival engagement as this takes place in September each year, a month before the Hallé Orchestra season begins.

Overture *The Hebrides* - Mendelssohn

Piano solo - Schumann

'Introduction' to *Parsifal* - Wagner

Songs 'Es blinkt der Thau' - Rubenstein and 'Les Enfants' - Massenet

Overture *Waverley* - Berlioz

Week Two 6/11/84

Overture *Rosamunde* - Schubert

'Air Elsa's vision' (*Lohengrin*) - Wagner

Grand Symphony in F - Brahms

Grand Piano Concerto No. 2 in G minor - Saint-Saëns

Air 'La Styrienne' (*Mignon*) - Thomas

Rhapsodie Hongroise No. 3 in D - Liszt

Air 'Habanera' (*Carmen*) - Bizet

Huldigungsmarsch - Wagner

Week Three 13/11/84

Judas Maccabaeus - Handel

Week Four 20/11/84

Grand Symphony in D No. 35 - Mozart

Aria 'Caro nome' (*Rigoletto*) - Verdi

Piano Concerto in A minor - Schumann

Festival Overture in C Op.124 - Beethoven

Air 'Balcony Prayer' (*Lohengrin*) - Wagner

'Charreitag-Zauber' (*Parsifal*) - Wagner

Piano solo - Chopin/Liszt

Song 'The Jewel Song' (*Faust*) - Gounod

Procession March - Sullivan

Week Five 27/11/84

Stabat Mater - Dvořák

Psalm XLII *As the hart pants* - Mendelssohn

'Terzetto' (*Messe Solennelle*) - Rossini

'Hallelujah Chorus' (*Mount of Olives*) - Beethoven

Week Six 4/12/84

Overture *Alfonso ed Estrella* - Schubert

Aria 'Per la gloria' - Buononcini

Grand Symphony in E flat - Saint-Saëns

Piano Concerto No. 3 in C minor - Beethoven

Aria 'Non più mesta' ([*La*] *Cenerentola*) - Rossini

'Scene of the Rhine Daughters' (*Götterdämmerung*) - Wagner

Songs 'Trock'ne Blumen' - Schubert and 'Widmung' - Schumann

Overture *Le Pré aux Clercs* - Hérold

Week Seven 11/12/84

Overture *// Seraglio* - Mozart

Aria 'Per la gloria' - Buononcini

Violin Concerto No. 7 in E minor - Spohr

Aria 'Non più mesta' ([*La*] *Cenerentola*) - Rossini

Symphony in B flat *La Reine de France* - Haydn

Overture *Les Francs Juges [sic]*- Berlioz

Violin solo - Handel

'Introduction' to *Parsifal* - Wagner

Songs 'Trock'ne Blumen' - Schubert and 'Widmung' - Schumann

Schiller Marsch - Meyerbeer

Week Eight 19/12/84

The Messiah - Handel (with additional accompaniments by Mozart)

Week Nine 26/12/84

Overture *Anacreon* - Cherubini

Aria 'Roberto o tu che adoro' - Meyerbeer

Sinfonia Eroica in E flat Op. 55 - Beethoven

Grand Piano Concerto No. 2 in G minor - Saint-Saëns

Cantilena 'Nuit resplendissante' - Gounod

Le Carneval [sic] de Pesth and *Rhapsodie in D* - Liszt

Piano solo - Weber

Air 'The Swallow Song' (*Esméralda*) - A. Goring Thomas

Overture *The Syren* - Auber

Week Ten 2/1/85

Faust - Berlioz

Week Eleven 8/1/85

Overture *The Wedding of Camacho* - Mendelssohn

Air 'Angels ever bright and fair' - Handel

Grand Symphony in D Op. 60 - Dvořák

Piano Concerto in C minor - Gernsheim

Bolero 'Merce dilette amiche' (*I Vespri Siciliani*) - Verdi

Piano solo - Schubert/Nicode

Romanza - Cowen

Overture *Mirella* - Gounod

Week Twelve 15/1/85

Overture *In the Highlands* - Gade

Air 'The Lord is my Shepherd' (*Rose of Sharon*) - Mackenzie

Cello Concerto - Jules de Swert (played by composer)

Song 'Absence' - Berlioz

Symphony in E flat *The Rhenish* - Schumann

'The Entrance of the Gods into Walhalla' (*Das Rheingold*) - Wagner

Cello solo - Bach/Popper

Orchestral Suite from *Sylvia* - Delibes

Song 'Meine Lieb ist grün / Geheimniss' - Brahms

March in C minor - Schubert/Liszt

Week Thirteen 22/1/85

Moses in Egypt - Rossini

Week Fourteen 29/1/85

Overture *Les Abencérages* - Cherubini

Air 'Rose softly blooming' - Spohr

'Adagio and Rondo' from Violin Concerto in E - Vieuxtemps

'Kommt ein schlanker Bursch gegangen' (*Der Freischütz*) - Weber

Symphony in A *The Italian* - Mendelssohn

Overture *Coriolan* - Beethoven

Violin and viola duet - Mozart

Songs 'Thou'rt like unto a flower' - Rubinstein and 'May-dew' - Bennett

Piano and violin duet - Beethoven

Hungarian Dance in G minor - Brahms

Week Fifteen /2/85

Overture *Iphigénia en Aulide* - Gluck

Introduction 'Verwandlungs-Musik' [sic] and closing scene of Act 1 (*Parsifal*) -
Wagner

Faust Part 2 - Schumann

Week Sixteen 12/2/85

Overture *Faust* - Wagner

Grand scena 'Ah perfido' - Beethoven

Serenade No. 9 in D - Mozart

Emperor Concerto - Beethoven

Air 'Connais-tu le pays?' (*Mignon*) - Thomas

Rhapsodie Hongroise No. 1 in F - Liszt

Songs 'Painful sweet' - Tchaikovsky and 'Eswar ein Traum' - Lassen

Overture *Abu Hassan* - Weber

Week Seventeen 19/2/85

Overture *Faust* - Spohr

Air 'Dove sei amato bene' (*Rodelina*) - Handel

Violin Concerto in G minor - Bruch

Air 'Vanne disse al figlio' (*Roberto il Diavolo*) - Meyerbeer

Symphony *L'Ours* - Haydn

Instrumental movements from *Romeo and Juliet* - Berlioz

Violin solo - Schumann

Songs 'Star Vicino' - Rosa and 'La Calandrina' - Jommelli

March *La Reine de Saba* - Gounod

Week Eighteen 26/2/85

Elijah - Mendelssohn

Week Nineteen 5/3/85

Symphony in C No. 9 - Schubert

Air 'Up the dreadful steep ascending' - Handel

Concerto for 2 violins - J S Bach

Overture *Leonora No. 3* - Beethoven

Air 'Lo the King greatly desireth thy beauty' (*The Rose of Sharon*) - Mackenzie

Violin duet - Spohr

Air 'Creation's Hymn' - Beethoven

Overture *Tannhäuser* - Wagner

Week Twenty 12/3/85

Jephtha - Handel

There are many points of interest that could be extrapolated from this repertoire list, but for the purposes of this study two are prominent. Firstly, it is worth considering the range of composers whose music the Manchester public had the opportunity to hear, and the orchestra in general, and trumpeters in particular, were required to perform.

Table 2.1 Composers whose music was performed by the Hallé Orchestra 1884/85

Composer	Dates	Nationality	Week performed
Auber	1782-1871	French	9
Bach	1685-1750	German	12 19
Beethoven	1770-1827	German	1 4 5 6 9 14 16 19
Benedict	1804-1885	German/British	1
Bennet	1805-1830	British	14

Composer	Dates	Nationality	Week performed
Berlioz	1803-1869	French	1 7 10 12 17
Bizet	1838-1875	French	2
Brahms	1833-1897	German	2 12 14
Bruch	1838-1920	German	17
Buononcini	1670-1747	Italian	6 7
Cherubini	1760-1842	Italian	9 14
Chopin	1810-1849	Polish	1 4
Cowen	1852-1935	British	11
Delibes	1836-1891	French	12
Donizetti	1797-1848	Italian	1
Dvořák	1841-1902	Czech	5 11
Gade	1817-1890	Danish	12
Gernsheim	1839-19??	German	11
Gluck	1714-1787	German	15
Gounod	1818-1893	French	4 9 11 17
Handel	1685-1759	German/British	3 7 8 11 17 19 20
Haydn	1732-1809	Austrian	7 17
Herold	1791-1833	French	6
Jommelli	1714-1774	Italian	17
Lassen	1830-1904	Danish/Belgium	16
Liszt	1811-1886	German	2 4 9 12 16
Mackenzie	1847-1935	British	12 19
Massenet	1842-1912	French	1
Mendelssohn	1809-1847	German	1 5 11 14 18
Meyerbeer	1791-1864	German	7 9 17
Mozart	1756-1791	Austrian	4 7 16
Rosa	1842-1889	German/British	17
Rossini	1792-1868	Italian	5 6 7 13
Rubinstein	1829-1894	Russian	14
Saint-Saëns	1835-1921	French	2 6 9
Schubert	1797-1828	Austrian	2 6 7 11 12 19
Schumann	1810-1856	German	1 4 6 7 12 15 17
Spohr	1784-1859	German	7 14 17 19
Sullivan	1842-1900	British	4

Composer	Dates	Nationality	Week performed
Swert	1843-1891	Belgium	12
Tchaikovsky	1840-1893	Russian	16
Thomas	1811-1896	French	2 9 16
Verdi	1813-1901	Italian	4
Vieuxtemps	1820-1881	Belgium	14
Wagner	1813-1883	German	1 2 4 6 7 12 15 16 19
Weber	1786-1826	German	1 9 14 16

This table showing the music that was performed by the Hallé Orchestra during the 1884/1885 season may not be a great surprise to a modern-day concertgoer. There are a few composers, such as Gade from Denmark and Cowen from Britain, whose music is now mostly forgotten, but the majority of composers listed are still well known and their works continue to be performed by the Hallé Orchestra during the early twenty-first century. However, the season in question is 1884/1885; it was only the year before, 1883, that Richard Wagner died. It is of much interest that Wagner was the most performed composer during that season, his music being heard in nine of the twenty weeks, and in some concerts more than one of his works was performed. Wagner's last opera was *Parsifal* first performed at Bayreuth in 1882. The 'Introduction' to *Parsifal* was performed by the Hallé Orchestra in the first concert of the season and again in the seventh week. Further extracts from this opera were performed in weeks four and fifteen.

Contemporary music was fundamental to the Hallé Orchestra in the late nineteenth century. The music of forty-seven composers was performed during this season and of those twenty were living, with a further six having died within the previous twenty years. However, the orchestra's repertoire was wide and did not ignore the music of the past. In particular, the popular oratorios by Handel were an important part of the season, with

Judas Maccabeus, *Messiah* and *Jephtha* each taking up a week. Performances of other choral works, each being programmed for a week, were Dvořák's *Stabat Mater*, Berlioz's *Faust*, Rossini's *Moses in Egypt* and Mendelssohn's *Elijah*.

The second point of interest, from the perspective of the orchestra's trumpet section, that can be drawn from the repertoire list is the duration of these concerts. The twenty-first century orchestral concert rarely lasts over two hours. The Hallé Orchestra concerts during 1884/1885 season all last more than two hours and some nearer three. For example, the first half of the concert in week one contains an overture (Weber's *Oberon* c. 11 minutes), an operatic scene (Donizetti's 'Ardon gl'incensi' c. 8 minutes), two movements from a piano concerto (Chopin in E minor c. 20 minutes), an air (Benedict's 'I mourn as a dove' c. 4 minutes) and a complete symphony (Beethoven in C minor c. 35 minutes). The music for this half of the concert is approximately 1 hour 20 minutes without taking into consideration any breaks for such necessities as movement on and off stage.

These long concerts would have challenged the stamina of the trumpeters in the orchestra. However, two mitigating factors would have provided some relief to this challenge. Firstly, the orchestra maintained two trumpets and two cornets under contract and the workload could have been shared between them. Secondly, in many of the concerts there were piano, or other instrumental, solos that would have provided a few minutes of rest for the whole orchestra.

Works with demanding trumpet parts played by the Hallé Orchestra during Elgar's career

Wallace & McGrattan, Tarr and Steele-Perkins have all given much attention to repertoire with demanding trumpet parts written in the eighteenth, nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, with most of the performances they mention being in London. The Hallé Orchestra concert programmes detail all the pieces they performed season by season and provide answers to the question of whether, and when, their trumpet section was required to tackle this difficult repertoire.

In the available literature much is made of the performance of the trumpet parts of Bach, particularly the *Mass in B minor* and the *Brandenburg Concerto No. 2* at their correct, upper register, pitch. The Hallé performed the *Mass in B minor* for the first time in November 1902 and the Brandenburg Concerto No. 2 for the first time in November 1915. However, the analytical notes in the concert programme of November 1915 contain musical quotations in which the trumpet part is often written an octave lower than Bach's original score. This confirms the view of Wallace & McGrattan that some of the trumpet part was usually transposed down an octave (Wallace & McGrattan 2011: 236-237). It was not until February 1949 that the Hallé Concerts Society audience heard the trumpet part of this concerto performed mostly at the correct pitch²⁴ when George Eskdale, the then principal trumpet of the London Symphony Orchestra, played this with the Boyd Neel Orchestra on two consecutive days.

²⁴ Eskdale's recording of this work with the Adolph Busch Chamber Orchestra from the 1930s has a few of the highest notes transposed down an octave and he may have repeated this in his Manchester performances.

The trumpet parts written by Richard Strauss are also extremely demanding and freely use the upper register of the instrument. An alleged performance, alluded to in the previous chapter, of *An Alpine Symphony* by the London Symphony Orchestra in 1912 is blamed by Steele-Perkins for heralding the demise of the F trumpet (Steele-Perkins 2001: 71). There is no evidence that the Hallé Orchestra was conducted by Strauss but they did perform *An Alpine Symphony* for the first time in November 1923. However, many of the other tone poems of Strauss also have demanding trumpet parts, and the Hallé performed most of these prior to 1912. The first of these works, *Tod und Verklärung*, was performed in October 1902. Every year following, other works by Strauss were performed for the first time, with *Don Juan* in 1903, *Also Sprach Zarathustra* in 1904, *Till Eulenspiegel* in 1905, *Sinfonia Domestica* in 1906 and *Ein Heldenleben* in 1907. There is then a gap to 1910, when *Don Quixote* was performed.

From the aforementioned it can be seen that the players of the Hallé Orchestra trumpet section had technical demands placed upon them equal to their colleagues in London. They had to perform contemporary music with its ever-increasing demands on the technical capabilities of the instrument. These pieces even today are regarded as difficult. In addition, they had frequently to perform the popular works of the eighteenth century with their obbligato solos. This wide-ranging repertoire would have posed a considerable challenge to the trumpet section of the orchestra with the instruments they had available to them. A suggestion follows as to how they could have achieved the realisation of these parts using the limited instrumental resources available.

The pieces by Handel were written for the natural trumpet, an instrument that was limited to the notes of the harmonic series. In contrast the ‘Introduction’ to *Parsifal* is written for trumpets that are capable of playing chromatically, and only those equipped with valves

were able to do this. A study of the list of pieces performed during the 1884/1885 season reveals that thirty-one works were written for the natural trumpet, including the *Grand Symphony in F* (Symphony No. 3) by Brahms, who was still alive and persisted throughout his career in writing natural-trumpet-like parts, although considerable “lipping” of notes would be required to realise all of his trumpet parts on a natural trumpet. However, at least nineteen pieces would have required a chromatic instrument to perform the written trumpet part. Some works would require both trumpets and cornets, notably the works of Berlioz, such as Overture *Les Francs-Juges* performed in week seven.

Berlioz usually scored for two trumpets and two cornets. Some later composers also followed this instrumentation, such as Tchaikovsky, and for a brief period around 1901, Elgar. However, writing for three trumpets or more was the usual scoring of Wagner with only his first opera *Rienzi* (1842) being scored for two trumpets and two cornets. The Hallé Orchestra from its foundation had employed two trumpet and two cornet players. To perform works requiring three or more trumpets would have demanded a degree of flexibility from the trumpet and cornet sections. Neither the natural trumpet nor its successor the slide trumpet could have been used to perform the works of Wagner with their chromatic writing. It is unlikely that the long F trumpet was used: as has been stated earlier, even the leading player of the day, Walter Morrow, did not advocate that instrument until 1895, some ten years later. A possible solution to this problem was that all the performers played on the cornet when a chromatic capability was required.

It is possible that the trumpeters in the Hallé Orchestra were proficient on the slide trumpet as well as the cornet but it is likely that the cornettists played only that instrument. Audiences and conductors would have expected the music of such composers as Handel, particularly the obbligato solos, to be played on the slide trumpet. As has been previously

mentioned, Steele-Perkins believes Morrow retained a slide trumpet for these pieces (Steele-Perkins 2001:25).

Trumpet players' doubling on cornet was not unusual. As mentioned in the previous chapter, in the 1903 Corfield directory of Birmingham musicians, all seven of the trumpeters are also listed as playing the cornet. A contemporary commentator, Algeron Rose, supports this idea that trumpet parts were played on the cornet. Writing in 1895 he states that "although in our great orchestras 'trumpet players' may be advertised in the programmes, in nine cases out of ten these musicians perform their parts, in an excellent manner, not on the trumpet but on the cornet". Rose also records that the Manchester-based instrument manufacturer Higham had produced a "Cornet and Trumpet combined" (Rose 1895: 179).

Charles Hallé was an advocate of Berlioz's music and it may have been that the composer's preference to score for both trumpets and cornets influenced the composition of the Hallé Orchestra. In 1858 the sections were Mr Ellwood²⁵ and Mr Batley, trumpets, with Mr Richardson and Mr Towers, cornets. The section remained generally stable during the next twenty-six years with Mr G. Jaeger taking over from Mr Ellwood as principal trumpet from 1872; Mr J. Scotts becomes second trumpet from 1876 and Mr Ford takes over as principal cornet in 1884. The division of trumpets and cornets continued until 1913 after which just trumpets were listed with no cornets. The separate designation of trumpets and cornets was reinstated after World War II and continued into the 1970s when I worked as an "extra" trumpeter with the orchestra.

²⁵ Brownlow quotes a report from the *Musical Times* of 1849 that a Mr Ellwood performed "Seraphim" with a Mrs Sunderland (Brownlow 1996: 233).

In the available literature few trumpeters based outside of London are mentioned and only limited indication is given of the number of trumpeters active in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Corfield gives some answers to these questions in the Birmingham area, and the Hallé Orchestra archive lists all the contracted members of the orchestra, giving some insight into the trumpeters of the Manchester area.

Hallé Orchestra Trumpet/Cornet section 1884-1934

Table 2.2 The Trumpet/Cornet section of the Hallé Orchestra in chronological order

Surname	Initials	Dates	Rank	other ranking
Jaeger	G	1872-1898	principal trumpet	
Scotts	J	1876-1899	2nd trumpet	
Ford	?	1884-1899	1st cornet	
Robinson	R	1884-1885	2nd cornet	
Mathews	T	1885-1906	2nd cornet	1st cornet 1899-1906
Bell	R	1899-1912	2nd cornet	
Short	W	1898-1901	principal trumpet	
Tayler	J	1899-1908	2nd trumpet	1st cornet 1906-1908
Valk	J	1901-1917	principal trumpet	
Cadwell	D	1906-1908	2nd trumpet	
Pickerell	E C	1908-1916 & 1919-1925	2nd trumpet	
Baker	?	1909-1911	2nd cornet	
Stephens	F	1912-1916 & 1919-1930	1st cornet	3rd trumpet 1913-1930
Hall	A	1916-1917	2nd trumpet	
Harris	A	1916-1949	3rd trumpet	principal trumpet 1918-1934
Corfield	J	1917-1918	principal trumpet	
Bryan	H	1917-1918	2nd trumpet	

Surname	Initials	Dates	Rank	other ranking
Radcliffe	J	1918-1919	2nd trumpet	
Birtles	C W	1922-	3rd trumpet	
Mortimer	H	1930-	3rd trumpet	principal trumpet 1934-
Wild	R	1930-1932	4th trumpet	
Grindod	T	1932-1933	4th trumpet	
Lockwood	A	1934-	2nd trumpet	

From this table it can be concluded that the trumpet/cornet section consisted of generally long-serving members of the orchestra. It was the period 1916 to 1919 that witnessed the greatest turnover, with some eight trumpeters listed over the three seasons. It is particularly interesting to note that E. C. Pickerell and F. Stephens left the orchestra in 1916, after eight seasons and four seasons respectively, and returned in 1919 to serve a further six and eleven seasons. The most likely reason for this is the outbreak of World War I: Pickerell and Stephens may well have served in the armed forces.

The list of principal trumpeters over this fifty-year period raises a number of significant points. There were only five principal trumpeters and three of them covered forty-six of these fifty years. W. Short served the orchestra only for three seasons and J. Corfield for just a single season.²⁶ Alex Harris was principal trumpet for the final sixteen years 1918-1934. He then moved down the section, as many trumpeters do as they get older, and according to the archive left the orchestra in 1949. However, a press clipping dated 1951 announcing Harris's death, found in a Hallé Pension Ledger, states that he left the orchestra in 1943 to join the BBC Northern Orchestra, then newly formed. The most intriguing points of interest in the list of principal trumpets are the two longest serving: G. Jaeger served twenty-six years and J. Valk seventeen years.

²⁶ It is not known if J. Corfield was any relation to Luke Corfield in Birmingham who was also a trumpeter.

Jaeger and Valk were foreign trumpeters. Research through the census returns of 1891, 1901, and 1911 gives much further information about them. Gustav Jaeger completed the 1891 census return indicating his place of birth as Germany; he was forty-two years of age and lists his occupation as “Professor of Music”. He is married to Elise who is twenty-nine and they have three children. Jaeger’s movements after he left the Hallé Orchestra are traced in Chapter Four, but by the 1901 census return he seems to have died or left the United Kingdom, as his wife completes the form and lists herself as Head of the Household and resident in London.

Valk was principal trumpet of the Scottish Orchestra before joining the Hallé²⁷. The programme for the first Scottish performance of *Caractacus* at the McEwan Hall, Edinburgh on 17 December 1900²⁸ lists the trumpet section as J. Valk, E. C. Freeman²⁹ and G. Love. On the census return of 1911 Johannes Valk describes himself as aged thirty-six, born in Holland, married to Jeanette with no children (one had died before the census date) and he lists his occupation as a musician in the Hallé Orchestra.

It is likely that both trumpeters came to the United Kingdom as adults, as their respective wives are of the same nationality as themselves. This leads to the conclusion that Jaeger and Valk were trained as trumpeters in their native countries and the instruments they used may have been continental in make, possibly with rotary valves, as described in Chapter One, rather than piston valves. The rotary valved trumpet was, as previously outlined, fully chromatic, and had the capability to perform the entire repertoire previously discussed.

²⁷ Appendix 6 lists the trumpet/cornet sections in a selection of concerts across the United Kingdom during Elgar’s career.

²⁸ The second trombone listed on this programme is Gustav von Holst. Selected compositions by Holst are discussed in Chapter Five.

²⁹ Listed in the Corfield directory as cornet player is C.E. Freeman.

The technical and musical demands made upon the trumpet/cornet section of the Hallé Orchestra were not only confined to such institutions of national repute. These demands were replicated across the country during the nineteenth century with the growing festival movement outlined in the previous chapter. Catherine Dale has tabulated all the works performed at the Bridlington Festivals. Thirty-eight composers are listed, of whom thirty were either still living or had died in the previous twenty years, and eight works were commissions of the Festival (Dale 2007: 352–356). As with the programmes presented by the Hallé Orchestra in the season 1884/5 analysed above, the music of Wagner features prominently at the Bridlington Festivals with extracts from his operas *Die Walküre*, *Die Meistersinger von Nürnberg*, *Der fliegende Holländer*, *Lohengrin*, *Parsifal*, and the *Siegfried Idyll*. The trumpet parts in all these operas are demanding and could only be played on a fully chromatic instrument. When considering the number of performances of Handel's *Messiah* alluded to above, a curious feature of these concert programmes for the Bridlington Festival is the absence of this oratorio; however, the trumpet obbligato aria 'Let the bright Seraphim', from Handel's *Samson*, was performed at the 1903 festival.

Conclusions

Trumpeters across the United Kingdom were presented with an increasing set of technical demands. Not only were they required to perform the ever-popular works of Handel that contained obbligato solos, but contemporary music was also being performed, for which a fully chromatic instrument was required to realise the trumpet parts. The cornet was the instrument in general use that could satisfy the technical demands made in contemporary compositions.

The Hallé Orchestra's repertoire demonstrates this musical diversity and it is possible that the two foreign-born trumpeters who fulfilled the role of principal trumpet may have used a rotary-valved trumpet when performing the contemporary music that was a major part of the orchestra's repertoire.

The next chapter examines the trumpet writing of Elgar up to and including 1896, and correlates this with some of the trumpeters with whom he was working at the time.

Chapter Three

Elgar's trumpet writing in compositions up to and including 1896

The Introduction and first two chapters of this thesis detailed how the musical world in general, and the trumpet world in particular, in the United Kingdom were in a state of transitional development during the latter half of the nineteenth century and the first quarter of the twentieth century. The position of Edward Elgar was established as a key witness to these events in his capacity as a performing musician as well as a composer. In this and the following chapter a detailed analysis of the trumpet writing of Elgar is undertaken which provides evidence of these changes. In addition, this analysis, when compared with the historical events themselves, provides evidence as to whether Elgar was merely a witness to these changes, or to some extent a driver of them.

Elgar's early career

The early career of Elgar, up to and including 1896, was centred on Worcester and what is now known as the West Midlands. However, he was not an isolationist, being in touch with the musical life of London, as well as performing with musicians from around England at the Worcester Musical Festivals from 1878. In addition, he had some knowledge of European music, not only from the study of scores but also from the visits of European musicians, such as Dvořák in 1884. Elgar visited the Continent frequently, beginning with a holiday to Paris, in 1880, where he heard Saint-Saëns play the organ, and to Leipzig, in 1882-83, visiting his friend Helen Weaver, who was studying at the Leipzig Conservatoire. It was noted in Chapter One that few trumpets were made in the last twenty-five years of the nineteenth century by the leading manufacturer Boosey & Co., particularly compared

to the many thousands of cornets. This is reflected in Elgar's earliest compositions which are scored for cornet rather than trumpet. The *Introductory Overture* and *Song Arrangements* for the Christy Minstrels, first performed at the Worcester Music Hall in June 1878, are scored for Flute, Cornet, Tambourine, Strings, SATB soloists and chorus. An arrangement of the 'Dead March' from Handel's *Saul* for Cornet and Organ was begun in late 1878 but was not completed. The music Elgar arranged and composed for the band he directed at the Powick Lunatic Asylum is scored exclusively for cornet, rather than trumpet. Elgar was appointed conductor of the staff band at Powick in January 1879 and relinquished the position in late 1884. The band varied slightly in size between 14 and 18 players with the instrumentation of piccolo, flute, clarinet, two cornets, euphonium, bombardon (a member of the tuba family), violins (in up to four parts), an occasional viola, cello, double bass and piano (McVeagh 2004: 51). The post was for one day a week, usually a Friday, during which Elgar coached the individual musicians and conducted the band in the weekly afternoon "dances" for the patients. The scoring reflects the importance of the two cornets in the ensemble.

The first cornet part is technically difficult and extensive. Andrew Lyle, who edited the volume entitled *Music for Powick Asylum* for the Elgar Complete Edition, states: "The First Cornet is entrusted with a great deal of melodic material and must have been written for a fine player, with a wide range and control over high and low notes" (Lyle 2008: xi). For example, in Quadrille 2 of a set of dances entitled *La Brunette*, composed after Elgar's Parisian holiday, the cornets play throughout. The first cornet part, pitched in B flat, plays most of the melodic line with much use of semiquavers, and a pitch range of nearly two octaves from *a* to *f'*, in concert pitch. This use of the cornet concurs with Berlioz's remark, in his *Treatise on Instrumentation*, that in France the cornet "has become the indispensable solo instrument in quadrilles" (Berlioz 1844: 295); Elgar obtained a copy of

Berlioz's treatise in the early 1880s (Moore 1984: 92). The second cornet also plays throughout; the nature of the part is mostly accompanying, with many offbeat quavers. However, the second player does join the first to provide harmony at some cadence points. An overview of these sets of dances shows that the required range of these cornet parts is just over two octaves, from *g* to *a flat*³⁰. The parts are pitched in B flat or A³⁰ (the cornet was equipped with shanks to play in both keys; these were inserted into the instrument before the mouthpiece) and were written with a key signature. The capabilities of the instrument were fully exploited with some chromatic writing, a wide range of dynamics indicated and a variety of articulation including staccato, accents and slurs (Ex.8.1 Quadrille 2 from *La Brunette* in Appendix 8).

Elgar's compositions 1888–1894

The first time Elgar scored for trumpets, as opposed to cornets, was in the short antiphon *Ecce Sacerdos magnus* for chorus and orchestra, first performed on 9 October 1888 at St. George's Church, Worcester. The orchestra consists of oboe, two clarinets in A, bassoon, two trumpets in A, trombone, timpani and strings. The writing for trumpet is sparse, unlike that of the cornet parts in the music for the Powick Asylum Band. They provide limited harmonic support with little melodic material being allocated to them. The reasons for this could include the overall quiet dynamic of the work and its brevity. In Elgar's first major work, the concert overture *Froissart*, he again scores for trumpet rather than cornet but the writing is far more extensive than in *Ecce Sacerdos magnus*.

³⁰ Dependent on the key of the music – if it is in a flat key the part is pitched in B flat, and if a sharp key the part is pitched in A. This practice of changing the pitch of the instrument was to avoid cornet parts being written in keys containing many sharps or flats, as the fingering on the cornet becomes progressively more awkward in these keys. For example, music in E major, concert pitch, would be notated in F-sharp major on a B-flat cornet, whereas the same part for a cornet pitched in A, would be notated in G major. Trumpet parts are written in B flat or A for the same reasons. Philip Bate sums this practice up saying: "The ... trumpet today is pitched in B flat, but it is sometimes convenient ... to lower it to A natural" (Bate 1966: 80).

Froissart was premiered on 9 September 1890, conducted by the composer, at the Worcester Musical Festival (The Three Choirs Festival held in Worcester that year).³¹ It is an extensive single movement work lasting approximately 15 minutes. At the beginning of the score there is a quotation from Keats, “When Chivalry Lifted up her lance on high”, and the piece is heroic in mood. The work is scored for a full orchestra with the brass section consisting of four horns, two trumpets, two tenor trombones and a bass trombone. The trumpet parts are pitched in B flat changing to A when the music modulates. It is not possible to ascertain if a key signature is used as the work is in B flat major, and accidentals are used in the short passage written for trumpet in A. The range required is two octaves and one tone from *g* to *a*. As is implied by the Keats quotation, there are many fanfare-like passages and most of the trumpet writing is indicated to be played at a loud dynamic level. This contrasts with the trombone parts which are often marked to be played quietly and have more to play than the trumpets overall. There are only a few notes in the trumpet parts that are marked to be slurred and much of the articulation is marked with accents of various types. The trumpet parts have a small amount of chromaticism, using notes that would not have been possible on a slide trumpet, indicating that only a valved instrument could have been used to perform them successfully (Ex.8.2 Concert Overture *Froissart* in Appendix 8).

The Black Knight was Elgar’s next major work and his longest work to date with a duration of approximately thirty-five minutes. The first performance was part of a Worcester Festival Choral Society concert on 18 April 1893. (This was not part of the Three Choirs Festival that took place later that year.) It is scored for a SATB choir, which is sub-divided at times, and a full orchestra that includes two trumpets pitched in B flat/A. The writing is similar to

³¹ Other than conducting this first performance Elgar played in the first violin section for the festival.

that in *Froissart* using a range of just over two octaves. There is use of chromaticism (Ex. 8.3 *The Black Knight* in Appendix 8), some technically challenging semiquaver passagework and use of rapid articulation. The trumpets play mostly at a loud dynamic and in one section (at rehearsal letter P) the whole brass section is directed to play “brassy”. A key signature is used, and much of the writing for the two players is either in unison or in octaves. A reduced orchestration advertised in the front of the original published score omits the trumpets and trombones, leaving a single horn as the only representative of the brass section.

Elgar composed *Sursum Corda* the next year and it was first performed by the Worcester Cathedral Ensemble in Worcester on 9 April 1894. It is scored for two trumpets in B flat, four horns in F, two tenor trombones, bass trombone, tuba, timpani, organ and strings, and lasts for approximately ten minutes. As suggested by the title, which is usually translated as “Lift up your hearts”, this is a joyous work. Both trumpet parts use chromaticism, are technically challenging, and the first player is required to ascend to a high *b-flat* on more than one occasion. The work is in B flat major, and as the trumpets are also in B flat it is not possible to ascertain whether Elgar intended the use of a key signature.

These earlier works raised some awareness of the young composer from Worcester and two commissions followed that greatly enhanced Elgar’s reputation and provided him with the opportunity to develop his compositional style.

Elgar's compositions of 1896 - a momentous year

The Three Choirs Festival was next held in Worcester in 1896, and a major work from Elgar was commissioned. In addition, with Elgar gaining a wider reputation, the recently founded North Staffordshire Music Festival commissioned a work in the same year. The two festivals were held only weeks apart in September, in Worcester, and October, in Hanley.

The Light of Life was composed for the Worcester Musical Festival and first performed on 10 September 1896 conducted by Elgar. It is based on the Biblical story of Jesus restoring the sight of a blind man, which is told in the Gospel of John. The work is in sixteen short movements and lasts for approximately sixty-five minutes, which makes it the longest piece Elgar had so far composed. The piece was originally entitled *Lux Christi* but the publishers, Novello, persuaded the Catholic Elgar to change the title to one that was more Anglicised. The work is scored for a full orchestra, organ, SATB soloists and chorus. The orchestral scoring includes parts for two trumpets. As will become clear, these parts are a radical departure from those in Elgar's earlier works.

The trumpet parts are pitched in four different keys, none of which Elgar had used in any previous work. In all the compositions up to this time point the trumpets were pitched in B flat and A. In *The Light of Life* the trumpets are pitched in F, E flat, D and C, in different movements. It is important to note that these notations all refer to crooks for the F trumpet, so that the 'C trumpet' in this case would be twice as long as the twentieth-century C trumpet and thus pitched an octave lower. In his previous works Elgar writes the trumpet parts with a key signature, or can be assumed to have done so, but, in *The Light of Life* a key signature is not used. In this work the trumpets play in passages that are either

orchestra only, or orchestra and choir; they do not play when solo singers are deployed. There is little use of chromaticism and only five melodic fragments, mostly a bar in length, are given to the trumpets in the whole work. The range of the parts is from *g* to *b" flat*, two octaves and a minor third. There is some use of rapid articulation in the trumpet parts, but they are used mostly in a harmonically supporting role with two parts often written in octaves or in unison. Prout believes that “greater brilliancy is obtained by two trumpets playing in unison” (Prout 1898: 206). Apart from three pitches, written *a*, *e flat* and *d' flat* the trumpet parts of *The Light of Life* could be performed on a slide trumpet. Furthermore, only notes that could have been played on a natural trumpet in C are used in movement 9, “He went his way therefore”. However, to perform the whole work satisfactorily, without having to “lip” any notes, valved trumpets would be required (Ex.8.4 *The Light of Life* No. 6 “Light Out of Darkness” in Appendix 8).

Even longer than *The Light of Life* is *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* being approximately ninety minutes in duration, with a larger orchestra, and parts for STB soloists, in addition to the chorus. This is the first piece in which Elgar scores for three trumpets and the trumpet parts are neither written in the same way, nor musically similar to those of *The Light of Life*. *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* was first performed on 30 October 1896 in the Victoria Hall, Hanley, conducted by the composer. The libretto is based on *Tales of a Wayside Inn* by Longfellow which tells the story of the Norse King Olaf and his conversion to Christianity.

The trumpet parts are pitched in B flat/A, as in both *Froissart* and *The Black Knight*, and the pitch range required is two octaves and an augmented second, from *g flat* to *a"*. The presence of three trumpet parts increases the potential of the trumpets to contribute to the texture of the overall sound: three part chordal writing is effective (Ex.8.5 *Scenes from the*

Saga of King Olaf 1 “I am the God Thor” in Appendix 8), and the fanfare-like motifs are more dramatic than in *Froissart*, which used only two trumpets. The trumpet writing is extensive and varied, with the use of mutes, chromaticism, engagement in the overall melodic argument, a wide dynamic range and some technically challenging rapid passagework in all three parts (Ex.8.6 *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* 2 “King Olaf’s Prows at Nidaros” in Appendix 8). These trumpet parts could only have been realised on a valved trumpet and, as in *The Black Knight*, Elgar uses the unusual performance direction “brassy”. The only similarity between the trumpet writing in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* and *The Light of Life* is that a key signature is not used.

Robin Holloway describes the orchestration of *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* as “masterly” (Holloway 2004: 71). The trumpet writing in this work illustrates Elgar’s developing originality. An unusual use of trumpets to support the viola and cello line at letter D in No. 10 “Sisters sing ye now the Song”. Another orchestral effect, which Elgar uses again in later works, is scoring a solo trumpet to play in octaves with trombones; both instruments, in their respective middle registers, play a quiet, sustained melodic line. This occurs at rehearsal letter G in No. 16 “King Olaf’s Dragons take the sea” (Ex.8.7 *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* 3 in Appendix 8). Elgar re-uses this effect in his Symphony No. 2 in A flat at the beginning of the second movement, rehearsal figure 67, to introduce the main theme. This orchestral effect is also used by Frederick Delius (1862-1934), a contemporary of Elgar, whose trumpet writing is analysed in Chapter Five, in his variations on the Lincolnshire folk song *Brigg Fair*, first performed in 1908, at rehearsal figure 26. Finally, of particular note is the way the three trumpets are used in support of the high woodwind at the beginning of No. 4, “Tell how Olaf bore the cross”, creating an unusual orchestral colour not heard in any of his previous works (Ex.8.8 *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* 4 “Tell How Olaf Bore the Cross” in Appendix 8).

Reviewing Elgar's trumpet and cornet writing up to and including 1896, there are significant developments evident. Firstly, Elgar has changed from scoring for cornet to trumpet. Secondly, the use of a key signature continues through this transition from cornet to trumpet writing but then is suddenly stopped in the compositions of 1896. Thirdly, he increases the number of trumpets to three and finally, there are many differences in the way he scores for the trumpet in *The Light of Life* compared to his other works.

The reason for the change from scoring for cornet to trumpet is most likely to be that these pieces were more ambitious, composed for an orchestra rather than a band or small group. The trumpet writing in *Froissart* and *The Black Knight* could be considered as a natural development of the cornet writing in the music composed for the band of the Powick Asylum. The pitch of both the cornet and trumpet parts are the same, B flat/A and a key signature is used, or can be assumed to be used, in these works. The trumpet parts extend the range of the cornet parts by only a semitone, and the instrument required to perform all these parts would be valved: there are too many notes that could not be produced on a natural, or slide instrument. The trumpet parts contain chromatic passages and contribute to the melodic dialogue to a limited extent. The first cornet part in the Powick band music is far more melodic than the trumpet parts in the *Froissart* or *The Black Knight* but this is probably because there were fewer instruments in the band, and the cornet player was probably a regular member who could be relied upon to carry the melody line.

The trumpet parts in *The Light of Life* are different from the previous compositions. However, they do bear some resemblance to the writing in the much shorter work *Ecce Sacerdos magnus* in their sparsity and lack of melodic interest. Both these pieces are overtly religious; however, the trumpet is often made much use of in religious works by

other composers, due to its angelic associations. The lack of a key signature and the many changes to the pitch of the trumpet between movements in *The Light of Life* recalls the era of the natural trumpet. When the work changes key trumpeters playing the natural trumpet, which is capable of only playing the notes of the harmonic series, needed to change instrument, or insert a crook between the mouthpiece and the instrument, changing the overall length and, therefore, the pitch of the trumpet, to correlate with the new key of the music. As the key of the music and the instrument matched, parts for a natural trumpet were always notated in the key of C. This same principle was also used when writing horn parts, and as will be shown in Chapter Four, Elgar wrote his horn parts without a key signature for longer than his trumpet parts. Prout confirms the current convention concerning key signatures, stating: "the notation of the cornet differs from that of the horn and trumpet in the fact that the key-signature is always marked" (Prout 1898: 215).

The trumpet writing in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* is a development of the writing in *Froissart* and *The Black Knight*. In all these works, the trumpets are pitched in B flat/A, there is use of chromaticism and the trumpets contribute to the melodic argument. This style of trumpet writing is further developed in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* by the addition of a third part enabling new textures to be created and the use of mutes, at a variety of dynamic levels, adds to the timbral palette.

This comparison of the trumpet parts in *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* suggests they seem to be written for different instruments. The former uses an instrument in four different pitches whereas the latter in just two, and these pitches are completely different from those of the former. In addition, there are contrasts in the use of chromaticism and melodic engagement; the trumpet parts of *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* are much more melodic and chromatic, whereas *The Light of Life* uses the

trumpets mainly in a harmonically supporting role. The one similarity is that neither uses a key signature, whereas in all his previous works Elgar writes the trumpet and cornet parts with a key signature. These contradictions lie at the heart of this thesis.

It is well documented that Elgar worked on *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* in parallel. Jerrold Northrop Moore describes how in the summer of 1896 Elgar had a tent erected in his garden to accommodate the many pages of manuscript required to work on both works without disturbance, and details the chronological order of work. The vocal score of *King Olaf* was completed in February and the vocal score of *The Light of Life* in April, though some revisions of both were undertaken later. The orchestration of *The Light of Life* was completed on 20 June and the orchestration of *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* commenced two days later (Moore 1984: 212-213). This description offers no explanation as to the difference in the trumpet writing in these two works.

However, the concert programmes for the first performances of *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* do provide an explanation to these contrasts in the trumpet writing in the two works. The concert programme for the Three Choirs Festival of 1896 indicates that the trumpet section employed was led by Walter Morrow (ex.9.2 in Appendix 9).³² Elgar had known Morrow prior to 1896, as shown in the concert programme from the previous Worcester meeting of the Three Choirs Festival, in 1893, which lists them both as members of the orchestra.³³ Morrow had also been a member of the orchestra at the two intervening festivals held at Hereford, in 1894, and Gloucester, in 1895, but he was not the principal trumpet on these occasions. Morrow announced his advocacy for the valved F trumpet, the instrument for which *The Light of Life* is scored,

³² A list of the trumpeters performing in the first performances of Elgar's work is included in Appendix 4. The list was compiled from concert programmes held at the Elgar Birthplace Museum.

³³ All concert programmes referred to in this chapter are held at the Elgar Birthplace Museum.

during a lecture he presented to the Musical Association on 11 June 1895 entitled “The Trumpet as an Orchestral Instrument”. The transcript of this lecture shows that Morrow had given much thought, over the years, as to which instrument was the best for the performance of the orchestral repertoire, with the finest tone quality. He informs his audience how he frequently discusses the relative merits of the various instruments of the time with different people, and also states: “I shall now say a few words about writing for the trumpet … as I am sometimes consulted on this subject by young composers” (Morrow 1895: 143). Morrow advocates scoring for the F trumpet, stating “if parts are written for that instrument much will be done to encourage its use.” He also mentions changing the pitch of the F trumpet to D, C, E flat, B flat and A by the addition of crooks commenting “it could very well be done away with” (Morrow 1895:144). The inclusion of crooks with an F trumpet by the manufacturer was a practice carried over from the making of natural and slide trumpets (described in Chapter One), neither of which were fully chromatic instruments. The F trumpet was a fully chromatic instrument, capable of playing all the notes written for these different pitched trumpets; consequently the use of crooks was unnecessary. However, a trumpeter not using crooks would need to learn to transpose, in order to realise parts for an instrument pitched in a different key (Morrow comments on the subject of transposition in one of his tutor-books described in Chapter Six).

Morrow is not listed as a member of the orchestra for the first performance of *Froissart* at the Worcester meeting of the Three Choirs Festival, in 1890 (Ex.9.1 in Appendix 9), or the first performance of *The Black Knight*, in 1893, given by the Worcester Festival Choral Society, which is not part of the Three Choirs Festival. The musicians were more locally based for the Worcester Festival Choral Society concert, with Elgar listed as leader, his father in the second violins and his brother playing principal oboe. The trumpeters were W. Moore and J. Gardner, and it is indicated in the concert programme for the performance

that Gardner was a member of the society. Moore performed in many concerts in both Worcester and Malvern in the 1890s and in one concert on 24 January 1893 held in the Public Hall, Worcester, entitled “Mr Leonard G. Winters Second Grand Evening Concert”, Mr W. Moore is listed as coming from Birmingham. Elgar is listed also as the leader of the orchestra at that concert.

Comparing these archival records provides an answer as to why Elgar wrote the trumpet parts of *The Light of Life* for the valved F trumpet, the instrument that would have been crooked down to E flat, D and C. The evidence strongly suggests that Elgar scored the trumpet parts with Walter Morrow in mind, and Elgar may have been one of the young composers who had consulted Morrow about writing for the trumpet. There is evidence of an ongoing relationship between Morrow and Elgar after 1896. Correspondence dated 25 September 1898 from August Manns to Elgar implies that Elgar held Morrow in high regard. From Manns’ reply it seems Elgar had asked him to include Morrow in the orchestra for a performance of an Elgar March.³⁴ Further correspondence from Morrow to Elgar in 1903 is described in Chapter Four when *The Apostles* is discussed, which provides evidence of Elgar’s ongoing relationship with Morrow, that he knew of Morrow’s interest in different trumpets, and that Morrow had a collection of trumpets.

An explanation as to why Elgar reverted back to the B flat/A trumpet for *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* is also provided by the concert programme for that first performance in Hanley (Ex.9.3 in Appendix 9). The local paper, the *Staffordshire Sentinel*, in its edition of Wednesday 28 October 1896, states: “the band then, as now, comprised the pick of the London players”. However, that report was erroneous as regards the trumpet section for the 1896 North Staffordshire Musical Festival. The trumpeters were not from London, but

³⁴ A copy of this letter is included as Appendix 10.

from Birmingham. Listed in the programme as the trumpet section are J. Freeman, principal, W. Moore and D. G. Rabjohns. Freeman and Rabjohns are listed in the Corfield directory of Birmingham players, described in Chapter One. Moore was probably the same player who had played in many of the concerts in and around Worcester and in the first performance of *The Black Knight* in 1893. He is not listed in Corfield, but that directory was published in 1903, and he may have retired, or even have died by then. This theory is corroborated by the band list for the Worcester Festival Choral Society for their concert of 2 February 1897 in which Moore was replaced by a Mr Pearce, after playing for the society for at least the previous six years.

Joseph Freeman was listed as the trumpet teacher at the Midland Institute, Birmingham at the turn of the twentieth century, and was a member of a well-known musical family. Corfield lists four instrumentalists with the surname Freeman, three of which live at the same address, 77 Wakeman Road, Balsall Heath, Birmingham. They were J. Freeman (cornet and trumpet), H. Freeman (violin and clarinet) and C. E. Freeman (cornet and cello). A concert programme from the Halfords Choral Society of 21 January 1902 indicates that C. E. Freeman may have been the son of Joseph Freeman. The orchestra list shows a Mr Freeman in the trumpet section and a Mr Freeman Jnr. in the cornet section. Brownlow gives further information regarding Joseph Freeman, “solo trumpet in Birmingham Festival and Halfords Concerts ... Grandfather of R. Walton (first principal trumpet of Royal Philharmonic at its formation by Sir Thomas Beecham” (Brownlow 1996: 234). The musical instrument museum at the Royal College of Music displays Richard (Bob) Walton’s Olds Recording trumpet that he used in the last years of his career. The caption states that Walton was the grandson of Joseph Freeman “a well-known slide trumpet player in the Midlands and the North”.

The analysis of the trumpet writing in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* demonstrates that the parts could only have been played on a valved instrument. The workshop records of Boosey & Co. indicate that few B-flat trumpets had been made by 1896, so it is unlikely that the three players from Birmingham playing in that first performance each owned such a rare instrument. In all probability Freeman, Rabjohns and Moore played their parts on the cornet. The use of the cornet as a substitute for the trumpet was well known, and probably nationwide, at the time. The letter from August Manns, the conductor of the Crystal Palace concerts in London, to Elgar in August 1896, referred to earlier, concerning Elgar's advocacy for employing Morrow, also indicates how trumpet parts were played on the cornet when Manns states: "My principal cornettist is a first class player and plays all the trumpet parts on cornett [sic]." This further corroborates both the analysis of the work of the Hallé Orchestra, undertaken in Chapter Two, which concluded that works whose trumpet parts required a fully chromatic instrument were performed on the cornet, and the statement of Algeron Rose, also quoted in Chapter Two, concerning how trumpet parts were being played on the cornet.

The evidence leads to the conclusion that the difference in the trumpet writing in the two works composed simultaneously in 1896 is that Elgar knew who would be playing the trumpet parts in their respective first performances. Elgar, with his many local contacts and associations, knew that Morrow would be the leading the section in Worcester. From Morrow's recently published talk to the Musical Association, Elgar would have been aware of Morrow's advocacy for the valved F trumpet, and he may have previously talked with Morrow about the trumpets that were available. As a consequence Elgar wrote the trumpet parts for a valved F trumpet crooked down to E flat, D and C for some movements. From the Corfield directory the evidence is such that although Freeman is listed as a trumpeter, the other player, Rabjohns, is only listed as a cornettist, and it can be assumed that Moore,

who was probably at the end of his career, would have played the cornet as well. The trumpet that Freeman is listed as playing in Corfield was probably the slide instrument, the instrument that was used for performances of *Messiah*, as stated at the Royal College of Music exhibition. Freeman, in all probability, would have used the cornet to perform works not possible on the slide trumpet.

This evidence linking the orchestral personnel in the first performances of Elgar's works, up to and including 1896, with the trumpet writing, shows that Elgar was reflecting the differing developments in trumpet playing occurring in the 1890s. Walter Morrow, a leading London-based trumpeter was advocating the use of the F trumpet, which, being the same overall length as the slide trumpet produced a similar quality of sound. (The sound qualities of the F trumpet is discussed in Chapter Seven and is demonstrated on the accompanying CD.) The players in the Midlands used the cornet as their main instrument with a small number (seven in the Corfield directory) also playing the trumpet, and this trumpet was probably a slide instrument used mostly to perform the ever-popular works of Handel.

Conclusions

During the 1870s and 1880s Elgar developed as a composer from short chamber works, through dances for a band of mixed instruments, to a religious work for chorus and orchestra. He initially scored for cornets, but changed to trumpets when he composed for orchestra.

From 1890 to 1896 Elgar flourished as a composer; his pieces increased in both length and complexity, and he gained recognition nationwide. With the exception of one work,

The Light of Life, Elgar's writing for trumpet developed from that of his cornet writing in the previous decade with both instruments being pitched in B flat/A. Elgar treated the trumpet as a fully chromatic instrument, gave it a role in the melodic argument, made some use of mutes and until 1896 wrote the trumpet parts using a key signature. In Chapter One, it was concluded that there were few B-flat trumpets available in the 1890s; consequently it is probable that the trumpet parts in all these works were most often performed on the cornet.

Elgar had a completely different trumpet in mind when he composed *The Light of Life*, the valved F trumpet. This was the first time he had scored for this instrument and the trumpet writing is sparse, much less than in his previous works. Elgar did not make full use of the instrument's capabilities; the trumpet writing in *The Light of Life* resembles the writing of previous generations of composers for the natural or slide trumpet, even adopting their practice of writing trumpet parts without a key signature. It was the influence of Walter Morrow, a London-based trumpeter and the principal trumpet at the first performance of *The Light of Life*, that most probably caused Elgar to make these changes to the trumpet he specified, and the way he wrote for it.

Morrow was not involved in the first performance of *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*; the members of the trumpet section were all Birmingham-based. Elgar reverts to writing for the B-flat/A trumpet and his way of writing for these trumpets is related to that in *Froissart* and *The Black Knight*. However, a development in the trumpet writing can be seen with the trumpet section increased from two to three players, and the practice of not using a key signature first seen in *The Light of Life*, is continued.

In conclusion, the variety and development in Elgar's trumpet writing is closely related to the individual trumpeters he worked with at the time. The next chapter looks at Elgar's trumpet writing in the works from 1897 to the end of his career. Through an analysis of the trumpet writing in each major work I will seek to identify: the increase in the technical demands made upon the players, the use of the trumpet in innovative ways, the incorporation into the writing of new developments in the design of the trumpet, and any perceived influences of trumpeters of the day.

Chapter Four

Elgar's compositions from 1897

In the previous chapter it was shown that Elgar's trumpet writing up to and including 1896 displays diversity, particularly in the two major works composed that year – *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*. This chapter investigates whether the trumpet writing in the compositions of 1897 onwards, including his major works, becomes more consistent. Some answers emerge from a comparison of the key features of the trumpet writing in these works, and of the circumstances of their composition and first performance: many of these works were written for specific occasions such as provincial musical festivals. Elgar also wrote shorter works and accepted commissions for music to accompany theatrical productions; a comparison will therefore be made between his writing in these works with that of the major works.

This chapter is arranged in the chronological order of Elgar's major compositions followed by an analysis of the trumpet writing in his theatre music. The first section looks at the works composed between 1897 and 1900. The second section looks at the works in which Elgar scored for both trumpets and cornets, around 1901; an analysis of these works illuminates Elgar's thoughts regarding scoring for each instrument. The next section analyses the trumpet writing in the final two oratorios, first performed in 1903 and 1906, and the fourth section is an analysis of the trumpet writing in the symphonic works. The fifth section is a description of the trumpet writing in the two concertos composed in the latter half of Elgar's career and also refers to the two orchestral song cycles. The final section is a survey of the trumpet writing in the music he composed to accompany

theatrical productions. And so, why did Elgar vary his trumpet writing during these years? The following analysis leads to answers that are both musical and pragmatic.

Elgar's compositions from 1897 to 1900

This section examines the trumpet writing during a period of Elgar's career when he displays great diversity in scoring, using the F trumpet, the B-flat trumpet and the B-flat cornet in various combinations.

During 1897, the year after Elgar composed *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*, he wrote two shorter works, *Imperial March* and *The Banner of St. George*, at the request of his publisher, Novello, to celebrate Queen Victoria's Diamond Jubilee. These works are of interest because they shed light on the direction in which Elgar was moving after the diversity in trumpet scoring seen in *The Light of Life* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*.

The *Imperial March*, completed in January 1897, is a short work lasting approximately six minutes. It is scored for a large orchestra including three trumpets in B flat, the parts of which are, curiously, written with a key signature. The three trumpet parts are often used to provide three-part harmony and have much of the melodic argument in the faster outer sections. Overall, the trumpets are mainly used in the louder passages, and in the quieter middle section they only sparingly add harmonic support. There is some use of chromaticism and rapid tonguing techniques, and the range of the trumpet parts is from a flat to g", in concert pitch.

The second work, *The Banner of St. George*, was completed in March 1897. This is a more substantial work than *Imperial March*, written for choir and full orchestra, lasting approximately thirty minutes. Elgar provided two different orchestrations for this work, a version for full orchestra and another for a reduced orchestra, but both scores indicate cornets rather than trumpets. This scoring for cornets instead of trumpets is highly unusual: Elgar had specified trumpets rather than cornets since 1888 when he composed *Ecce Sacerdos magnus*. However, in Chapter Three it was suggested that the trumpet parts in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* were actually performed on the cornet, and the style of the cornet writing in *The Banner of St. George* is similar to the trumpet writing in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*. Both pieces are scored for instruments pitched in B flat/A. The cornets in *The Banner of St. George* contribute to the melodic argument, and there is some use of chromaticism. Multiple tonguing techniques are used and a wide range of dynamics are required, with a notable quiet solo for the first cornet, supporting the sopranos of the chorus (after rehearsal letter H). However, unlike the trumpet parts in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*, these cornet parts use a key signature.

Why did Elgar change from writing for trumpets in *Imperial March* to cornets in *The Banner of St. George*? The most probable reason for this change of instrument from trumpet to cornet was that Elgar was considering an alternative, reduced orchestration version as he composed the work, rather than as an after-thought. A note in the vocal score states “The instrumentation from this work has been so arranged by the composer that a small orchestra (string quintet, flute, oboe, clarinet, bassoon, two horns, two cornets, trombone, and drums) will be effective.” The reduced orchestra is similar in size to the Powick Lunatic Asylum Band he had conducted in the previous decade, and it is also probably the size of many of the smaller bands that existed nationwide. These smaller bands and orchestras

would have used cornets rather than trumpets, and the publishers appear to be aiming at the widest possible market.

Elgar's first major work after 1896 was the cantata *Caractacus*, commissioned for the Leeds Musical Festival. The first performance was in Leeds Town Hall on 5 October 1898, conducted by the composer. It is an extensive work, comprising six scenes and lasting approximately 100 minutes.³⁵ Elgar enlarges the trumpet section, compared to his earlier works, to four players. However, he evidently wanted to use an even larger section of six trumpeters, and Anderson and Moore make the illuminating comment that he reduced "the number to 4 only because he doubted the possibility of finding players with the requisite sensitivity" (Anderson and Moore 1985: vi). This is further corroboration of the argument in Chapter One, that few professional trumpeters were performing during this period. The trumpeters named in the concert programme of the first performance are led by Walter Morrow, with the rest of the section comprising F. A. Backwell, F. G. Champs and J. Solomon (see Appendix 13.1). As with previous works in which Morrow is expected to lead the trumpet section, Elgar scores for the F trumpet.

The four F trumpet parts occasionally crook into E and no key signature is used. However, the nature of the writing is more closely related to the writing in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*, scored for the B flat/A instrument, rather than *The Light of Life*. The trumpets partake in the melodic argument, particularly in the 'Triumphal Procession'; and there is some chromatic writing, and some use of triple tonguing. The range of the parts spans two octaves and a tone from *g* to *a''*. An interesting aspect of the orchestration is the use of trumpets in two pairs, similar to the two-plus-two disposition of parts in the modern scoring for four horns, with parts one and three pitched higher than two and four (Ex.12.1

³⁵ *Caractacus* is scored for soprano, tenor, baritone and two bass soloists, chorus and large orchestra.

Caractacus - “Rome The Triumphal Procession” in Appendix 12). In addition, Elgar uses the interweaving of the lines between the pairs of trumpets to produce a continuous musical phrase. A good example of this is the *Molto Largamente* after figure 52 in Scene 1 (Ex.12.2 *Caractacus* - “British Camp on the Malvern Hills – Night” in Appendix 12).

F trumpets are again used in the *Variations for Orchestra on an Original Theme*, usually known as the “*Enigma Variations*”, composed in 1899. This was Elgar’s first substantial orchestral work since *Froissart* in 1890. The three trumpet parts are written without a key signature, and the pitch range of the parts is over two octaves from *g* to *b’flat*. There are significant chromatic passages, some involvement in the melodic argument particularly in the finale, and fast, technically challenging passagework. This style of writing for the F trumpet in *Variations for Orchestra* is similar to the writing for the B-flat trumpet in both *Froissart* and *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*. However, the writing is more fragmented, the trumpets usually playing for just a few bars at a time; this fragmentation also matches the writing for the woodwind. The trumpets often play in three-part chords, which contrasts with the way Elgar scores for four players in *Caractacus* (Ex.12.3 “*Variations for Orchestra 1*” in Appendix 12). There is further evidence of development in Elgar’s trumpet writing from that of *Caractacus* in the many entries in *Variations for Orchestra* at dynamic levels of *pp*, or even *ppp*. In one of the few extended passages for the brass, from rehearsal figures 79 to 81, the trumpets, horns, trombones and tuba play a sustained, loud passage which requires multiple breaths. By dovetailing the parts, Elgar solves the problem of maintaining a sustained tone from the trumpets (Ex.12.4 “*Variations for Orchestra 2*” in Appendix 12). By allowing his trumpeters plenty of opportunities to breathe, Elgar demonstrates his understanding of brass playing.

The *Variations for Orchestra* was Elgar's first major work premiered in London on 19 June 1899 and was conducted by Hans Richter. The trumpeters listed in the concert programme were G. Jaeger, W. Morrow, and J. Solomon, with no player identified as the principal. Morrow and Solomon are the trumpeters identified previously as associated with Elgar, but Jaeger is a new name. However, a G. Jaeger was identified earlier, playing principal trumpet in the Hallé Orchestra from 1872 to 1898. Given that Jaeger is an uncommon surname in England,³⁶ it is safe to assume that both these G. Jaegers are the same person and he had moved to London after leaving the Manchester-based orchestra in 1898, the year before Richter became conductor of the Hallé. The Richter/Jaeger relationship continues for another year but, as was shown in Chapter Two, by 1901 Jaeger had either died or left the country.

For the Birmingham Triennial Festival of 1900 Elgar composed the large-scale oratorio, *The Dream of Gerontius*.³⁷ Richter conducted the first performance and the trumpet section listed in the concert programme is the same as in the premiere of the *Variations for Orchestra* the previous year: Jaeger (listed as principal on this occasion), Morrow and Solomon. This is further corroboration of the theory that Elgar scored for F trumpet when Morrow was playing in the orchestra and indicates that both Jaeger and Solomon also played the F trumpet.

The scoring is for three F trumpets, plus an optional extra three F trumpets used for one of the most dramatic moments in the work (after rehearsal figure 118), when God glances upon the Soul. Parts 1 and 2 of these three additional trumpets double orchestral trumpet

³⁶ It is not known if G. Jaeger was any relation to A. Jaeger who worked for Novello and was the person musically described in the "Nimrod" variation in *Enigma Variations*.

³⁷ *The Dream of Gerontius* is scored for mezzo-soprano, tenor and bass soloists, chorus, semi-chorus and large orchestra, and lasts for over 100 minutes.

one, and the third additional trumpet doubles orchestral trumpet 2. Elgar's trumpet writing in this work displays continuity from the writing in *Variations for Orchestra*, with many quiet entries, and the trumpets are asked to play with the widest dynamic range, from *ppp* to *fff*. The increasing technical challenge is demonstrated by the highest pitch Elgar has called for so far, *b''*, and the trumpet parts also descend to *a*. The high *b''* pitch is used extensively and is even more challenging after rehearsal figure 132, when it is to be played quietly in a thinly scored texture. Evidently aware of its difficulty, Elgar provides the option of playing the note an octave lower. The trumpet writing displays much variety in texture, ranging from effective three-part harmony to three contrapuntal lines. The trumpet timbre is enhanced and given greater prominence in the orchestral texture by the doubling, and sometimes trebling, of the first trumpet line.

These three works (*Caractacus*, *Enigma Variations* and *The Dream of Gerontius*) demonstrate a considerable development in Elgar's trumpet writing. In his only previous work scored for the F trumpet, *The Light of Life*, the writing is sparse, with the trumpets used mostly as harmonic and timbral support, and little use is made of the instrument's chromatic capability. Through the three works discussed above, Elgar gains in confidence when scoring for the F trumpet. He calls for a wider dynamic range, allows the trumpets more involvement in the melodic argument, uses a much greater degree of chromaticism, and experiments with the different timbres created by the use of three and four trumpet parts.

The works scored for both trumpets and cornets

Elgar scored for two trumpets and two cornets in only four works. The concert overture *Cockaigne* and the first two of the *Pomp and Circumstance Marches*, all composed in

1901, are scored for two F trumpets and two cornets in A; the third *Pomp and Circumstance March*, composed in 1904, is scored for two B-flat trumpets and two B-flat cornets. Given that Elgar was using F trumpets for his two major works in 1899 and 1900, why does he add two cornets to the orchestra? Furthermore, does Elgar write differently for cornets as opposed to trumpets?

One possible reason for the addition of cornets to the orchestra is Elgar's change of publisher; *Cockaigne* and all of the *Pomp and Circumstance Marches* were published by Boosey & Co.³⁸ In Chapter One, reference to the workshop records of the instrument-making division of Boosey & Co. informed the discussion regarding the available instruments in the later nineteenth century. In addition to the manufacturing business, Boosey & Co. was a major publishing house, and a substantial proportion of these publications were compositions and arrangements for bands in which the cornet was a key instrument, as discussed in Chapter Three.

Cockaigne and the first two *Pomp and Circumstance Marches* composed in 1901 were written for different people, and different places. The concert overture *Cockaigne* is subtitled "In London Town", and Elgar dedicates the work "To my many friends, the members of British Orchestras". It was first performed on 20 June 1901 at a Philharmonic Society Concert in London, conducted by the composer. There are two points of interest in the orchestra personnel list from that concert. Firstly, the trumpet section is led by Morrow. This concurs with the earlier stated argument that Elgar scores for the F trumpet when Morrow is playing in the orchestra. Secondly, although *Cockaigne* is scored for two trumpets and two cornets, there are no cornet players on the orchestra list for this first

³⁸ Novello had been Elgar's publisher of major works up to 1901. Even though Elgar had built a close relationship with Augustus Jaeger (1860-1909), an employee of Novello, there was a dispute between composer and publisher in the early years of the twentieth century regarding royalties and fees.

performance, just four trumpeters (the rest of the section being J. Solomon, F. A. Backwell and J. Lloyd Simon - see Appendix 13.2). In contrast to the Philharmonic Society, the Liverpool Orchestral Society was an amateur organisation which was “strengthened” by members of the Hallé Orchestra (Kelly 2013: 28) Their conductor, Alfred Edward Rodewald (1862-1903), was a cotton merchant by trade and was introduced to Elgar two years previously by Granville Bantock (1868-1946), when Elgar conducted a concert of his own music at New Brighton, on the Wirral peninsula (Kelly 2013: 57). The two marches were first performed on 19 October 1901 in St. George’s Hall, Liverpool, conducted by Elgar.

Pomp and Circumstance March No.1 is dedicated to Rodewald and the Liverpool Orchestral Society.³⁹

The first two *Pomp and Circumstance Marches* and *Cockaigne* demonstrate that Elgar wrote in different styles for F trumpets and cornets and it would, therefore, be useful to discuss the scoring of these works together. There are two features of the trumpet parts that are reminiscent of the writing for the natural trumpet: the F trumpet parts are written without a key signature, and there are many passages where the trumpets are scored in octaves. This contrasts with the cornet parts which are written with a key signature, and a variety of intervals are used between the two parts. Both trumpet and cornets are written with a wide dynamic range, although the trumpets are allocated the majority of the quiet entries. The cornet parts are technically more challenging and chromatic. Both trumpets and cornets are given a share of the melodic argument, but the cornets get the greater share, although the trumpets are often called upon to play the quieter melodies. The ranges of the trumpet and cornet parts are similar. For example, in *Cockaigne* the trumpet parts have a range of two octaves and a tone, from *a-flat* to *b-flat*”, and the cornet parts two octaves and a semitone, from *a-flat* to *a*”. Elgar wrote the significant comment in the

³⁹ *Pomp and Circumstance March No.2* is dedicated to Bantock.

score “the cornetti must not be prominent” at rehearsal figure 39 in *Cockaigne*. This comment, coupled with the observation that most of the quiet playing is given to the trumpets, implies that compared to trumpets, cornets may have played loudly, to such an extent that the balance of the orchestra was affected.

When Elgar scores for two trumpets and two cornets the positioning of the trumpet and cornet parts in chordal writing is of interest; his usual spacing from high to low is: trumpet 1, cornet 1, cornet 2 and trumpet 2; a good example of this is in *Cockaigne* at rehearsal figure 17. There is a timbral reason for the trumpets having the highest and lowest sounds in that their sound is the brighter, and defines the range of the chord better than the mellower sound of the cornet.⁴⁰ Berlioz, whose *Treatise on Instrumentation* Elgar was known to possess (as explained in Chapter Three), also advocates the use of trumpets with cornets stating: “most of our orchestras provide the composer with only two trumpets and two cornets … the latter can play all intervals, and their timbre is not so dissimilar from that of the trumpets that they could not blend with them sufficiently in the ensemble” (Berlioz 1844: 282).

The number of bars each instrument is given to play is similar in each of these pieces; *Cockaigne* is 359 bars in length with the trumpets playing in 100 bars, and the cornets in 107 bars. Overall, there is no evidence that Elgar favours either the trumpet or the cornet, but his scoring for each can be taken as a reflection of his thoughts regarding both the capabilities of each instrument and, perhaps, of their respective players.

The year 1904 brought a change in Elgar’s writing; the *Pomp and Circumstance March No. 3* in C minor, composed in that year, is scored for two B-flat trumpets and two B-flat

⁴⁰ Chapter Seven explores the timbral differences between trumpets and cornets.

cornets with all parts written with a key signature. The distinction between the trumpet and cornet parts is much less clear than in the first two marches. The technical requirements and musical content are similar and the second cornet sometimes has the lowest note in four-part chords. The first trumpet has the highest-pitched notes of the four parts except at the end, where it is the first cornet that is required to ascend to c'' . In 1907, for the fourth *Pomp and Circumstance March*, Elgar writes only for three trumpets in A with no cornets, even though this march is closely related in structure and style to the first *Pomp and Circumstance March*, and a key signature is used. The fifth *Pomp and Circumstance March* is a late work, first performed in 1930, and is scored for three trumpets in B flat. In all these works the trumpet parts could only have been realised on a valved instrument.

There is further development in Elgar's trumpet writing evident in the concert overture *In the South (Alassio)*, composed during and after a winter holiday in Italy. The first performance of this substantial, twenty-minute work for full orchestra was given in May 1904. Elgar increases the number of trumpets to three, specifies B-flat trumpets, and uses a key signature. There is much use of three-part chordal writing in the trumpet parts reminiscent of the writing in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf* but the timbre of the three trumpet parts in unison is also used, particularly to emphasise the trumpets engagement in the melodic argument. The trumpet parts contain passages requiring multiple-tonguing techniques, the pitch range is two octaves and a semitone, from a to b'' flat, and there are some wide intervallic leaps written in all parts increasing the technical challenge to the trumpeters.

The final oratorios - *The Apostles* and *The Kingdom*

Elgar composed a large-scale oratorio for the 1903 Birmingham Triennial Festival, *The Apostles*,⁴¹ and conducted the first performance on 14 October 1903. The overall festival conductor, Hans Richter,⁴² had been conductor of the Hallé Orchestra since 1899, and most of the players in the orchestra were members of the Hallé,⁴³ including three of the four trumpeters, identified in the programme as Valk, Bell and Taylor.

Three trumpets pitched in B flat are specified in the score of *The Apostles*. This is in contrast to Elgar's trumpet scoring in his previous two large-scale choral works when he scored for the F trumpet. However, in keeping with his previous scoring for F trumpet, Elgar does not make use of a key signature in the trumpet parts of *The Apostles*. There is evidence that Elgar was in doubt concerning which pitch of trumpet to specify, for Anderson and Kent note that in his manuscript Elgar "more than once wrote 3 Trombe in C changing them later to Bb" (Anderson & Kent 1983: commentary). The trumpet writing is varied in texture from unisons and octaves to two- and three-part chords. There is use of both double and triple tonguing, and mutes are effectively deployed. The trumpets are often used with the trombones and tuba, to produce an organ-like sound and the range of the trumpet parts is from *g* flat to *b*"flat. Due to the chromatic nature of the writing it is only possible to realise these trumpet parts on a valved instrument.

⁴¹ *The Apostles* is scored for soprano, alto, tenor and three bass soloists, chorus and large orchestra, and is approximately 90 minutes in duration.

⁴² The first performance of *The Dream of Gerontius* conducted by Richter, at the previous Birmingham Triennial Festival in 1900, was widely reported to have been disastrous and described by Byron Adams as "notoriously dishevelled" (Adams 2004: 87).

⁴³ The first orchestral rehearsal for the festival took place in Manchester on 5 October 1903.

In addition to the three trumpet parts, Elgar scores for a shofar in *The Apostles*. A shofar is an instrument of ancient origin, still used in Jewish worship in the synagogue. It is traditionally made from a ram's horn, and is capable of playing just two notes a major sixth apart. Elgar uses the 'call' produced on the shofar in the section of *The Apostles* that is an evocation of dawn. Extant correspondence from Elgar to Richter, preceded by correspondence from Morrow to Elgar (see Appendix 11), indicates that Walter Morrow was brought into the first performance specifically to play the shofar part on a trumpet. The part is exposed, and the correspondence between Morrow and Elgar concerns the instrument on which to perform these calls; evidently, Elgar was not expecting an actual shofar to be used. At the beginning of the score Elgar writes concerning the shofar "an extra trumpet representing the Shofar; the straight Trumpet should preferably be employed". Elgar wrote to Richter regarding Morrow's performance of the shofar part stating:

Mr Morrow would, always with your permission, bring his longest and SHINNIEST T_R_U_M_M_M_M_MPET_T_T_T!!!! [sic] Capable of producing the Shofar 'Call'. That is what I want." (Moore 2012: 154/155)

Elgar's letter to Richter also states that he assumed Valk would be playing principal trumpet. This suggests that as an extra trumpeter Morrow's performing career may have been drawing to a close; however, Birkemier may have been slightly premature when he suggests that Morrow retired from playing around 1902 (Birkemeir 1989: 42). As is probably the case with all professional musicians, retirement from performance is gradual, and in addition to his performance of the shofar part in 1903, Morrow is listed as a joint principal trumpet (with John Solomon) at the Leeds Musical Festival in October 1904. The scoring for B-flat trumpet in *The Apostles* nonetheless suggests that Morrow's influence on

Elgar was drawing to a close. As was shown in the previous chapter, and earlier in this chapter, when Morrow was in the orchestra Elgar scored for the F trumpet; *The Apostles* is the first work in which this statement does not apply. Furthermore, the scoring for the B-flat trumpet suggests that Valk, and the other Hallé trumpeters, played an instrument pitched in B flat and not the F trumpet.

The Kingdom was composed for the next Birmingham Triennial Festival and was first performed on 3 October 1906, conducted by Elgar.⁴⁴ As in the first performance of *The Apostles* the orchestra was mostly Manchester-based, with the first rehearsal taking place in that city on 25 September 1906. The trumpet section for the festival comprised Valk and Caldwell, with Bell and Taylor listed as cornettists – this was the standard set-up for the trumpet/cornet section of the Hallé Orchestra that year, as discussed in Chapter Two. However, Elgar scores for three trumpet parts pitched mostly in B flat and one of the cornettists would have needed to play a trumpet part. A significant development can be seen in the trumpet writing: for the first time in an oratorio Elgar writes the trumpet parts in *The Kingdom* with a key signature. The trumpets often contribute to the melodic argument, and there are many passages at a quiet dynamic level. Rapid articulation is required, mutes are used, there is much chromatic writing in all three parts and the pitch range of the trumpet parts is two and a half octaves, from *f* to *b''*. An interesting orchestral effect is created after rehearsal figure 113 when all three trumpets support the horn/viola/cello line. This is a development of the orchestration seen earlier in *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*, where the trumpets double the viola line (see Chapter Three). However, the most interesting feature of the trumpet writing is the specified pitch of the instruments.

⁴⁴ The work is scored for soprano, alto, tenor and bass soloists, chorus (often subdivided), and a large orchestra, and is approximately 95 minutes in duration.

The trumpet parts are pitched in B flat, except for a high, loud, sustained passage from rehearsal figures 118 to 123, when Elgar indicates a change of instrument in the first trumpet part, from a trumpet pitched in B flat to a trumpet pitched in D, a major third higher (the availability of higher-pitched trumpets is discussed in Chapter One). Playing this passage on the physically smaller instrument in D would not only ease the demands on the performer, but would inevitably improve the reliability of execution. The direction in the first trumpet part to change instruments from a B-flat trumpet to the shorter D trumpet for a particularly high passage is extremely unusual. Elgar may have been the first composer to write in this way. The high D trumpet was used by Stravinsky in 1913 in *The Rite of Spring*, and later by Ravel, but these were separate parts, whereas Elgar is here asking the trumpeter to change instrument in the middle of the piece. Mahler suggests a change of instrument in the last movement of Symphony No. 7 (1905), where the first trumpet part contains the direction “auf einem kleinen Piston” (on a small valved trumpet) from rehearsal figures 275 to 277,⁴⁵ but he does not specify the actual pitch of this ‘small piston’ and continues to notate the part as for F trumpet. The musical reason for Mahler’s suggested change to a smaller trumpet seems to be completely different to that of Elgar’s. The passage from 275–277 in the Seventh Symphony is marked *sempre pp*, is quite fragmentary, and is written in the middle and upper register. The most plausible explanation for Mahler’s request is that he wanted a small compact sound from the trumpet in this passage, which has something of a chamber-music quality. Chronologically, the next well-known work, to the author’s knowledge, that directs the first trumpet to actually change to a D trumpet for a high-pitched, loud passage is Stravinsky’s ballet *Petrushka* (1911) in the final scene.

⁴⁵ I am grateful to Paul Benistone, principal trumpet with the London Philharmonic Orchestra, for informing me of this direction in Mahler’s Symphony No.7.

The symphonic works

In Elgar's 'abstract' symphonic works, the Symphonies in A flat (1908) and E flat (1911), and the "Symphonic Study" *Falstaff* (1913), the writing for trumpet is consistent: in each of the works he writes for three B-flat trumpets, and always writes with a key signature.⁴⁶ The trumpet writing in these works can be seen as Elgar's mature position regarding how to write for the trumpet. The trumpet parts are technically challenging, with many chromatic passages, use of rapid tonguing techniques, and covering an extensive range. Elgar provides all three trumpeters with interesting parts to play, having short passages of independence and contributing to the melodic argument. The lines of the second and third parts often interweave, which not only produces a more satisfying melodic line for each player, but also lessens the number of difficult intervallic leaps, making the part easier to render with reliability. However, Elgar continues to use all the trumpets in unison when greater emphasis is required. There is much less use of the trumpets as harmonic support, particularly in the tonic/dominant role characteristic of classical writing for natural trumpets, and still seen in parts of *The Light of Life*. The trumpets are also required to add to the orchestral ensemble at all dynamic levels, contrasting with Elgar's earliest trumpet writing in, for example, *Froissart*. Although the trumpets are tacet in the slow movement of the Symphony in A flat it is the trumpet, playing in octaves with the trombones, that introduces the main theme of the slow movement of the Symphony in E flat; this is a quiet, sustained diatonic melody, marked *ppp* at the start and is six bars in length. This scoring is reminiscent of the melody enjoyed by the trumpets and trombones in No.16 of *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*. The trumpets are favoured further, in the slow movement of the Symphony in E flat, being given a new theme at rehearsal figure 76. This sustained,

⁴⁶ Horn parts had also traditionally been written without a key signature, for the same reason as the trumpets, and Elgar continued writing horn parts without key signatures for longer; the horn parts in the Symphony in A flat do not use a key signature, but in the Symphony in E flat they are written with a key signature.

loud melody is marked to be played *fortissimo*, but also *espressivo*.⁴⁷ The different timbres from the trumpets playing at all dynamic levels is further enhanced by the frequent use of mutes throughout these symphonic works.

Of particular note are the extremes of range. Low-sounding e flat is written in both the Symphony in E flat and *Falstaff*; this note is not within the normal range of a B-flat trumpet, the lowest note being e. The passage in *Falstaff* is particularly challenging as the e flat is at the end of a chromatic running passage encompassing 2 octaves and a perfect fifth.⁴⁸ The highest note required is c'' occurring at the end of last movement of the Symphony in A flat (although Elgar here allows an optional c'). Elgar's concerns regarding his technical demands in general, and range requirements in particular, are highlighted by an incident that occurred some years later, during his recording of the Symphony in E flat with the London Symphony Orchestra. Anderson and Moore provide the following report of the interaction between Elgar and the principal trumpet, Ernest Hall, in Hall's own words:

We had performed the Second Symphony with him [Elgar] the previous night, and were recording the next morning. During a break awaiting the engineer's verdict, he looked up at me and said, "Mr Hall, last night in the last movement of the Symphony, you held that high B natural over to the next bar, Why?" I was so stunned for the moment and replied, "Well, Sir Edward, I was so pleased to get it I didn't want to leave it. I am sorry and apologise." He replied, "Don't apologise, it is just what I wanted, but I was frightened to write it, in case it was too high to hold". I said, "Can I

⁴⁷ The lyrical style indicated by the marking *espressivo* is explored in Chapters Six and Seven.

⁴⁸ On the instruments available at the time one method of producing this low note is to 'lip' it down i.e. play a flat note with a loose embouchure. Alternatively, on an instrument equipped with a mechanism to change the overall key of the instrument from B flat to A, such as the rotary valve which the historic B-flat trumpet used on the recordings is equipped with, a strategic change to the lower key before the passage in question could be used to play the e flat, but, transposition up a semitone would be required for the part to sound in the correct key. This passage is demonstrated on the CD (Track 30), and is further discussed in Chapter Seven.

always play it that way?" and he said, "That is yours from now!" So I wrote it in my part. I am naturally very proud, and have honoured it ever since" (Anderson and Moore 1984: commentary). (Ex.12.5 'Symphony in E flat' in Appendix 12)

There is little continuity in the personnel of the trumpet sections that played in the first performances of these symphonic works. This is a significant indication that the B-flat trumpet had become the universally adopted instrument. When the Hallé Orchestra gave the first performance of the Symphony in A flat in Manchester on 3 December 1908, conducted by Richter, the trumpet/cornet section of the orchestra were Valk, Caldwell and Taylor (the trumpeters who played in the first performance of *The Kingdom*) and E. C. Pickerell, who had joined the orchestra that year. The Symphony in E flat was first performed in London by the Queen's Hall Orchestra, conducted by Elgar, on 24 May 1911. The trumpeters listed in the programme for the concert are F. L. Gyp, F. Armitage, F. R. Moore, W. L. Barraclough and J. L. Simon. The London Symphony Orchestra gave the first performance of *Falstaff* on 2 October 1913 at the Leeds Triennial Festival conducted by the composer. The trumpet section listed for the Festival was large consisting of 9 players, and they are named in the programme as J. Solomon(principal), F. G. James, E. Hall, S. Moxon, Mark Hemingway, J. L. Simon, A. Lister, A. Tomlinson and R. S. Kitchen. The number of trumpeters in the orchestra is much larger than at other festivals and concerts of the time, and included some more locally-based players. Hemingway and Tomlinson are listed as members of the Leeds Symphony Orchestra in previous concerts in the city.⁴⁹

⁴⁹ Robert Snowden Kitchen is listed in the 1911 census as owning a music shop in Leeds (www.vintagedrumforum.com accessed 18/09/16). The shop was still trading in the 1970s when the author was at school in the city.

The concertos for violin and for cello and orchestral song cycles

The trumpet parts in Elgar's two concertos and two orchestral song cycles do not present comparable challenges to those encountered in the symphonic works. The Concerto for Violin and Orchestra (1910) scores for only two trumpets pitched in B flat/A. There is some continuity from the symphonic scoring: the parts are written with a key signature, there is some use of chromaticism, a wide dynamic range is written, and a wide pitch-range is required, from *e* to *a''*. However, there is no use made of mutes, no rapid articulation and the trumpets have much less to play than in the symphonic works.

The often-subdued Concerto for Cello and Orchestra, composed in 1919 and Elgar's last completed large-scale work, makes only occasional use of the two trumpets, with a range of less than two octaves. It is nonetheless interesting to note that whilst the trumpet parts are written with key signatures, Elgar specifies trumpets pitched in C. This is the only major work Elgar scored for C trumpet, and the reasons for this are not clear. It is unlikely to be the trumpeters playing in the first performance of the Concerto for Cello and Orchestra that influenced the change in Elgar's specified instrument to the C trumpet. The orchestra for the first performances of both these concertos was the London Symphony Orchestra. Two positions in the trumpet section of the orchestra were stable between 1910 and 1919 with Solomon, who had played in many of Elgar's performances, as principal and Frank James; M. Lee left the orchestra in 1910 and Ernest Hall joined in 1911. Sydney Moxon, a member of the trumpet section from 1907, was killed in action at Ypres in 1916. There was a new recruit in 1919, G. Fenwick, who played with the orchestra until 1928. However, Elgar had been thinking of the C trumpet in the previous decade: it was noted earlier that Elgar considered using that instrument in *The Apostles* in 1903, but changed the score in favour of the B-flat instrument, and he also scored for trumpets in C in lesser

works, including *Polonia*, composed in 1915, and in one of his theatre pieces that are discussed in the following section.

The two orchestral song cycles were written thirteen years apart, *Sea Pictures* in 1899 and *The Music Makers* in 1912. Although the trumpet writing is sparse, particularly in *Sea Pictures* with the trumpets tacet in three of the five songs, it is related to that in his large-scale compositions written around those years. In *Sea Pictures* no key signature is used in the two trumpet parts pitched in A, but a key signature is used in the three B-flat trumpet parts in *The Music Makers*. The use of three trumpets in the latter work is probably due to Elgar quoting from some of his earlier compositions that did use three trumpets.

Theatre music

In addition to his orchestral music, choral and chamber works⁵⁰ Elgar wrote a substantial amount of music to be performed in conjunction with theatrical performances in the later part of his career. These works are not regarded as being as important as Elgar's major works discussed above. For example, Jerrold Northrop Moore describes the composition of *The Crown of India* (1912) as "a commercial project offered to pay for the move to Severn House" (Moore 1984: 627).⁵¹ However, for the purposes of this study the theatrical music is of interest, particularly when compared with the major works written at the same time.

⁵⁰ Elgar did not score for trumpet in his chamber compositions except for the earliest works described in Chapter Three.

⁵¹ Elgar had recently moved from a rented house in Hereford, purchasing Severn House in Hampstead, London.

The analysis here has shown that 1901 was the only year in which Elgar scored for both F trumpet and cornet in his major works, and it was the final year in which he scored for the F trumpet. In the autumn of that year the Irish author George Moore asked Elgar to compose the music for a theatrical production of his book *The Pursuit of Diarmuid and Gráinne*, which he was jointly developing with W. B. Yeats, for performance at the Gaiety Theatre, Dublin. Elgar agreed, but the resulting production of *Grania and Diarmid* contains only a small amount of music. Whilst no trumpets or cornets were apparently used,⁵² Elgar later made an arrangement for full orchestra of the funeral march composed for this play and published it the following year, 1902, as his Op. 42. Intriguingly, this full orchestra transcription includes parts for two trumpets in C. The trumpet writing in *Grania and Diarmid* is sparse, as may be expected when the original theatre production did not use trumpets, and is similar to the writing for different pitched trumpets in Elgar's other works at that time. A fully chromatic trumpet is required, there is some use of unison writing for emphasis, and no key signature is used. The scoring for C trumpet in this work is further corroboration of the conclusion that Elgar was considering writing for C trumpet around 1902/1903, when he was composing *The Apostles*.

Whilst I have shown that Elgar's change to scoring for the F trumpet in 1896 was influenced by the trumpeter Morrow, there is no comparable explanation for Elgar's interest in the C trumpet. On the contrary, it is doubtful that any trumpeter working in the United Kingdom in 1902/1903 possessed a C trumpet, as was discussed in Chapter One. Elgar may have been influenced to consider the C trumpet by other contemporary composers who were scoring for C trumpet at that time.⁵³

⁵² Correspondence between Moore and Elgar concerning the use of two horns in place of the two cornets, who were regular members of the Gaiety Theatre orchestra, is held at the Elgar Birthplace Museum under catalogue numbers 2325 and 2259.

⁵³ The next chapter analyses the trumpet scoring of Elgar's contemporaries.

Elgar's next substantial work for the theatre, *The Crown of India*, was composed in 1912 to celebrate the Indian Coronation of the new King and Queen. This entertainment was in the form of an Imperial Masque and the music is substantial, over an hour in duration, but it is not regarded as equal to Elgar's major works composed around this time, such as the Symphony in E flat (1911) or *Falstaff* (1913). J. P. E. Harper-Scott states: "In every movement Elgar used a crudely over-elaborate oriental "topic", essentially *Pomp and Circumstance* in a minor key" (Harper-Scott 2004: 172). However, as is fitting to such a work of celebration, there is extensive writing for trumpets. Elgar scored for three B-flat trumpets in the orchestra and four on-stage B-flat trumpets with parts as technically challenging as those in the major works. The parts are written with a key signature, as in the symphonic works around this time, and contain multiple tonguing techniques, trills, and the prominent use of mutes.

Elgar scored for the C trumpet in his short work *Polonia*, composed in 1915. This was the same year in which he composed his most substantial, and best known, music for a theatrical production, *The Starlight Express*. However, the trumpet scored for in this work follows Elgar's usual custom over the previous twelve years of being pitched in B flat. The trumpet writing is extensive with the range required ascending to the same high *b*" as the famous "Hall" note. The music moves through many different keys and an interesting feature of the trumpet parts is that they are always pitched in B flat. In many of Elgar's previous works, for example *Froissart*, when the music has modulated to a key using many sharps he changes the pitch of the trumpets to A (as explained in Chapter Three), but in *Starlight Express* he maintains the B flat pitch, even when writing with a key signature of six sharps.

Elgar does not score for the C trumpet in his remaining substantial theatre compositions.

The Sanguine Fan (1917) is music to a 15-minute ballet sequence and is scored for two B-flat trumpets. The two theatrical compositions of the 1920s, *King Arthur* (1923) and *Beau Brummel* (1928), are both scored for two B-flat cornets. The cornet was the more usual instrument in the theatre orchestras of the time, as is evidenced by their use in the Gaiety Theatre, Dublin.

The nature of Elgar's trumpet writing in his theatrical works matches that of the major works in the demands and techniques that are required. However, the chosen pitch of the trumpet does not always correlate with that of the major works.

Conclusions

From the above analysis it can be seen that Elgar was far from consistent in his trumpet writing for approximately ten years after 1896. The key of the instrument he scored for fluctuated, the use of a key signature was inconsistent, and the nature of his trumpet writing developed during this period. This contrasts markedly with Elgar's writing for the cornet which is consistent throughout his career, from the music he composed for the Powick Asylum Band to his final theatrical piece, *Beau Brummel*.

The F trumpet is only specified in the major compositions between 1896 and 1901. These works were either commissions from important provincial musical festivals and centres, or first performed at major concerts in London. Elgar, from his own experience as a violinist, concert-goer and conductor knew who the members of these orchestras would be. The extant correspondence between Elgar and Hans Richter, and Elgar and Augustus Manns, demonstrates Elgar's knowledge of, and advocacy for, Walter Morrow as a trumpeter. This

relationship is further corroborated by the correspondence between Morrow and Elgar.

Morrow's view that the F trumpet was the superior instrument was well known and publicised. When Morrow is playing in the orchestra Elgar scores for the F trumpet.

The writing in the works where both trumpets and cornets are scored for is revealing. The analysis demonstrates Elgar's understanding as to the strengths of each instrument. Elgar prefers to give fast technical and chromatic passages to the cornet; lyrical melodies are also allocated to that instrument, although if a more subtle approach is required it is scored for trumpet. The trumpet is the chosen instrument for quiet passages and for rapidly articulated passages of repeated notes. The reasons why Elgar scored for both trumpet and cornet for this short period may not be entirely clear, but the influence of Boosey & Co., the publisher of band music, may have been a major factor.

All Elgar's works composed from 1903 to the end of his career were written for the B-flat/A trumpet with the exception of the Cello Concerto which, with a few minor works composed in the previous seventeen years, was scored for C trumpet. The occasional choice of the C trumpet was probably influenced more by other contemporary composers than the trumpeters of the day. The changing of the pitch of the trumpet from B flat to A when the music was written in keys with many sharps was discontinued after the Violin Concerto, composed in 1912. This may have resulted from a recognition that trumpeters whom he knew were content to play in sharp keys. However, trumpets were manufactured pitched in B flat with a rotary change to A by Boosey and Co. in the 1920s.⁵⁴

⁵⁴ A Boosey & Co. B-flat/A trumpet manufactured in 1925 is used on the accompanying CD and is pictured in Appendix 16.

It was from 1906 that Elgar became decisive in the use of a key signature for the trumpet parts.⁵⁵ Elgar's cornet scoring always made use of key signatures.

Elgar's varied trumpet writing was a reflection of the changes occurring in the trumpet world at the time. However, Elgar came to use the valved B-flat trumpet to its fullest capability in his later symphonic works, and his instruction to change the pitch of the instrument in *The Kingdom* from B flat to D for a short, sustained passage in the upper register was uniquely innovative. This direction to change instruments is a key indicator that Elgar became, to some extent, a driver of change in the trumpet world. The late nineteenth century was the beginning of a renaissance for composers from the United Kingdom, which reached a zenith in the early twentieth century. The next chapter compares Elgar's practices in writing for the trumpet with some of his leading contemporaries.

⁵⁵ The reasons for the use, or absence, of a key signature are discussed in Chapter Three.

Chapter Five

Compositions by a selection of composers from the United Kingdom who were contemporary with Elgar

The detailed analysis of the trumpet writing of Elgar in the previous two chapters revealed how the instrument for which he scored changed during his career; how his way of writing for the trumpet went through a period of flux but then became generally consistent; how the technical demands he made upon trumpeters increased; and how he gave trumpeters an increasingly varied musical role. This chapter looks at the scoring for trumpet by composers from the United Kingdom who were Elgar's contemporaries. Does the trumpet writing of these composers corroborate, or contradict, the developments displayed in Elgar's writing?

The chapter is divided into three sections, although there is some chronological overlap between each of them. The first examines the trumpet parts in works by composers written prior to Elgar's first major work, *Froissart* (1890). Does the trumpet writing in these works accord with Elgar's style of writing in his earliest works? The second section concerns the trumpet writing in works by Elgar's contemporaries Gustav Holst and Frederick Delius, who died in the same year as Elgar, 1934. Are the changes as seen in the works of Elgar, both in the instrument written for, and in the nature of the writing, reflected in the works of Holst and Delius? The third section investigates the trumpet writing in works by two British composers, Ralph Vaughan Williams and William Walton, who were born after Elgar. Elgar's trumpet writing became more consistent from *In The South* (1904) and *The Kingdom* (1906) onwards; but do the contemporary works by Vaughan Williams match

those of Elgar in the writing for trumpet? Finally, are the developments seen in the writing of Elgar continued by later composers such as Walton? This chapter will also help to identify more precisely when writing for a valved instrument became the norm in British compositions, and when the F trumpet became, and ceased to be, the standard instrument for orchestral music of the period.

The trumpet writing in compositions before 1890

Hubert Parry (1848-1918) and Charles Villiers Stanford (1852-1924) were born nine and five years respectively before Elgar, but due to their more privileged backgrounds and education were, by 1890, significantly more advanced in their careers as composers. Parry, the son of a Gloucestershire squire, was educated at Eton, Oxford, and the Leipzig Conservatoire. He was later appointed Director of the Royal College of Music in 1894, and Professor of Music at Oxford University in 1900. Stanford, born in Dublin, was educated at Cambridge, the Leipzig Conservatoire, and privately in Berlin. He was appointed Professor of Music at Cambridge in 1887 and taught composition at the Royal College of Music from 1889 until his death. Both Parry and Stanford were established composers before 1890, and their trumpet scoring, in works completed prior to this date, compares interestingly with that of Elgar's in *Froissart*.

Stanford completed his third symphony, *The Irish Symphony*, in 1887. It was first performed in St James's Hall, London, on 27 June that year, conducted by Hans Richter. Tellingly, for the purposes of this study, the writing for the trumpets is not consistent between the four movements, except in the consistent absence of a key signature. In the first movement he scores for two trumpets in B flat and no key signature is used. The trumpets contribute little to the melodic argument and are used mostly as harmonic

support. There is little use of chromaticism and the intervals between the two parts are mostly those created between the lower notes of the harmonic series,⁵⁶ octaves, fifths and fourths. The trumpets are called upon to contribute in quieter passages, and are often used in combination with the trombones. In the second movement the key of the instrument changes to D, and again no key signature is used. The writing is sparse and is similar to that in the first movement. The trumpet parts in the third movement return to the B flat instrument, again without the use of a key signature. They add briefly to the melodic argument in a martial-like melody (at rehearsal letter T), but their role is mostly that of harmonic support, with much use of octaves between the parts. The trumpet writing in the fourth movement is different. It begins with two trumpets in B flat, without a key signature, but they take a much greater role in the melodic argument. They often move a third apart, as cornets do in band music. The key of the instrument changes to D and a third trumpet part in D is added when the Irish tune “Let Erin remember the days of old” is introduced. This is presented as a trumpet trio over a string pedal (Ex.14.1 “Irish Symphony Trumpet Trio” in Appendix 14). The tune’s harmonisation is diatonic and all three parts could be played on a slide trumpet with a small amount of “lipping” down, particularly on the third part. The writing resembles the trumpet trio in the *Academic Festival Overture* of Brahms composed in 1880, which is playable on natural trumpets with some “lipping” down of the *f*”, and would be ideally suited to performance on the slide trumpet. The trombones join the trumpets for the second half of this forty-bar section. The three trumpets then return to the key of B flat and are used extensively for the remainder of the symphony with some chromatic writing, and a reprise of “Let Erin remember the days of old” in the lower key of B flat. One further point of interest in this final section is the writing of a pedal B flat for the second trumpet, a note that is normally only heard in the cadenza of a trumpet concerto,

⁵⁶ See Appendix 1, an example and explanation of the harmonic series.

as a special effect.⁵⁷ The writing for B-flat trumpet through most of the symphony could only be realised on a valved instrument. A valved B-flat trumpet could also realise the first appearance of “Let Erin remember the days of old” in the key of D. However, as B-flat trumpets were a rare instrument in 1887 it is likely these parts were performed on the cornet. The trio for solo trumpets was scored for the D trumpet and it is probable that Stanford intended this to be played on the slide trumpet, as the sound quality of the cornet was regarded as inferior by many.⁵⁸

Parry completed his Symphony No.3 in 1889 with the subtitle *The English*. It was first performed in St James’s Hall, London, on 23 May that year, with the composer conducting. It is scored for a smaller orchestra than the Stanford, containing two trumpet parts, with the trombone parts only added for a later performance. The work is in four movements with the two trumpets pitched in C, in movements one and four, and in F in the third movement; the trumpets are tacet in the second movement. Key signatures are not used and the trumpet’s role is sparse, being mostly limited to giving harmonic support. These parts could be realised on the slide trumpet crooked in the appropriate key, apart from two notes, a’ flat and d’flat, which could be easily “lipped” down from a’ and d’ respectively, in a similar manner to that needed to perform Elgar’s later work *The Light of Life* (1896) on a slide trumpet, described in Chapter Three.

The trumpet writing of Stanford and Parry is dissimilar to that of Elgar in his *Froissart* (1890). Stanford and Parry do not use a key signature; Elgar does. Stanford and Parry change the pitch of the trumpet during the work; Elgar does not (apart from the usual B

⁵⁷ Wynton Marsalis (b.1961) incorporates this pedal note in his cadenza in the first movement of Haydn’s Trumpet Concerto.

⁵⁸ For example, Thomas Harper Jnr. who is quoted in the next chapter and George Bernard Shaw who is quoted later in this chapter.

flat/A change, described in Chapter Three). Stanford and Parry use the trumpet in some quieter passages; Elgar rarely does. Apart from the last movement of the Stanford, the trumpets contribute little to the melodic argument in the Stanford and the Parry symphonies; in *Froissart* the trumpets are integral to the melodic argument.

The stark differences between the writing of Elgar and that of Parry and Stanford can be explained by looking at the circumstances of their composition and performance. Parry and Stanford were approaching the height of the music profession, working in London and the major university cities. Both the symphonies analysed were first performed in St. James's Hall, London, by an orchestra that doubtless consisted of the finest of London's instrumentalists. Thomas Harper Jnr. was still active as a teacher in leading institutions and his advocacy for the slide trumpet was well known. The Parry symphony could be performed on the slide trumpet with some minor "lipping" of notes. The evidence suggests that in the Stanford symphony, the prominent trumpet trio introducing "Let Erin remember the days of old", in the last movement, was to be played on the slide trumpet, although much of the rest of the symphony was probably played on the cornet. The slide trumpet would have been a rarity in the Worcester that Elgar knew, compared to the cornet, with its use probably confined to performing the obbligati of Handel, as is evidenced by a concert programme from 23 March 1889 for a performance of *Messiah* in Malvern, described in Chapter Two. This includes two cornettists and one trumpeter, with Elgar himself leading the orchestra. In *Froissart* and *The Black Knight*, Elgar was writing with the cornet in mind. Cornet parts use a key signature and the instrument is fully chromatic, which helps them to contribute to the melodic argument, but the sound was considered to be inferior to that of the trumpet. George Bernard Shaw described the substitution of the trumpet with a cornet as "a musical fraud, and a deplorable one ... We have had quite enough of the attempts of

cornet players to produce genuine trumpet effects" (Shaw 1885, reproduced in Laurence 1981 vol.1: 323-324).

It was in the decade between 1896 and 1906 that Elgar's writing for trumpet developed.

The next section looks at compositions by two of his younger contemporaries. Is Elgar's approach to trumpet writing mirrored in the writing of these composers?

The trumpet writing in works by Holst and Delius

Frederick Delius and Gustav Holst were born five and seventeen years after Elgar respectively but all three composers died in the same year, 1934. Even though Delius and Holst were contemporaries, their backgrounds, musical education, careers and style of composition were very different from each other, and from that of Elgar.

Born in 1862 in Bradford, Yorkshire, Delius was the child of a wealthy German immigrant family. As a boy he received lessons on the violin from a member of the Hallé Orchestra, and piano lessons, from a local teacher. In early adulthood, whilst managing a citrus grove in Florida, Delius took lessons in musical theory from a local organist. He studied in Leipzig for eighteen months from 1886, after which his father granted him a small income (Young 1967: 534-536) and subsequently lived most of his life in France. Delius and Elgar met only once, in 1933; Elgar had flown to Paris to conduct his Violin Concerto and made the detour to visit the invalided Delius. Two significant comments from this meeting, pertinent to this thesis, are reported by Eric Fenby, the amanuensis to Delius. Firstly, in talking about his work on the Third Symphony Elgar is reported to have said: "my music will not interest you, Delius; you are too much of a poet for a workman like me!" (the Third Symphony remained unfinished at the time of Elgar's death). Secondly, in response to a

comment by Delius about “long-winded oratorios”, Elgar replied, “That is the penalty of my English environment” (Fenby 1936: 124).

Can Elgar’s statement comparing himself as a workman to Delius as a poet be seen when comparing their respective trumpet writing? An analysis of three works by Delius, *Paris* (1899-1900) subtitled *The Song of Great City*, a purely orchestral work; *Appalachia* (1896-1902), written for a baritone soloist, chorus and orchestra; and finally the Violin Concerto (1916) may provide answers to this question. All three are substantial works, over twenty minutes in duration, and each is from a different genre.

The compositions by Delius do not mirror Elgar’s scoring for different pitches of trumpet. In all these works Delius scores for the same type of trumpet, the trumpet pitched in C, and he does not score for cornet. Elgar’s only major work scored for the trumpet in C is the Cello Concerto of 1919. Whereas Elgar’s trumpet writing around the turn of the century is inconsistent, that of Delius is consistent. In the two earlier works, *Appalachia* and *Paris*, the trumpets and horns are the only instruments that do not use a key signature. Delius goes further in the Violin Concerto by not using key signatures for any instrument. The number of trumpets required by both Delius and Elgar in his later works correlates across the different genres. In large orchestral and choral works they both score for three trumpets and in concertos they score for two.

The chromatic nature of the compositional style of Delius is matched in his writing for trumpet. All the trumpet parts contain many chromatic passages that could only be realised on a valved instrument. There is no remnant of the natural trumpet style. The intervals between the trumpet parts have no dependence on the fourths, fifths and octaves as in the parts written for natural trumpets that could only produce notes of the harmonic series, and

are often discordant. The trumpets are not used as harmonic support; they take a full part in the melodic argument at all dynamic levels, with some particularly noticeable, quiet, lyrical solos, for example in *Paris* after rehearsal number 13 (Ex.14.2 “Paris” in Appendix 14). The pitch range of the parts is wide, with much use of the highest tessitura ascending to *b*” and *c*”. Delius makes little use of the multiple tonguing effects that are heard in the compositions of Elgar, and in none of these works are the trumpets asked to play muted.

The contrasts in the trumpet writing of Delius and Elgar should be considered in the light of the aforementioned statements reported by Fenby. Elgar considered himself more of a workman. A workman knows what his tools are, and what they are capable of, without breaking them. Elgar knew the trumpeters he was writing for, and he knew the “tools” they used. He wrote for the instruments trumpeters were using at the time, and times were changing. Delius wrote only for the trumpet in C, a very rare instrument in the “English environment” in which Elgar stated he worked, as discussed in Chapter One. However, Delius lived in France. Was the trumpet in C the instrument used in French orchestras? Looking at the works of his contemporary Debussy (1862-1918), there is no evidence that it was. *Nocturnes* (1899) is scored for three trumpets in F, and *La Mer* (1903-1905) is scored for three trumpets in F and two B-flat cornets. The choices of trumpet and cornet by Debussy correlates with that of Elgar. Delius scored for the trumpet in C without particular regard to the actual instruments that were used at the time. He placed considerable demands upon trumpeters, his writing containing many awkward intervals, discordant harmonies between the trumpeters, and an extremely wide dynamic range in all registers. Delius’s trumpet parts must have been more difficult for contemporary trumpeters to realise than the parts written by Elgar. However, the discordant harmonies, wide dynamic range and use of chromaticism does create expressive trumpet writing. Perhaps Delius’s

less practical trumpet writing contributed to Elgar's judgment that he was a poet rather than a workman.

Holst was born in 1874, in Cheltenham, approximately twenty-five miles from Elgar's home of Worcester. Like Elgar, his father was a local musician, working mostly as an organist and choirmaster. His first music lessons were from his father, and in 1893 Holst entered the Royal College of Music, London, and was granted a scholarship in composition in 1895. This is in stark contrast to Elgar's informal musical education. Like Elgar, Holst had considerable experience as an orchestral player, but performed with more prestigious ensembles than the local concerts and festivals in which Elgar performed. Holst played the trombone with the Carl Rosa Opera Orchestra and the Scottish Orchestra from 1898 to 1903.⁵⁹ This experience as an orchestral musician would have given Holst an insight into how other composers orchestrated, how the leading players of the day realised their parts, and how the capabilities of the instrument changed over time. Michael Short comments that in 1899 Holst was "becoming more assured in his handling of orchestral resources, as a consequence of his growing experience as an orchestral musician" and had learnt orchestration "from the inside out" (Short 1999: 38-41).

The types of trumpet Holst scored for in his early compositions, in the first decades of the twentieth century, mirror those of Elgar. Holst's first major orchestral work was the *Cotswold Symphony* composed in 1899-1900; it is scored for trumpets in F. The symphony opens with a diatonic trumpet call that could have been played on the natural trumpet, but the subsequent trumpet writing could only have been realised on a valved instrument. Two trumpets are scored for in the opening movements, with a third trumpet added in the third movement. A *Somerset Rhapsody* (1906) and *Ben Mora* (1910/11) are scored for two and

⁵⁹ Neither was a full-time position, so it was possible to play for both.

three trumpets in B flat/ A respectively. *The Planets*, composed 1914-1918, is scored for four trumpets in C. The C trumpet was available in the United Kingdom by 1914, as discussed in Chapter One.

Holst does not use a key signature in the F trumpet parts of a *Cotswold Symphony*⁶⁰ which matches Elgar's trumpet writing of that time, 1899/1900, in the *Enigma Variations* and *The Dream of Gerontius*. However, Holst does use a key signature in the B-flat/A trumpet parts of *A Somerset Rhapsody*, which again mirrors Elgar's use of a key signature in *The Kingdom*, composed in the same year, 1906. Holst continues to use a key signature when writing for the C trumpet in *The Planets*. However, in Holst's compositions from the 1920s, all of which are scored for C trumpet, the use of a key signature becomes inconsistent. A key signature is used in the *First Choral Symphony* (written for the Leeds Festival of 1925) but not in the ballet suite *The Perfect Fool* (1923) or *Egdon Heath* (1928). No key signatures are used in any instrumental part in the latter two pieces, mirroring the absence of key signatures in the Violin Concerto of Delius.

As can be expected of a composer who achieved a professional standard of performance on a brass instrument, Holst, like Elgar but unlike Delius, writes for the trumpet using techniques familiar to trumpeters of the day. Holst includes a wide variety of articulations and multiple tonguing techniques in his trumpet writing, which are described in the tutor-books discussed in Chapter Six, and he often instructs the trumpets to play muted. An intriguing remark to the brass section is included in the score of *Egdon Heath* "The muted brass are not to accent any notes or force the tone". This statement implies that brass players of the 1920s were inclined to strongly articulate notes and the overall tone may

⁶⁰ I am grateful to the librarian of Faber Hire Library for this information gained from an original set of trumpet parts, much of which are hand-written.

have had a forced quality (the playing styles of trumpeters during Elgar's career is explored in Chapters Six and Seven).

The technical demands made upon the trumpets by Holst in *The Planets* exceed those made in any work by Elgar. The range of *g* to *c''* is no greater than in Elgar's works, but the higher register is used more frequently and is more sustained, particularly in 'Saturn', the sixth movement. All the four trumpet parts in 'Mars' and 'Saturn' are extensive and sustained, requiring much stamina from the players. There are many passages that have wide jumps in pitch at a quick tempo, particularly in 'Jupiter', the third movement, and 'Uranus', the sixth movement (Ex.14.3 'Uranus' in Appendix 14).

The relationship between the types of trumpet called for by Holst and Elgar is a reflection of the two composers' extensive experience as orchestral players and conductors. They witnessed the changes in the instruments trumpeters were using. Delius was more reclusive and less involved in the world of performance and, unlike Elgar, composed less for specific occasions. The correlation between Holst and Delius in not using a key signature in later compositions is related more to the increasingly extended tonal nature of their respective compositional styles whereas Elgar's work is always more conventionally tonal in nature.

The analysis of Elgar's trumpet writing demonstrated a generally consistent approach to the instrument from 1906. Do English composers of a younger generation corroborate the evidence of changes in the trumpet world illustrated in the works of Elgar?

The trumpet writing in works by two other younger contemporaries of Elgar

Of Elgar's younger contemporaries Vaughan Williams (1872-1958) and Walton (1902-1983) were amongst the most celebrated of their day. Although Vaughan Williams was born only fifteen years after Elgar he produced no major orchestral works until the *Norfolk Rhapsodies* of 1906/7, over sixteen years after Elgar's *Froissart*. He continued to compose into his old age in the later 1950s. He studied at the Royal College of Music, Cambridge University (where he also took a history degree), and privately in Paris with Ravel. Walton, like Elgar and Holst, was the son of a local musician. He was born in Oldham, Lancashire but as a boy won a place as a chorister at Christ Church Cathedral, Oxford, and later became an undergraduate at the university. For the purposes of this study only their compositions up to 1934 are considered: the first three symphonies of Vaughan Williams and the cantata *Belshazzar's Feast* by Walton.

The trumpets Vaughan Williams scored for in his first three symphonies match those used by Elgar but of a decade earlier. *A Sea Symphony* (No.1) was first performed at the Leeds Festival of 1910; it is a substantial work scored for soprano and baritone soloists, chorus and large orchestra, which includes three trumpets in F, matching the trumpet scoring in *The Dream of Gerontius* (1900). *A London Symphony* (No.2) was composed between 1911 and 1914, revised after WW1 and first performed in 1920; it is a purely orchestral work with two trumpets in F and two cornets in B flat specified. This correlates with the scoring in *Cockaigne* (subtitled *In London Town*), first performed in 1901. *A Pastoral Symphony* (No.3), completed in 1924, uses three trumpets but now pitched in C, which correlates with Elgar's last major work, the Cello Concerto (1919). Vaughan Williams also mirrors Elgar's earlier use of a key signature when he scores for the trumpet and cornet; the trumpets in F do not use a key signature but the cornet parts do. However, the C

trumpet parts in *A Pastoral Symphony* are not written with a key signature. From the study of their respective scores, it is unclear why Vaughan Williams did not score for the B-flat trumpet in his earlier pieces (such as the *Norfolk Rhapsodies*, 1906/7), given that Elgar had made the change in around 1902. Perhaps the explanation lies in Elgar's close association with practising musicians, as against Vaughan Williams' more academic training. Another explanation for Vaughan Williams' tardiness may have been his long-standing association with the Royal College of Music, studying there both before and after taking his degree in history at Cambridge. Morrow was the trumpet teacher at the Royal College of Music at the time and may possibly have influenced composition students into scoring for the F trumpet, in addition to the young composers he describes in his talk to the Musical Association of 1895.

There are three further similarities between the trumpet and cornet writing of Vaughan Williams and Elgar. *A Sea Symphony* begins with a trumpet fanfare, a motif that is repeated elsewhere in the piece, and Elgar uses the trumpets to play fanfare-like figures in works such as *Froissart* and *Scenes from the saga of King Olaf*. Also, in *A Sea Symphony* much use is made of multiple tonguing techniques and as we have seen Elgar makes use of multiple tonguing techniques in many works, including *Cockaigne* and *The Apostles*. In *A London Symphony*, the division between trumpet and cornet writing corroborates that of Elgar, when he writes for both trumpets and cornets in 1901, in that the cornets play a greater chromatic role, take more part in the melodic argument, and play mostly in the louder passages. Mutes are directed to be used in the trumpet and cornet parts in all these works. Vaughan Williams does not increase either the range or technical requirements beyond those of Elgar in these symphonies.

An intriguing use of the trumpet in *A Pastoral Symphony* occurs before rehearsal letter G in the first movement, where the composer specifically indicates a change from C to E flat trumpet for an exposed solo for the first trumpet, and adds the following note:

It is important that this passage should be played on a true Eb Trumpet (preferably a natural Trumpet) so that only the natural notes may be played and that the Bb (7th partial) and D (9th partial) should have their true intonation. This can, of course, be also achieved by playing the passage on an F Trumpet with the 1st piston depressed. If neither of these courses is possible the passage must of course be played on a Bb or C Trumpet and the pistons used in the ordinary way. But this must only be done in case of necessity. (Ex.14.4 “Pastoral Symphony Natural Trumpet Solo” in Appendix 14)

The selection of instrument and style of writing of this solo have military associations. The E-flat trumpet for which Vaughan Williams scored was, and is now, in common use in the British Army. For example, the Staffordshire Yeomanry has a collection of twelve sterling silver E-flat trumpets, dated 1842, which are still played on ceremonial occasions.⁶¹ The Vaughan Williams solo begins with a rising perfect 5th reminiscent of the *Last Post* bugle call performed at both funerals and on Remembrance Day around the United Kingdom. It may be significant in this context that Vaughan Williams had served in the Army during WW1. In a letter to Ursula Wood, dated 4 October 1938, Vaughan Williams describes the symphony as “really war time music - a great deal of it incubated when I used to go up night after night in the ambulance wagon at Ecoives” (letter available on www.vaughanwilliams.uk ref. 19381004; accessed 21/01/18).

⁶¹ The author with a group of colleagues performed on these instruments for the Legal Service and Procession in Stafford on 13 January 2017.

Vaughan Williams's statement provides an insight into the trumpet world in the United Kingdom in the 1920s. Firstly, the F trumpet for which Elgar scored from 1898 to 1901 was still in use. Secondly, this statement is further corroboration that the C trumpet was played by some trumpeters. Thirdly, by listing the B-flat trumpet before the C, and declaring its use in this solo to be the fallback position, Vaughan Williams is implying that the B flat trumpet was the standard instrument used in major orchestras. Finally, Vaughan Williams was aware of the sound and intonational characteristics of the natural trumpet, as outlined in the criticism by Burney in 1784, quoted in Chapter One. Elgar also made use of a natural instrument in *The Apostles*, the shofar.

The style of some of Walton's compositions owes much to the works of Elgar. Written after Elgar's death, the Coronation Marches *Crown Imperial* and *Orb and Sceptre*, written for the coronations of King George VI in 1937 and Queen Elizabeth II in 1952 respectively, borrow their form, fanfare-like motifs and melodic chivalry from the *Pomp and Circumstance Marches* of Elgar. Furthermore, Young believes there is "an Elgarian panache" in Walton's music (Young 1967: 599).

The Leeds Musical Festival was the occasion for the first performance of many important choral works: Elgar's *Caractacus* (1898), Vaughan Williams's *A Sea Symphony* (1910), Holst's *First Choral Symphony* (1925), and in 1931 Walton's *Belshazzar's Feast*. The trumpet writing in *Belshazzar's Feast* is extensive and virtuosic in places, making technical demands far beyond those of Elgar and Holst. All nine trumpets, including those in the two off-stage bands, are written in C, and there are no key signatures used in any of the instrumental or vocal parts. The range of the trumpet parts is wide, from *g* sharp to *c''*. The high *c''* is used frequently in rapid arpeggio-like figures. There is much use of multiple tonguing techniques and many rhythmically varied articulations. (Ex.14.5 "Belshazzar's

Feast" in Appendix 14) The use of mutes is extensive and in one passage, after rehearsal figure 5, "metal" mutes are specified. Trills are written, not as ornamentation as in music from an earlier period, but as sound effects, after rehearsal figure 51. All the trumpet parts provide a technical challenge to the twenty-first century professional trumpeter; Walton's writing is considerably more advanced and challenging than that of Elgar.

The reason why both Vaughan Williams, in his later work, and Walton scored for the C trumpet is uncertain. The workshop records of Boosey and Co. indicate that C trumpets were available from 1909 (as described in Chapter One) and in my interview with Arthur Butterworth (see Appendix 18) he suggested that many players were playing a trumpet that was pitched either in C or, with an extra slide added, in B flat. However, Butterworth also remarked that Ernest Hall, the leading trumpeter of the 1920s, 1930s and 1940s, did not advocate the use of the C trumpet. The most probable reason is that scoring for C trumpet was viewed as convenient for the composer, leaving the trumpeter to select the actual pitch of trumpet on which to realise the part. Later British composers also scored for C trumpet, including Benjamin Britten (1913-1976).

Conclusions

This chapter has looked at selected works by six English composers born between 1848 and 1902, all of whom were active during Elgar's working life. The trumpet scoring of Parry and Stanford has little in common with that of Elgar's early works. However, the inconsistencies displayed in the trumpet writing of Parry and Stanford provide evidence that the trumpet world in the United Kingdom was in a state of flux. Elgar's manner of writing for the trumpet is reflected in the work of Holst and Vaughan Williams. Elgar, Holst and Vaughan Williams collectively treat the F trumpet as one of the standard orchestral

instruments from the last few years of the nineteenth century, in the works of Elgar and Holst, and until approximately WW1, in the works of Vaughan Williams. However, from the early 1900s the shorter trumpet pitched in B flat/A gradually replaced the F trumpet to become the standard orchestral instrument. There is some evidence that a slightly shorter trumpet pitched in C was also in use. However, the trumpet writing of Delius, who always scored for the C trumpet, can be discounted since he worked mainly in France, far from the professional musicians of the United Kingdom; the trumpet writing of Delius is unlike that of his contemporaries, Holst and Elgar. The greatly increased demands in the trumpet writing of Walton indicate that Elgar was, to some extent, a transitional figure in his treatment of the instrument.

The above analysis has indicated that the technical demands made upon trumpeters increased over this period. Chapter Seven, the practice-based research, will show that this is the main reason for the demise of the long F trumpet. Composers were asking trumpeters to play passages with wide intervallic leaps, and to sustain extended sections in the highest register. The compositions of Walton are an example of these ever-increasing demands. The shorter trumpet, pitched in B flat or C, is the more reliable instrument to realise the parts effectively. The next chapter will explore the playing styles of trumpeters and cornettists during Elgar's career, and will identify developments in playing styles during this period when increasing technical and musical demands were made of them.

Chapter Six

Brass playing styles in Elgar's time

Previous chapters of this thesis have dealt in detail with the trumpet writing of Elgar and that of his contemporaries in the United Kingdom. This was set into the context of both the general musical scene of the time, and of the instruments that were available to the players who performed those works, often with the composers as conductor. This chapter will attempt to identify the style in which those trumpeters and cornettists performed, and to describe changes in playing style that occurred over the sixty years of Elgar's career.

The chapter is divided into two sections. Firstly, the evidence from secondary written sources is identified and then compared with evidence from primary written sources. Secondly, a comparison is made between the literature concerning early recordings and an analysis of the playing styles demonstrated in a selection of historic recordings.

Playing styles described in secondary sources

Trumpet playing styles during the period of Elgar's career have received limited attention in the general histories of the instrument and journal articles referred to in this thesis. Edward Tarr has made the largest contribution to the subject. Two themes can be extracted from this literature: the technique and musical effect of articulation, and the encouragement of a lyrical style of playing. I will discuss these two themes separately. In addition, the convergence of trumpet and cornet playing styles identified by some authors

is discussed, and the section ends with a brief description of the development of orchestral brass playing styles that have been the focus of a thesis written in the 1990s.

Articulation

In a brief discussion of modern playing styles across the whole of European and American classical music, Tarr refers to three features of late nineteenth-century articulation. Firstly, the invention of the “inaudible entry”, an orchestral crescendo with each instrument entering one after the other; Tarr attributes this to the demands made by Wagner (Tarr 1988: 194). Secondly, Tarr identifies a style of articulation in which rapid notes are played very short and pointed, describing the articulation as “tat tat tat”. He believes this technique was developed to gain clarity through the texture of a larger orchestra (Tarr 1988: 195). It is interesting to note that Tarr describes both these playing styles as “bad habits” for the modern player. Finally, in a pair of articles on nineteenth-century trumpet music from Prague, Tarr identifies a further feature of articulation, a “slur-two tongue-two” pattern in the articulation of semiquavers, and claims that this “forms the basis for our modern ideal of articulation” (Tarr 1994: 130).

Lyrical playing

The early nineteenth-century Czech tutor-books, described by Tarr in the above articles, include operatic melodies. Tarr believes the inclusion of these melodies implies that a lyrical style of playing was a necessity for trumpeters of that time (Tarr 1994: 113). The cornet is the instrument mostly associated with a lyrical style of playing in the nineteenth century, with its use as a solo instrument in the emerging brass and military bands, discussed in Chapter One. Tarr identifies two features in the playing styles of cornet

soloists up to about 1925: little or no vibrato was used, and a type of rubato that anticipated the final note(s) of a phrase was employed (Tarr 1988: 198).

The convergence of trumpet and cornet playing styles

A convergence of trumpet and cornet playing styles is described by some writers. The English composer, writer on music, and collector of instruments, Adam Carse, writing in the 1930s, identifies an organological reason for the convergence of cornet and trumpet playing styles. He believed the adoption of the B-flat trumpet, the same overall length of tubing as the cornet and played with a similar shaped mouthpiece, produces “a tone ... which differs so little ... the two are difficult to distinguish” (Carse 1939: 250). John Wallace and Alexander McGrattan, in their book published in 2011, also identify the coming together of cornet and trumpet playing styles. They assert that the prevalence of players changing from cornet to trumpet “to and fro” in the early years of the twentieth century, particularly in performing jazz, caused the trumpet and cornet styles to merge (Wallace & McGrattan 2011: 267). However, they do not specifically detail the trumpet and cornet styles to which they are referring. Regarding the influence of jazz on trumpet playing styles, Carse offers a personal view of earlier twentieth-century practices:

The present century has seen the trumpet degraded to an extent which was never reached by the cornet even at its worst. Since it became the chosen instrument of the American dance bands, whose “jazz” music swept like a plague over the whole world, the trumpet has been subject to the worst indignities ... its throat being stuffed up with all sorts of tone-distorting mutes; it has been made to emit all manner of

nasal whimpering sounds of the most drunken character, and *portamento* effects which are totally foreign to its nature (Carse 1939: 243).⁶²

Orchestral brass playing styles

The development of orchestral brass playing styles in general is also relevant to this discourse. In the 1990s Simon Baines studied the development of orchestral brass playing styles during the previous one hundred years (Baines 1996). This study is not confined to the United Kingdom and covers orchestras across Europe, Russia, and the United States of America. It is horn playing styles that received the most attention in this study, and the trombone and tuba sections are dealt with in some detail, but the trumpet section is given the least amount of focus. Baines concentrates on the organological developments that affected the development of playing styles, particularly with the quest for expansionism, security, homogeneity and uniformity across the brass section during the twentieth century (Baines 1996: 10). Baines interviewed leading British brass players of the latter half of the twentieth century who could recall Ernest Hall playing with a “very direct, unwavering sound which projects well” (Baines 1996: 359).

To summarise, the available literature on brass playing styles of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries is limited and is not specific to the United Kingdom. A separate playing style on the cornet, as opposed to the trumpet, is alluded to, but some convergence of the two styles is also noted. The inclusion of operatic melodies in early nineteenth-century tutor-books written in Prague provides some evidence that a lyrical style of playing was

⁶² Carse's comments may have been inspired by the muted trumpet playing of Bubber Miley in his joint composition with Duke Ellington *Black and Tan Fantasy* of 1927. This was later revised and extended as the *New Black and Tan Fantasy* for Cootie Williams to play in 1938. The work was popular on both sides of the Atlantic and was also recorded by British dance bands; for example, the band of Billy Cotton recorded it in 1933 with Bruts Gonella (brother of Nats Gonella) playing the muted trumpet solos (recounted by Quentin Bryar, of the Duke Ellington Society UK, in correspondence with the author dated 11/08/2017).

encouraged on the trumpet as well as the cornet, at least in that part of Europe. Three styles of articulation are identified by Tarr: some long notes begin with an inaudible entry, rapid notes are played very short and clearly articulated to balance with a larger orchestra, and a “slur-two tongue-two” pattern of articulation was encouraged. Cornet players used vibrato sparingly, and employed rubato when playing solos. The next section, looking at trumpet tutor-books from the United Kingdom, will examine how relevant Tarr’s statements are to the playing styles of British trumpeters around the turn of the twentieth century.

Playing styles described and inferred from primary sources

Primary sources, in the form of tutor-books, outlining brass playing styles during Elgar’s career, are readily available, and specifically describe practice in the United Kingdom. As discussed in Chapter One, the three most important players of their generations, Thomas Harper Jnr., Walter Morrow and Ernest Hall, all worked with Elgar, and each published a trumpet tutor-book, in 1875, 1907 and 1937 respectively. These tutors detail their authors’ respective views regarding their preferred ways of playing the instrument. Additionally, as was discussed in Chapter One, the three authors form a continuity during this period through teacher/pupil relationships. All three tutors are substantial, the Harper being 106 pages in length, the Morrow also containing 106 pages but with an additional seven pages of introductory prose, and the Hall ninety-seven pages. These tutors are, perhaps, the most reliable sources of information regarding accepted trumpet playing styles of the day in the United Kingdom, as their intended readers were students of the trumpet and cornet. They were, however, written for different instruments: the Harper was exclusively for the slide trumpet, Morrow’s exclusively for the F valved instrument, and Hall’s for both the B-flat cornet and B-flat trumpet.

Each of these tutors were preceded by earlier publications. The Harper Jnr. tutor, entitled *Harper's / School / for the Trumpet / Containing (in addition to the usual instructions) a full description of the Instrument. / Observations on the use of the Slide / and / on the mode of writing music for the Trumpet, / also several remarks connected with the Art of playing the Instrument, / and / 100 / Progressive / Exercises* (1875), was antedated by a tutor by his father Thomas Harper Snr. in 1835 (second edition 1837), entitled *Instructions / for / the Trumpet / with the use of the Chromatic Slide, / also the / Russian Valve Trumpet, / the small Cornet à Pistons or Small Stop Trumpet, / and the /Keyed Bugle*. Much of the instructional prose is common to both books, as are some of the elementary exercises that do not make use of the slide. However, few of the exercises composed for the use of the slide are the same, and many of Harper Jnr.'s exercises are technically more demanding. Harper Jnr. published *Harper's / School / for the / Cornet à pistons / containing / in addition to complete instructions in the Art of playing the instrument / 100 / Progressive Exercises* before his trumpet tutor in 1865 and this is discussed later. The title of the Morrow tutor, *Julius Kosleck's / School for the Trumpet / Revised and adapted to the study / of the Trumpet-à-pistons in F as used in the orchestras / of England and America by Walter Morrow* (1907), announces that the book is a re-working of an earlier tutor-book by the German trumpeter Julius Kosleck. Kosleck had impressed Morrow greatly when they performed together in a performance of Bach's B minor Mass given for the bicentenary of the composer's birth on 21 March 1885 (Morrow 1907: VIII). The tutor by Hall, *Otto Langey's / Practical Tutor / for the / Cornet or Trumpet* (1937), was antedated by a publication by Morrow, published 1911, and the extent to which these tutor-books are similar is explored later in this chapter.

The three tutor-books cover most aspects of trumpet playing techniques and are progressive, taking a student from blowing their first notes to approximately the "Grade 8"

standard of twenty-first century United Kingdom examination boards. In addition to developing instrumental technique, all three tutors introduce music reading skills progressively. The early exercises use simple rhythms, and increasingly complex rhythms are linked with the development of range and technique. Hall's book is published as one of the Otto Langey series of orchestral tutors, and perhaps for this reason includes a section of musical rudiments.

Three questions arise from this primary source material. Do these authors corroborate the playing styles identified above in the secondary literature? Are there other identifiable playing styles promoted in these tutors that are not identified in the literature? Is there any discernible development in brass playing styles through these three tutors, which span the whole of Elgar's career?

Articulation

The playing of sustained notes with an “inaudible entry” is not mentioned in any of these tutors. Furthermore, the instructions given by each author regarding how to start a note cannot produce an inaudible entry. Harper states: “the tongue must be given to each note” (Harper Jnr. 1875: 13). Morrow describes the starting of a note thus: “draw breath on each side of the mouth, withdraw the tongue from the lips with a jerk, and at the same time allow the breath to pass into the instrument” (Morrow 1907: introduction). Hall instructs “a stroke of the tongue be given to every note” (Hall 1937: 7).

The “tat tat tat” articulation mentioned by Tarr is also not corroborated in any of these tutors. To create the “tat” effect it would be necessary to stop the note by blocking the aperture with the tongue – just as the syllable itself is pronounced. Harper expressly

mentions blocking of the aperture in his description of how to start and stop a note: “the tongue must not return to the lips until the sound has left the instrument” (Harper Jnr. 1875: 5). Exactly the same phrase is used by Morrow (Morrow 1907: introduction). Hall gives no description of how to stop a note. These historic tutor-books do concur with modern practice which recommends that a cessation of the air flow is the best way to finish a note, as the replacement of the tongue produces an explosive ending (Ridgeon 1986: 7).

There is some evidence of the advocacy of a “slur-two tongue-two” style of articulation in the tutors by Morrow and Hall, but in the Harper there is no mention of this pattern of articulation, either in the prose or musical exercises sections. Morrow and Hall provide numerous exercises for the practice of articulation and many of these exercises use the “slur-two tongue-two” pattern as the initial version of the exercise. However, different patterns of articulation are suggested for repetitions of the exercise.

Lyrical playing

The emphasis placed on the development of a lyrical style of playing implied by the inclusion of operatic melodies in the Czech tutor-books of the early nineteenth century is to be found in all the British tutor-books, to some extent. Many of Harper’s *100 Progressive Studies* are of a lyrical nature, with the “cantabile” marking often used. Melodies from the compositions of Walch, Neukomn, Perry, Norton, Dauprat and Corelli are quoted and, presumably, the others were composed by Harper himself.

Compared to Harper, Morrow puts less emphasis on a lyrical style of playing, with many fewer *cantabile*-style melodies. However, some folk tunes and songs by composers such

as Mendelssohn are included and one page is entitled “Expression and Phrasing”. Morrow states: “The first rule [of expression] is, that ascending passages increase in loudness, and descending passages decrease” (Morrow 1907: 43). The implication of this rather simplistic statement, and the inclusion of fewer lyrical melodies, is that Morrow viewed expressive playing with less importance than the more martial style of trumpet performance. The Hall tutor includes many arias from both opera and oratorio, by such composers as Mendelssohn, Bellini and Meyerbeer, possibly because this tutor is the only one marketed for both cornet and trumpet. There is no mention of rubato in any of these tutors, and the anticipation of the final note(s) of a phrase, identified by Tarr, is not advocated.

Concerning vibrato, it is notable that neither Harper Jnr. nor Morrow make any mention of this technique, nor do they describe any technique that could be interpreted as such. Hall does not describe how to play with vibrato, although he does mention the practice negatively, stating in an introduction to an exercise that “in order to acquire a full tone and a long breath, long sustained tones should frequently be practised in the following manner, without vibrato” (Hall 1937: 55). This comment could have been to encourage controlled tone production. It can therefore be assumed that none of these three authors regarded the use of vibrato as desirable. Interestingly, the French cornettist J. B. Arban in his universally adopted *Cornet Method*, first published in 1864, provides instruction regarding a technique that could be described as vibrato, albeit without mentioning the term, and warns against its overuse in his “Faults to be avoided” section:

Many players fancy they are playing with pathos when they swell the sound in fits and starts...The oscillation of the sound on the Cornet [*sic*] is obtained by a light

movement of the right hand, but care must be exercised not to abuse its use by too frequent employment (Arban 1907: 8).

In conclusion, the three tutor-books analysed provide only limited corroboration of the comments in the available literature. They do show that a lyrical style of playing was important throughout this period and recognise some limited use of vibrato. The comments regarding articulation by modern authors in the available literature are, however, not fully corroborated in these three historic works.

Other features of brass playing styles identified in three trumpet tutor-books

Four further aspects of playing style have been identified in the Harper Jnr., Morrow and Hall tutor-books. Firstly, articulation is dealt with in detail by all of these authors. Secondly, evidence of the development of multiple tonguing techniques can be followed through these tutors. Thirdly, the technique and importance of slurring can be traced, and finally, there is some evidence from the later part of this period regarding the use of portamento on the trumpet and cornet.

All three of the tutors go into some detail regarding articulation. Harper, Morrow and Hall agree that the action of the tongue should start the note. However, there are differences in the way Harper and Morrow describe this in contrast to Hall. Harper states: “introduce the tongue between the teeth, the tip just touching the upper lip” (Harper Jnr. 1875: 5). Morrow, Harper’s pupil uses exactly the same wording in his tutor-book (Morrow 1907: introduction). But Hall modifies this instruction with some additional details stating, “the tongue being placed between the lips, quickly drawn backwards … pronouncing at the same time the syllable TU” (Hall 1937: 7). This seems contradictory when his instructions

are followed, as to pronounce the syllable TU the tongue needs to start behind the front teeth. However, he does emphasise this syllable when stating, “The proper stroke is obtained by pronouncing the syllable TU” and he also adds, “The stroke required to produce a sound must not be given hard, other wise [sic] it makes the tone harsh and disagreeable”. Furthermore, Hall describes a softer articulation, advocating the use of the syllable DU (Hall 1937: 7). This syllable cannot be produced with the tongue starting its motion between the lips; the action of the tongue needs to begin behind the front teeth, nearer the hard palette. As has been stated earlier, the Hall tutor was written for cornet and trumpet rather than just trumpet, and this may account for this difference in the technique of articulation which will be explored in the next chapter.

Double- and triple-tonguing techniques, multiple tonguing, would have been an essential requisite of the trumpeter well before the period with which this study is concerned. For example, Hummel makes use of the triple tongue technique in the third movement of his Concerto (1803). All three tutor-books have sections on double and triple tonguing, but the method advocated is varied. Harper gives a selection of possible syllables to pronounce in order to accomplish these techniques (Harper Jnr. 1875: 5). Three possible syllables are proposed for double tonguing – tick-ca, ta-ga and da-ga. Morrow, in a more extensive section, provides only one articulation for each technique – tu-tu-ku-tu for four double-tongued notes, and tu-tu-ku for triple tonguing, and provides numerous exercises for practice (Morrow 1907: 30-34). It is interesting to note that Morrow does not provide guidance, or exercises, for the double tonguing of just two notes. Both Harper and Morrow cover double and triple tonguing in one section, but Hall separates the two, dealing with double tonguing first. He advocates tu-ku and the repetition of these syllables for longer runs of double tonguing. This is the method used in the twenty-first century. Hall provides sixteen exercises to practise in a wide variety of rhythms and metre (Hall 1937: 25-28).

Hall agrees with Morrow that tu-tu-ku should be the syllables used for triple tonguing, and provides thirteen exercises for practise (Hall 1937: 28-30). Hall then adds a further six exercises of mixed articulations, including tu-tu-ku-tu, as advocated by his teacher Morrow, and finishes the section with an extensive triple-tongue étude (Hall 1937: 31-33). The twenty-first-century standard method of triple tonguing, advocated by Arban, is to pronounce tu-tu-ku (Arban 1907: 155).

This analysis shows a considerable development in double and triple tonguing techniques during this period in the United Kingdom. These techniques were used extensively in cornet solos and this may account for the greater emphasis placed on them by Hall. However, contemporary composers were also writing passages of rapidly played notes requiring multiple tonguing techniques in orchestral music, particularly Russian composers. Such works as *Scheherazade* (1888) by Rimsky-Korsakoff and *Petrushka* (1911) by Stravinsky contain many of these passages. As has been detailed in Chapters Three and Four, Elgar makes use of this multiple tonguing throughout his career, with the technically more difficult passages reserved for the cornet, in the works which are scored for both trumpet and cornet.

A noticeable difference between the Harper, Morrow and Hall tutor-books and more modern methods, is that in the former there is less attention given to slurring. However, there is some development in the use of slurring through these tutors. Harper offers a brief but accurate description of slurring in his introduction: "When two or more notes are slurred, the first note only must be produced by the action of the tongue, and the following notes made by a continuation of the breath" (Harper Jnr. 1875: 6). Slurring is introduced in the second half of the tutor (exercise fifty-two of the 100 in the book), and is incorporated in thirty-eight of the subsequent exercises. However, many of these exercises contain only

a few slurred notes. Slurs are incorporated in the pieces much earlier in the Morrow tutor on page twelve, of 106. However, no explanation is offered on how to slur until page thirty, when Morrow states: “To slur from a low note to a higher, the syllables ta-ee should be in the mind of the student” (Morrow 1907: 30). The tongue rises in the mouth when moving from the syllable ta to ee. This use of tongue positioning is innovative, and is still regarded as an essential technique in learning the trumpet today. Many of the subsequent exercises contain slurred passages. Also, Hall introduces slurs into the pieces in his tutor much earlier than Harper, by coincidence on page twelve, and offers the following as an explanation of how to slur: “the slur connecting two notes ... signifies that the two notes are to be played with one stroke of the tongue on the first of the two notes” (Hall 1937: 14). Later, there are exercises devoted entirely to slurring, with many exercises having alternate articulation patterns also suggested.

As well as emphasising slurring to a greater extent than the previous tutors, Hall includes a short section regarding the use of portamento, which is not mentioned in either the Harper or Morrow tutors. Fuller Maitland, writing in the 1906 edition of *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, describes portamento as “A gradual carrying of the sound ... with extreme smoothness from one note to another”. He adds that it is only possible on stringed instruments or the voice, though it is possible on the trombone to a “certain extent” (Fuller Maitland 1906 [1922],: vol.III: 795).

Hall’s description of portamento is similar to that of Fuller Maitland, but in the musical example given, an additional feature of the technique is added. Hall’s description of portamento is “an expression denoting the slurring of one sound to another ... increase the sound when from lower to higher notes, decrease it when from higher to lower notes” (Hall 1937: 21). In the musical example given, it is indicated that the second note is attained a

sixteenth of a beat early. Hall states that this technique has only limited use: "The portamento should only be applied on parts specially adapted for this kind of phrasing, and it should on no account be overdone, otherwise it becomes ridiculous" (Hall 1937: 21). After the musical example of how to realise portamento Hall provides a study to practise the technique in which he indicates the use of portamento between notes by means of a straight line joining the notes. This study is included in Appendix 17 (Ex.17.19) and a performance of it is recorded on the accompanying CD (Track 34). A discussion regarding the practical aspects of reproducing portamento on historic instruments is also included in the next chapter.

These three tutor-books are illuminating, both as to the playing styles they advocate and the development in these styles. All advocate strong articulation with a very positive use of the tongue to initiate the note, though the Hall tutor tempers this to some degree, particularly in advocating the use of the DU syllable. There is also considerable chronological development in multiple tonguing techniques, demonstrating that increasing clarity and evenness was becoming the norm. Finally, the technique of slurring grew in importance during this period as the trumpet became a more melodic instrument and, perhaps, as the influence of a cornet style became stronger. There is evidence, explored in the following paragraphs, that it was the influence of a cornet-playing style that led Hall to include a section on the use of portamento.

The convergence of trumpet and cornet playing styles

The differences in the technical requirements and the playing styles advocated in the two tutors by Harper Jnr., one for cornet and the other for trumpet, indicate that in the 1860s and 1870s there was little convergence in either technique or playing styles between the

cornet and trumpet. The cornet tutor is a much shorter work, containing forty-seven pages, and the only similarity between the two tutors lies in their explanations regarding the embouchure, method of tonguing and techniques of multiple tonguing. Each book contains '100 Progressive Exercises' but none is common to both books, although the compositional style is similar. This is to be expected as the trumpet tutor was written for an instrument that is not fully chromatic, the slide trumpet, and the cornet was a fully chromatic instrument from its inception. Significantly, in the cornet tutor, following the prose sections explaining the rudiments of music and the elements of playing technique, Harper inserts six pages of excerpts from operatic arias by Mozart, Meyerbeer, Flotow, Verdi, Donizetti, Rossini and Bellini. These operatic excerpts are all lyrical in style, and a student of the cornet would have needed to master the majority of the '100 Progressive Exercises' before attempting them. Why did Harper insert these operatic arias before the pedagogical exercises? Harper could have been indicating to the student that from the very beginning of their journey in learning to play the cornet the end goal was a lyrical, vocal style of playing. This theory is supported by the lyrical nature of many of the '100 Progressive Exercises' which contain such markings of expression as *dolce* and *con espress'*.⁶³

In addition to the encouragement to play in a lyrical style, the '100 Progressive Exercises' in Harper's cornet tutor take the student on a steep learning curve in gaining technical fluency. The technical challenges include nine exercises on the slurring of two notes up to the interval of a tenth, but no explanation is offered on how to slur. Also included are exercises in the use of multiple tonguing techniques and scales in every possible major key, in addition to chromatic scales. The range required in the Harper tutor of 1865, goes

⁶³ A copy of this tutor printed after 1885, as indicated by advertisements within the copy celebrating the success of various instruments at the *International Inventions Exhibition* of 1885, places these operatic arias as an appendix at the end. It may have been the publishers that made this change from the original publication for reasons of typographical design, especially as the original did not contain any advertising material.

beyond that required in his trumpet tutor, and even the Hall tutor of 1937, does not require such a wide range. In the introduction to the Harper cornet tutor the fingering chart ascends as high as written *g*” but also includes the pedal *C*, and the later pedagogical exercises ascend to *d*”.

It is in the Hall tutor of 1937 that the convergence of trumpet and cornet playing styles can be clearly be seen, as the book is aimed at both trumpet and cornet students with no differentiation between the two. The developments in trumpet playing styles seen in the Hall tutor were to some extent foreshadowed in a cornet tutor-book written by Morrow, also published in the Otto Langey series. Wallace and McGrattan identify this tutor as for trumpet and cornet, and give the date of publication as 1911. However, the copy used for this study is entitled *Otto Langey's / Tutor / for / the Cornet / revised, re-arranged & many studies added, selected from works of the great masters, also some exercises / melodies studies with marks of phrasing & expression carefully marked, composed for this tutor by / Walter Morrow*, and no publication date is shown. How much of the Hall developments can be attributed to Morrow from his cornet tutor?

The majority of the musical exercises are identical in both of these Otto Langey tutors, the structure and sequence of the sections is very similar, and the important section concerning portamento is also identical. The softer articulation identified in the Hall tutor is also introduced in the Morrow cornet tutor, although Morrow suggests pronouncing D rather than Hall's DU. Multiple-tonguing techniques, double and triple tonguing, also display slight differences in the syllable pronounced, with Morrow using T and K rather than Hall's TU and KU, but both the order of the syllables and the musical exercises are identical. It is interesting to note that TU and KU were the syllables advocated by Morrow in his earlier trumpet tutor. Morrow, in his cornet tutor, agrees with Arban on the use of

vibrato; in a section entitled “Remarks on the art of phrasing and expression” Morrow states: “do not mistake an incessant vibrato … for expression, use the vibrato sparingly, a pure, steady tone is best” (Morrow 1911: 54).

This section is not included in the Hall tutor and another notable omission in the Hall tutor is Morrow’s section regarding the transposition of orchestral trumpet parts. Morrow’s remark that cornet players are “not much use” if they cannot transpose (Morrow 1911: 75) provides further evidence that the cornet was used as a substitute for the trumpet in many orchestras. The similarity between these two Otto Langey tutors, the first written exclusively for cornet and the second for both trumpet and cornet twenty-six years later, provides evidence that corroborates the view of Wallace and McGrattan, and Carse, that there was a merging of cornet and trumpet playing styles to some extent.

Hall’s original contributions to the development of trumpet/cornet playing styles can be identified as those that are not included in either tutor by his teacher, Morrow. Hall develops trumpet playing style in two main areas. Firstly, although he urges caution he does not forbid practising in the extreme upper register, stating: “There are some notes above the top C which can be obtained, but these should not be attempted until the player feels he can produce them easily and without any undue strain” (Hall 1937: 6). Regrettably, he does not provide any specific exercises in this register. However, Morrow believes that practising in the extreme upper register can physically damage a cornettist stating: “some notes above the top C can be obtained, but they are too high to be effective and their practice would spoil the lips of the player, as they require too much tension” (Morrow 1911: 6). The second area of development is the increase in technical facility that is required to play the “Four Master Studies” towards the end of the book. These studies display a similarity to the “Fourteen Grand Studies” in the *Cornet Method* of

Arban (Arban 1907: 193–207), alluded to above. Hall's studies are much more extended in length, make greater and more sustained use of the high register, and are more chromatic than any of the studies in the Morrow cornet tutor. This increase in technical requirements can also be seen in the solo works by other composers chosen towards the end each of these tutors. The solos selected by Hall are all different from those chosen by Morrow and are technically far more challenging.

The development observed chronologically through the three trumpet tutor-books is a reflection of: the increasing technical demands of composers, the organological development of the instruments and mouthpieces, and the pursuit of reliability and security in the execution of their parts by the trumpeters themselves.

Brass playing styles identified in literature concerning early recordings

The study of historical playing styles in general has grown considerably in recent years. Initially, the study of performance practice involved the study of historical documents, such as the tutor-books, as analysed above, and surviving instruments, for example those described in Chapter One. The study of early recordings came later, particularly with the work of Robert Philip. He published two books in 1992 and 2004 respectively that examine numerous early recordings, mainly from the first half of the twentieth century, which encompass the whole of Elgar's recording career. It is his first book, *Early Recordings and Musical Style*, that deals mostly with performing style, and comments extensively upon the performance of orchestras generally and, separately, on pianists, string and woodwind players. However, brass playing is only briefly mentioned.

Among the general observations regarding playing style Philip identifies flexibility of tempo as a major feature, and illustrates this with many detailed examples. These show that performers of Elgar's time enhanced the expression in a performance by the constant use of rubato. In addition, there was much freer interpretation of rhythm compared to performances given from the middle of the twentieth century, and less emphasis was given to the overall precision of the ensemble. The use of portamento in both solo and orchestral string playing is discussed at length, with many examples, but no mention is made of its use by brass players. The increasing use of vibrato both on strings and certain woodwind instruments (most notably flute, oboe and bassoon) is again considered at length, but his only reference to brass is the observation that it "is sometimes heard on the flute and cornet" quoted from the first edition of *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (1879-1889) (Philip 1992: 212). The other mention of brass instruments by Philip is the increasing use of wider-bore instruments which he believes was to facilitate "greater power, clarity and control" (Philip 1992: 229). However, as will be seen in Chapter Seven, the long F trumpet, for which Elgar wrote between 1896 and 1901, had a wider bore than the shorter B-flat trumpet, for which Elgar wrote almost exclusively from 1902 to the end of his career.

A more recent, and in-depth, study of the development of woodwind playing styles on recordings made between 1909 and 1939 has been undertaken by Emily Worthington (Worthington 2013). The playing styles of individual players are identified and related to their backgrounds, and to the instruments they used. The organological features of their instruments are then related to the playing styles described. A major theme of this study is the development of the use of vibrato during this period. As yet, to my knowledge, no study of this kind has been undertaken regarding brass instruments.

Extant recordings provide some evidence of brass playing styles, even though the pre-electric recordings (before 1926) tend to lack clarity, and there is much extraneous noise. In addition, there were many restrictions on the instrumentation; for example, the number of players who could be physically close enough to the recording horn to be “picked up” was very limited. Philip comments that pre-electric recordings were “a partial representation of what the musicians achieved in concert performance” (Philip 2004: 28). Consequently, it has been decided that the only recordings from this pre-electric era to be considered are those of solo performers.

The analysis of a selection of early recordings

Recordings by solo cornettists

In Chapter One, the increasing popularity of military music was discussed. A cornet solo was an essential part of performances by all bands and many concert orchestras. A recording from 1911 of Sergeant Leggett, who joined the band of the Scots Guards in 1890 and became solo cornet in 1894, performing the *Serenade* by Gounod provides a fine example of a popular cornet solo (CD Track 1). Tarr states that Leggett was the favourite cornettist of King Edward (VII) and quotes the October 1912 edition of *Edison's Phonographic Monthly*: “The records he has made ... are marked by that perfect phrasing without which cornet playing, like singing, is not beyond criticism”. Concerning this recording, Tarr comments on the “interesting use of rubato”, and Leggett’s manner of “constantly pressing forward” (Tarr 2005: 12). Listening to this recording there are two noticeable stylistic features. Firstly, the almost constant use of vibrato which is fast and consistent in speed. Secondly, the anticipation of the next beat which may be what Tarr calls “pressing forward”. This anticipation of a note also correlates with the section in the

Hall tutor regarding portamento, as the notes when Leggett is anticipating the next beat are always approached with a slight portamento, and occurs to both ascending and descending intervals. The legato style is consistent and the sound is sustained throughout. There is some dynamic shape to the phrasing and the playing has an obvious lyrical quality to it.

The vibrato used by Edwin Firth (1888-1918), solo cornet with Foden's Motor Works Band, in his recording of *Cleopatra* by Damaré (CD Track 2), released in March 1914, is slightly slower, but immediately apparent; Tarr describes his style as "vibrato-rich" (Tarr 2005: 13). Another striking feature of this performance is the anticipation of the beat in the final notes of a phrase, which further substantiates Tarr's statement regarding this feature discussed earlier. This anticipation is similar to the Leggett recording, although these notes are tongued rather than slurred and *Cleopatra* is played at a much faster tempo than *Serenade*. Triple tonguing is used extensively in *Cleopatra* and Firth articulates this clearly, but it is often uneven with a slight tendency to hurry each group of three.⁶⁴

These two recordings provide evidence that cornet players before WW1 projected the musical ideas of the music in an almost overstated manner. They made great use of vibrato incorporating portamento to enhance a legato, lyrical style. Their use of multiple-tonguing techniques in faster music adds a "showman-like" quality to the performance. Perhaps the most expressive technique in both fast and slow solos was the anticipation of the next or final notes, giving the impression that the soloist, and their audience, could not wait to get there.

⁶⁴ Firth's career was tragically curtailed when he was killed in battle on 1 June 1918 near Amiens, France.

Recordings of orchestral performances

Recordings of orchestral works made before WW2 are many and varied. Towards the end of his career Elgar became a prolific recording artist, recording many of his own compositions; it is therefore appropriate that most of the orchestral recordings analysed in this section, in order to identify the brass playing styles, are those made by Elgar, after the invention of the electric recording system. This is preceded by an analysis of the trumpet playing on a recording of the “Hallelujah” Chorus from Handel’s *Messiah*.

During Elgar’s career, performances of Handel’s *Messiah* were extremely widespread across the country, ranging from those given by local choral societies, to performances at every Three Choirs Festival in the last decades of the nineteenth century. For example, a performance was given by the North Malvern Choral Society on 28 March 1889 with Elgar leading the orchestra.⁶⁵ The two trumpet parts in *Messiah* are not extensive but are prominent, particularly in the obbligato solo “The Trumpet shall sound”, and the “Hallelujah” chorus. On 2 April 1926 a live recording was made at the Royal Albert Hall, London, of a performance of the “Hallelujah” chorus with the Royal Choral Society and the Royal Albert Hall Orchestra conducted by Malcolm Sargent (CD Track 3). Tarr notes that “this is a perfect example of the monumental Handelian [sic] style, with hundreds of performers and excessive rubato, still in vogue in England during the first half of the 20th century” (Tarr 2005: 15). Even though the forces employed in this performance are large the trumpet parts can be clearly heard.

The rubato, mentioned by Tarr, is extensive, almost halving or doubling the tempo at times, and this leads to some problems of ensemble. However, as Philip mentions, ensemble

⁶⁵ The concert programme for this performance is held at the Elgar Birthplace Museum.

was not exact in orchestras performing in these early recordings, and this could be considered a stylistic feature (Philip 1992: 6). In the penultimate bar, where both trumpets and the timpani play a rhythmic flourish, the trumpets generally play together with an effective balance between the parts, but there is a lack of ensemble with the timpanist, whose interpretation of the rubato is obviously different from that of the trumpets. This rhythmic flourish is the only embellishment discernible in this performance: there is no ornamentation, such as the now customary trill at cadence-points. The articulation of the trumpeters is clear, with the shorter note values, quavers and semiquavers, being played in a staccato manner; this staccato is particularly prominent in the solo descending scale in bar 57 (at 2'33" on the recording). The longer notes are generally given their full length, although the trumpets match the chorus in a stylish manner in bars thirty-seven to forty with a slightly detached style which emphasises the gravity of the text (1'40" to 1'52" on the recording). The clear and rather heavy articulation evident in this recording mirrors the instructions on articulation given in both the Harper and Morrow tutor-books. In complete contrast to the two recordings of cornet soloists discussed above, there is no use of vibrato. There are many long held notes for the trumpet in the "Hallelujah" chorus and all are held with an even sound, without fluctuation. The recording is of sufficient quality to discern that the trumpeters perform with a well projected sound, and the bright timbre that is produced when playing loudly. This brilliant sound-quality is not apparent in the two recordings by the cornettists, Firth and Leggett.

Elgar recorded the Symphony in E flat, his second symphony, on 1 April 1927 with the London Symphony Orchestra. The recording is of particular interest to this study as this is the only electrical recording Elgar made of this symphony, and so must have been the occasion when Elgar changed the score in response to his interaction with Ernest Hall, concerning Hall's lengthening of the high *b*" in the last movement, described in Chapter

Four. On the recording of the Symphony in E flat the trumpet high *b*” (the “Hall” note), in the second bar after rehearsal figure 149, is held for the full bar (CD Track 4 53”-55” on the recording). It dominates the ensemble with a noticeable crescendo; Ernest Hall is audibly proud of his contribution to Elgar’s musical argument. There are a number of other interesting features discernible on this recording. Firstly, Elgar writes a number of triplet-semiquaver flourishes for the trumpets in the first and last movements. On the recording these lack projection when played in the middle and upper register and are barely audible in the lower register, although this might be partly an effect of the recording quality. However, the possibility that the trumpeters could not project the sound in quick passagework cannot be dismissed, particularly as other sections of rapid passagework are also barely audible; for example, the slurred ascending chromatic scale in the bar before rehearsal figure 41 (CD Track 5 at 53” on the recording). A further feature of the trumpet playing on this recording that leads to doubts regarding the trumpeters’ projection of fast-moving passages is the overall wide dynamic range they achieve. In addition to the high *b*” in the last movement, the “Hall” note, there are many other passages where the trumpeters project well in the ensemble when contributing to the melodic argument. For example, after the almost inaudible chromatic run before rehearsal figure 41 the trumpets project through the orchestral texture in a fanfare-like passage (CD Track 5 at 1’15” to 1’18” on the recording). Secondly, there is a conspicuous lack of slurring by the trumpets, as illustrated by the opening of the slow (second) movement where notes are marked slurred but are realised with legato, “soft”, tonguing (CD Track 6 from 38” onwards). This is similar to, and matches the style of, the trombone playing on the recording; trombone players have the added difficulty of slide technique to overcome in slurring. Interestingly, this playing style differs from the woodwinds and horns who can be heard to slur. The statement of the main theme of the slow movement, referred to above, is played quietly and controlled. Also at the quieter end of the dynamic scale the chords between rehearsal

figures 32 and 34 in the first movement are realised sensitively, with a delicate, yet precise, articulation (CD Track 7 at 1'20" to 1'40" on the recording). There is no sense of the trumpets "playing safe"; they contribute fully to the emotional journey of this performance, and, perhaps as a consequence of this, their performance is not blemish-free.

On 15 July 1927 a retake of the Rondo movement from the Symphony in E flat was made, the reason for which illuminates an aspect of orchestral playing style of the 1920s. Jerrold Northrop Moore describes this retake in detail. The recording engineer evidently identified extraneous noise on the original take and Elgar welcomed the opportunity to correct issues of ensemble. As has been previously observed, a looser ensemble was the norm in early recordings but a point must come where the musical ideas become so blurred that the performance fails to communicate the composer's intentions. That this was the issue Elgar wanted to address is evidenced by a recording of part of the rehearsal immediately prior to the retake. The transcript of this rehearsal provided by Moore demonstrates how Elgar worked at keeping the ensemble by asking various sections of the orchestra to make their parts more prominent "to keep the rhythm" and not to rush (Moore 1992 revised 1993: 18-19).

Elgar wrote for trumpets and cornets together only for a short time around 1901, the concert overture *Cockaigne* being the most extensive of these works. Elgar made two electrical recordings of this work, the first with the Royal Albert Hall Orchestra on 27 April 1926, and the second with the BBC Symphony Orchestra 11 April 1933. The analysis of these recordings will focus on two questions. Firstly, is there an audible difference between the playing style and the tonal qualities of the trumpets as opposed to the cornets?

Secondly, is there any evidence in a development of playing styles and standards of performance between these recordings some seven years apart?

The contrast in tonal quality between the trumpets and cornets is discernible on both recordings (CD Track 8 (1933 recording) 25" onwards and CD Track 9 (1926 recording) 23" onwards). The more mellow tone of the cornets is contrasted (implicitly by the composer) with the more brilliant trumpet tone which, as these recordings demonstrate, can become strident in the louder passages. The cornets blend with the other wind instruments to a greater extent than that of the trumpets. There is, however, no discernible difference in playing styles between the trumpets and cornets. Most notable is the lack of any use of vibrato by the cornets on either recording. The trumpets and the cornets articulate in a similar manner with the semiquavers being realised in a staccato style, and a slight tendency to rush is evident, particularly on the earlier recording. The tempo Elgar adopts is noticeably faster in the earlier recording; overall the 1926 recording is 13'3" in duration and the 1933 recording is timed at 13'30". The slightly slower tempo in the second recording evidently helps the players to articulate the passagework more clearly, avoiding the somewhat rushed feel of the earlier recording.

There are two further differences in these recordings in relation to the trumpets and cornets. Firstly, in the 1933 recording the first trumpet part is more prominent, particularly when notes in the higher register are played. This is noticeable at rehearsal figure 17 with the high *b-flat*" projected through the orchestral texture (CD Track 8 at 36" on the recording). In this recording the first trumpet player of the BBC Symphony Orchestra was most likely to be Ernest Hall; the sound quality and projection of tone, particularly in the upper register, matches that in Elgar's recording of the Symphony in E-flat, discussed

above.⁶⁶ Secondly, there are more obvious blemishes in the cornet playing in the 1933 recording, as for example the technically difficult cornet interjection five bars after rehearsal figure 35 is not accurately realised (CD Track 10 at 1'13"). This interjection on the 1926 recording is clear and fluent even at a slightly faster tempo (CD Track 11 at 1'10"). These differences between the two recordings can be considered less of a development in playing style but merely differences between individual players.

The most obvious contrast in playing styles when considering this small group of recordings is the difference between the orchestral cornet players and the band cornet players: the orchestral cornets do not use vibrato whereas the band players play with a constant vibrato. The band cornet players use slurring and some portamento but the orchestral players do not. There is no audible use of portamento by any of the woodwind or brass players in the orchestras, but it is still evident in the string playing, and it is coordinated and controlled. The orchestral cornets may not have had the freedom to use these techniques as part of a large ensemble playing many different parts.

The lack of slurring in orchestral trumpet and cornet playing may have been historical, with Harper offering only limited attention to slurring in his tutor-book. The limited use of slurring did however continue past the period of this study. My own teacher, William J. Overton (1910-1976), who was a pupil of Ernest Hall and succeeded him as principal trumpet in the BBC Symphony Orchestra in 1950, advocated the use of a “soft” tonguing technique as opposed to true slurring to gain increased security. The author remembers Overton impressively demonstrating the ballerina solo from Stravinsky’s *Petrushka* “soft” tongued and commenting that no conductor had ever complained to him about not slurring.

⁶⁶ Ernest Hall left the position of principal trumpet with the London Symphony Orchestra in 1930 to become principal trumpet of the newly formed BBC Symphony Orchestra in that year.

Conclusions

The analysis of contemporary tutor-books provides a consistent description of the playing style advocated by the three leading trumpeters, Harper Jnr., Morrow and Hall, during the span of Elgar's career with some limited development in articulation. These three trumpeters were related to each other through teacher-pupil relationships, and between them, over time, created a distinctive British style of playing. The main features of this style were clear, crisp articulation, limited use of slurring, and an even tone without the use of vibrato. This distinctive British style contrasts, to some extent, with that of continental trumpeters, as described by Tarr. This British style is illustrated on all of the orchestral recordings analysed, and contrasts with the style evident on the recordings of band cornettists, who made great use of vibrato and played in a much more legato style.

The playing styles advocated in both the Harper and Morrow trumpet tutors have little in common with the style of the band cornet soloists. This should be expected since the Harper tutor was aimed solely at trumpet students, and exclusively the slide trumpet, whilst Morrow in his introduction writes disparagingly of the cornet and cornet players with comments such as: "most good cornet players I have known over during the last thirty years ... have at some time 'taken to the trumpet' ... but after a very short trial ... have abandoned it as too difficult" (Morrow 1907: VII). Furthermore, Morrow's negative attitude towards the use of the cornet in the orchestra is reflected in his comments in his cornet tutor-book regarding transposition, quoted earlier in this chapter. However, the Hall tutor-book – foreshadowed, it should be emphasised, by the Morrow cornet tutor-book – does reflect this cornet style to a limited extent, particularly with the attention given to slurring and the brief section regarding the use of portamento.

The convergence of trumpet and cornet playing styles noted by Carse and Wallace & McGrattan is corroborated to some extent by the Hall tutor, written for both trumpet and cornet and based upon the previous cornet tutor by Morrow. However, as both Carse and Wallace & McGrattan observe, this convergence of trumpet and cornet styles may have occurred more as a result of trumpeters performing jazz, which, as stated in the Introduction, is beyond the scope of this study.

The quest for expansionism, security, homogeneity and uniformity across the brass section during the twentieth century identified by Baines is not fully corroborated by the findings of this study into the playing style of trumpeters during the early part of the twentieth century. There is evidence of striving for greater security with the adoption of a specific pattern of articulation in multiple tonguing techniques. However, homogeneity was diminished within the brass section by the sound of the B-flat trumpet. The brilliance of this instrument's sound in the higher register contrasted with the sound of the horns, trombones and tuba.

The playing styles of trumpeters and cornettists identified in this chapter are very different from those of today. The next chapter will explore one possible reason, that the playing styles were influenced by the playing characteristics of the instruments in use.

Chapter Seven

Performances using instruments from the early twentieth century

In Chapter Six I sought to identify playing styles and technical developments in trumpet and cornet performance during Elgar's career from written sources, such as tutor-books, and evidence provided by early recordings. In this chapter, I attempt to ascertain to what extent the playing styles identified are characteristics of the instruments themselves.

There have been many scientific studies of the acoustic response of wind instruments over the years, not least the work carried out at Edinburgh University by David Hendrei. His 2007 study used "expert players" to play a modern Smith-Watkins trumpet set up in four different ways, using two different mouthpieces and two different leadpipes. Unfortunately, Hendrei does not detail what, and for how long, each player performed in these tests. The sonic output from the trumpets was scientifically analysed for acoustic impedance, and, significantly, Hendrei found that a change of mouthpiece had a far greater effect than a change of leadpipe (Hendrei 2007: 110). Hendrei also examined two historic French horn crooks, one made of brass and the other made of silver, isolated from the body of the French horn, to ascertain the reason why an expert player had previously found a marked difference in the playing characteristics of the two crooks. Hendrei concluded that it was the difference in the shape of the internal taper within the bore that accounted for the difference in their respective playing characteristics (Hendrei 2007: 147).

A more relevant study for this thesis was undertaken Richard Birkemeir in the USA (Birkemeir: 1984). Birkemeir compared the response and tonal qualities of six historic

European F trumpets with two modern American C trumpets, a modern American B-flat trumpet and an historic German rotary-valved B-Flat trumpet. Birkemeir relied mainly on scientific measuring techniques, namely input impedance and frequency spectrum analysis, but he also compared his results with his own observations gained from actually playing the instruments. Birkemeir himself performed two notable orchestral extracts from the late nineteenth century, the opening of Tchaikovsky's Fourth Symphony and the trumpet solo in the Prelude to *Parsifal* by Wagner.⁶⁷ These extracts use the highest octave of the trumpet's register: Birkemeir found that the response of the F trumpets was only slightly less secure than the modern C trumpets (Birkemeir 1984: 119). However, Birkemeir remarks that the scientific findings regarding tone quality did not always correlate with those perceived aurally by the listener (Birkemeir 1984: 139). Significantly, Birkemeir found that the F trumpets as a group were tonally close to the historic rotary-valved B-flat trumpet (Birkemeir 1984: 155). Unfortunately, Birkemeir does not describe the mouthpieces used in these tests, nor take into account the effect of the mouthpiece on each instrument's response or tone.

Further work comparing the modern C trumpet with the F trumpet was undertaken in 2004 by Jeremy Brekke. Brekke played the instruments in an orchestral setting, recording eight orchestral excerpts with the aid of two colleagues. Brekke set out to compare their different timbres aurally: the trumpeters played both on C trumpets and F trumpeters and Brekke concluded that the F trumpet produced a "more heroic and martial" sound that was "more homogenous" with other orchestral instruments (Brekke 2004: 98-100). Two of the three F trumpets were modern instruments: Brekke does not describe the mouthpieces used. He does comment on the playing characteristics of the F trumpet, agreeing with Birkemeir as to security in the higher register. On the other hand, he found the F trumpet much less

⁶⁷ Prout comments on this passage when discussing the use of the 12th harmonic of the trumpet, stating that "the note is difficult to get, and, indeed, extremely risky except with first-rate players" (Prout 1898: 211)

secure than the C trumpet when attempting an octave leap in an excerpt from Richard Strauss's *Sinfonia Domestica* (Brekke 2004: 101).

These studies indicate that scientific research without human involvement can only provide a partial answer regarding the response of a wind instrument. In performance the instrument and the player are as one, neither can function without the other. As regards the trumpet, it is the player's lips, supported by the teeth, which produce the vibration that is initiated usually by the tongue (articulation) and the release of the air. As every trumpeter has unique facial and dental structures, a machine, at best, could only provide a reductive, unmusical replication of the way a trumpeter plays. Neither Birkemeir's nor Brekke's research provide answers to my question of how the playing styles identified in the previous chapter relate to the playing characteristics of historic instruments. For my purposes here, the most significant outcome is the subjective judgment of the quality of tone of the F trumpet, and the partially subjective assessment of playing characteristics of the diverse instruments.

A central problem in studying historic instruments is how they would have been played. This is a factor not only of the construction of the instrument but of the pragmatics of playing them. The latter includes questions surrounding the physicality of the particular player and his/her aesthetic ideals, such as preferred sound quality and articulation. None of these questions can be answered solely by studying the instruments themselves: instead they call for a methodology involving on the one hand careful study of how the most respected players played and taught, and on the other, studies involving the processes of playing the instruments. The Historical Performance movement, ever since the time of Arnold Dolmetsch in the later nineteenth century, has insisted that the only way to develop understanding of early instruments is to learn to

play them. This, in essence, is an ‘Action Research’ methodology, involving cycles of action and reflection.

According to Bruce Archer, one of the pioneers of Action Research:

There are circumstances where the best or only way to shed light on a proposition, a principle, a material, a process or a function is to attempt to construct something, or to enact something, calculated to explore, embody or test it (Archer 1995: 11).

Action research provided me with the tools for a far more in-depth study than either Birkemeir or Brekke undertook, using a selection of different historic instruments (trumpets and cornets) with matching mouthpieces, involving diverse repertoire, using different articulations, with varied dynamics, a wide range of pitch and including an element of quasi-sectional and ensemble performance through multi-track recording. This research also required a performer trained to a professional standard, who had enough time to practise the different historic instruments to a sufficient standard of fluency on each, and to have time to reflect on the technical and musical aspects of the learning process and its outcomes. The obvious candidate to carry out such an exploration was myself.

Over the last ten years I have collected a number of historic instruments and have striven to learn to play them. This has provided first-hand evidence of the differences between the instruments and their peculiar characteristics and limitations. In the following paragraphs I provide a personal account of this journey, which was sometimes frustrating for me as a modern professional trumpeter, but also deeply rewarding and always fascinating.

I begin with a description of the procurement of three historic instruments, an F trumpet, a B-flat trumpet and a B-flat/A cornet, their physical characteristics, and the acquisition of the

skills required to play them, with contemporary mouthpieces. The physical measurements and design of each instrument are related to the effect these features have on the way they play. This is followed by an exploration of the sonic qualities of the instruments, both individually and in combination, which are then contrasted with each other. The playing characteristics of the instruments are related to how Elgar scores for them. The outcome of this research is presented in the form of recordings playing all three of the above instruments, and discussed in a commentary on the technical and musical aspects of the performances recorded.

Recent scholarly texts have tended to ignore the problems of how to play late nineteenth-century/early twentieth-century trumpets. For example, Elisa Koehler offers over four pages of text on playing the natural trumpet as used up to the mid-nineteenth century (Koehler 2014: 13-17), but only contributes a photograph of hand positions, demonstrated by John Miller, regarding the F trumpet (Koehler 2014: 77). Trevor Herbert makes several general points about playing all wind instruments from the Romantic era:

Such instruments often feel very different from the one you normally play. They have a different weight; they fit into the hands differently; you often feel that blowing one feels physically different – the breath leaving your lips seems to meet a different level of resistance from what you are used to – and of course the sound, the voice of the instrument, is unexpectedly different. (Herbert 2002: 57)

The acknowledged leader in restoring and performing on historic trumpets is Crispian Steele-Perkins. In his book, *Trumpet* (Steele-Perkins 2001), he provides copious advice on playing various trumpets and related instruments from the seventeenth century to the present day, including the nineteenth-century cornet, the instrument with which Elgar was

familiar. However, Steele-Perkins does not offer any thoughts regarding the playing of the F trumpet.

In addition to providing the aural and experiential evidence for this thesis, the recording of the CD helped give focus to my task of learning to play these three historic instruments, and achieve the standard of performance needed to fully explore the above issues. The recordings took place over an eighteen-month period, and consist of exercises selected from contemporary tutor-books, multi-track recorded orchestral excerpts and excerpts from a contemporaneous composition for trumpet and piano. The attached CD is an aural record of my research into playing the instruments for which Elgar scored. This performance-based research also provided a practical context from which to consider Harper Jnr.'s remark concerning the ease of playing the cornet as opposed to the trumpet and Morrow's derisory comments concerning the B-flat trumpet, which he called a "trumpetina". Furthermore, does using the F trumpet make a difference in those works Elgar scored for it, or is the modern B-flat trumpet an adequate substitute?

Preparations for the recordings

I have been learning to play instruments from this period over a number of years. With this experience I gained sufficient fluency prior to these recording sessions that I was able to give a number of short lecture recitals playing the F trumpet, the one used in the recordings, a B-flat cornet that had been converted into low pitch and not used in the recordings, and a John Webb copy of an early nineteenth-century slide trumpet. The music performed in the recitals included exercises from the Harper Jnr. tutor-book, some well-known orchestral excerpts and a short work for cornet and piano. For the recordings I omitted using the slide trumpet, as Elgar did not score for this instrument (as discussed in

Chapters Three and Four). All the instruments used in my research and played by myself on the CD, accompanying this thesis, are from my personal collection.

The instruments chosen for this research needed to satisfy two main criteria. Firstly, the instruments should be as original as possible without any modifications such as conversion from high pitch, as was the case with the cornet used in the recitals. The extra lengths of tubing added to convert this cornet to low pitch may have altered the playing characteristics, to be much closer to that of a modern instrument. As far as can be ascertained from the physical appearance of the instruments used for the recordings none had been modified. Secondly, they should play well with consistency across the range, and with as secure intonation as possible.

The number of instruments of each type that were available to me was roughly proportional to the number of instruments built during the period of Elgar's career. Very few F trumpets were available; no nineteenth-century B-flat trumpets could be found, but a good supply of instruments made in the 1920s were obtained in playing condition; cornets could be found in abundance, although many had been modified from the higher pitch of the time to the modern pitch of A 440. The only source I could find from which to purchase the F trumpet was the collector and maker of replica instruments, John Webb, who had three instruments for sale. Two were made in the late nineteenth century but the one I selected was an instrument from the early years of the twentieth century, made by Boosey & Co., in excellent condition and showing little signs of use. Had it been a poor instrument this would have explained its lack of use, but I judged it to be fine instrument that blew consistently with reasonable intonation across the range. Throughout this thesis I have argued that the F trumpet was already falling from favour by 1904 when this instrument was made, a point Webb made to me when I purchased the instrument, and this may

account for its apparent lack of use. I found four B-flat trumpets, three from an internet auction website and one from a private sale. Cornets from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries are readily available from internet auction websites, charity shops and antique fairs, and I purchased six instruments.

Consequently, I had to make a choice of which B-flat trumpet and which cornet I would use to play on the recordings. I chose a Boosey & Co. trumpet for two reasons: it played consistently with reasonable intonation and, due to the number built by this major manufacturer, was likely to be similar to the instruments played by trumpeters with whom Elgar worked in the 1920s. The cornet I chose was manufactured in Birmingham before World War I, by Gisborne, and would therefore be similar to the cornets used by cornettists from the Midlands with whom Elgar worked. The sound is consistent and reasonably in tune. However, the only B-flat crook supplied with the instrument was in high pitch which caused some issues during the recordings. I shall discuss this problem in due course.

A particular problem was the acquisition of suitable historic mouthpieces. The mouthpiece is physically small and completely detaches from the instrument, so that instrument and mouthpiece can easily become separated and the mouthpiece subsequently lost. This problem was greatest with the F trumpet as no mouthpiece was supplied with the instrument, and it was further compounded by the diameter of the mouthpiece receiver being much wider than on either the cornet or B-flat trumpet. Initially, I adapted a modern mouthpiece, expanding its shank with plumber's tape to produce a tight enough fit into the receiver. This proved to be satisfactory in that the notes produced were centred, consistent and generally in tune. In addition, in my recitals I used matching modern mouthpieces on the other instruments, enabling the change of instruments to be easily managed. However, when I eventually found a copy of an historic mouthpiece, the way the instrument played,

and the sound it produced, changed completely. John Humphries writes of the French Horn: “Using a modern mouthpiece on an old instrument will deny its full tonal potential” (Humphries 2000: 42) and the same seems to be true of the F trumpet. Therefore, I decided to use only historic or copies of historic mouthpieces on all the instruments.

The music recorded on the CD can be divided into three categories: exercises from tutor-books, orchestral excerpts from the works of Elgar, and a solo work for the F trumpet and piano. The exercises were taken only from the trumpet tutor-books of Morrow and Hall, as the Harper Jnr. publication was written for the slide trumpet. The exercises were chosen to demonstrate the technical difficulties and the sonic qualities of the instruments. The orchestral excerpts were taken from compositions spanning twenty-three years, chosen to demonstrate the different sound worlds created by the use of the three different instruments. The excerpt from *Cockaigne* was multitrack-recorded on the F trumpet and the B-flat cornet enabling a close comparison of their respective sonic qualities. The lack of solo works written for trumpet during the period of Elgar’s career was commented upon in Chapter One, and the *Legend* by Orlando Morgan, a piano professor at the Guildhall School of Music and Drama, composed around 1904, is one of the few works currently known. Scored for F trumpet and piano it may have been composed for Walter Morrow, who was a professor at the Guildhall School, in addition to his teaching at the Royal College of Music, at the time of composition. The publisher of *Legend*, probably mindful of the restricted market for compositions scored for F trumpet, provides an alternative part for B-flat cornet. Excerpts from the work are performed twice on the CD, on the F trumpet and on the B-flat cornet, further demonstrating the difference in the sound world of each instrument.

The instruments

In this section I briefly describe each instrument, prior to a commentary on the individual tracks on the CD. The F trumpet was manufactured by Boosey & Co. and from the serial number on the bell section (67133) can be dated as manufactured in March/April 1904. The cornet, manufactured by A. Hall Gisborne (serial number 16478), can only be dated from the address engraved on the instrument, Vere Street Birmingham, where the factory was located between 1902 and 1913 (Waterhouse 1993: 135). The B-flat trumpet, in common with many instruments of the time, has a rotary valve that opens an extra length of tubing to lower the pitch to A; it was manufactured by Boosey & Co., and the serial number (125977) dates the instrument to 1926.⁶⁸

The physical characteristics of all brass instruments, weight, length, bore and overall design, have a direct effect on the way they play. The F trumpet is physically the largest instrument, consisting of 6 feet⁶⁹ of tubing as opposed to 4 feet 6 inches in both instruments pitched in B flat. Both measurements exclude the additional length of the valve slides. The weights of the instruments used were: the F trumpet 2lbs 11ozs, the B-flat cornet and B-flat trumpet both 2lbs 7ozs. Although the F trumpet is not significantly heavier than the B-flat instrument, as much of the weight is made up by the valve block, the design of the F trumpet produces the longest instrument at 22 1/2 inches without the mouthpiece, and 25 1/2 inches with it. The B-flat trumpet is 19 3/4 inches long without the mouthpiece, and 20 3/4 inches with it. The cornet is the shortest at 13 1/2 inches long without the mouthpiece, and the same length with the B-flat crook inserted.⁷⁰ A measurement that is

⁶⁸ Photographs of all the instruments used are included in Appendix 16.

⁶⁹ An Imperial to Metric conversion table is included in Appendix 15.

⁷⁰ As can be seen from the photograph of the cornet in Appendix 16.

crucial to the ease of playing is the distance from the mouthpiece rim that rests on the lips to the front of the valve casing. This measurement for the F trumpet is 10 inches, the B-flat trumpet 6 3/8 inches and the cornet 4 1/4 inches. The left hand holds the instrument around the valves and the further away it is from the player's face the greater the extension of the arms. This produces a pivot effect particularly when playing the heavier F trumpet. Consequently, the F trumpet tires the arms of the performer much more quickly than the cornet. This explains why the cornet is often recommended as a beginner's instrument today (Steele-Perkins 2001: 118).

The diameter of the bore of a trumpet or cornet has an effect on the sound quality of the instrument. This diameter has been measured at the second valve slide of each instrument, which is cylindrical tubing to enable telescopic adjustment, and gives the best indication of the diameter of the bore. The F trumpet and the cornet are identical at 13/32 inch diameter; the B-flat trumpet has a noticeably smaller bore at 12/32 inch. According to Vincent Bach "a smaller bored instrument produces a more brilliant tone and the larger bored instrument produces a mellower tone, but other factors also have an effect on the tone quality, not least the size and shape of the mouthpiece" (Bach 1916 [1969]: 9).

Of greater importance than the overall diameter of the bore is the degree of taper in the tubing. All trumpets and cornets have a taper towards the bell producing a flare. The often-asserted definitions that the trumpet is cylindrical in bore whereas the cornet is conical are oversimplifications, particularly on modern instruments. However, there is a greater amount and degree of taper in the tubing of the cornet compared to the trumpet.

The Gisborne instrument is a good example of a cornet as described by Myers (Myers 2012: 113). It has a pronounced taper with the bore of the instrument gradually widening

by 1/8 inch from the mouthpiece end of the crook for a length of 14 inches to the beginning of the tuning slide. The Boosey & Co. F trumpet adheres to Myers' description of a trumpet as a cylindrical instrument with no discernible taper in the tubing from the mouthpiece end of the crook to the beginning of the bell section, which begins after the valve block. The B-flat Boosey & Co. trumpet is a later instrument, and has a section of tapered tubing from the mouthpiece receiver to the beginning of the tuning slide. This is 7 inches in length and expands by only 1/32 inch, much less than on the cornet. The tapered section of tubing from the mouthpiece receiver is now known as the leadpipe, and is fixed permanently on a modern instrument. The leadpipe is regarded as a key component by modern trumpet manufacturers, with professional-quality instruments being offered with numerous leadpipe options. The overall bore profile affects the manner in which an instrument plays. David Hickman summarises the prevailing view today:

Generally, a more conically-shaped instrument (such as a cornet) has greater ease of flexibility but a less discernible slotting of notes. Conversely, a more cylindrical instrument (such as a trumpet) feels stiffer to the player in terms of flexibility but has much more discernible note 'centres' (Hickman 2006: 292/293)

The Mouthpieces

Mouthpieces are far more than just an adjunct to the instrument, and their vital role in trumpet performance has long been recognised. According to Harper Jnr.:

The Mouthpiece is of greater importance to the performer than is generally supposed. With a good Mouthpiece it is possible to play on a badly constructed

instrument; but with a badly proportioned Mouthpiece, it is impossible to perform in tune, or with any degree of certainty, on the best of instruments. (Harper Jnr. 1875: 4)

Vincent Bach agrees:

Even on a high grade instrument satisfactory results cannot possibly be obtained with an inferior mouthpiece, while on the other hand a perfect mouthpiece will permit surprisingly good results even on a second grade instrument. (Bach 1916[1969]: 11)

The part of the mouthpiece that is placed on the trumpeter's lips, the rim, is of great importance for comfort and allowing the lips to vibrate. The diameter of the cup affects the amount of lip that can vibrate. The depth and shape of the cup determine how the vibrations, created by the lips, are channelled into the instrument. The throat at the bottom of the cup controls the volume and amount of vibration entering the backbore, which on all mouthpieces is tapered and opens into the tubing of the instrument.

The mouthpiece I used with the F trumpet is a copy of an historic mouthpiece made by Keats in approximately 1902.⁷¹ When comparing the mouthpieces for each of the three instruments the rim of the F trumpet mouthpiece is the narrowest, at 7/32 inch⁷², and is the flattest in contour. The diameter of the cup is the widest at 20/32 inch but also the shallowest at 17/32 inch. The cornet mouthpiece is historic but bears no maker's name. The rim is the more rounded of the three, 9/32 inch wide and the cup is the deepest at 21/32 inch with a diameter of 19/32 inch. The B-flat trumpet mouthpiece is engraved with the maker's name and model, Hawkes Model Bb T, thus pre-dating the merger of Boosey

⁷¹ This mouthpiece and information were supplied by Crispian Steele-Perkins.

⁷² The measurements were taken with engineers callipers, for width, and a dial gauge, for depth.

& Co. with Hawkes in 1930. It shares some features with the cornet mouthpiece with the same rim width and cup diameter, but it is shallower at 18/32 inch. This mouthpiece sits in between the other two with regard to the contour of the rim – rounded but not as pronounced as the cornet mouthpiece. The shape of the cup could not be accurately measured, but by sight and feel the cup of the cornet mouthpiece appeared to be more conically shaped than either of the trumpet mouthpieces.

The dimensions of both the diameter of the cup and the overall length of my F trumpet mouthpiece match those suggested by Morrow and Harper. Morrow advises that the minimum cup diameter be 5/8 inch (Morrow 1907: introduction) and Harper states that the mouthpiece should be 3 1/2 inches long (Harper 1875: 4), which is exactly the length of my mouthpiece. The width of the rim of my mouthpiece is wider than the minimum suggested by Harper of 1/8 inch (Harper 1875: 4), but is only 1/32 inch wider than a Kohler & Son historic mouthpiece held in the Bate Collection, Oxford. This historic mouthpiece is also 3 1/2 inches in length and the shape of its cup seems to match exactly that of my historical mouthpiece.

Due to the physical condition of the cornet mouthpiece, I believe it to be historic even though it bears no maker's markings. An historic cornet mouthpiece held in the Bate Collection exactly matches my mouthpiece. It is engraved with the maker's name, Antoine Courtois and the model name, 'LEVY'. This is likely to refer to the famous cornet player Jules Levy (1838-1903); Levy was born in England but spent most of his life in the USA. My mouthpiece thus appears to be a (possibly illegal) copy of the 'LEVY' mouthpiece.

Performing and recording using three historic instruments

Playing any musical instrument is a personal experience, and each instrument has its own individual nuances. This is particularly the case with hand-made instruments, such as were all the instruments produced in the early twentieth century. The following are my observations, a trumpeter trained in the 1970s, with forty years of professional experience.

The F trumpet

Learning to play this historic instrument was a steep learning curve. As mentioned already the valve block, being so far from the mouthpiece, creates a considerable pivot effect which pulls the bell of the instrument towards the floor. The pitch of the notes seems alien to me as the harmonic series is a fourth lower than on the B-flat trumpet. The extra length of the F trumpet leads to a very different feel to the “blow” of the instrument and a greater volume of air is required when compared to a B-flat trumpet. The acquisition of a copy of an historic mouthpiece for the F trumpet did expand the tonal potential of the instrument, enabling a variety of timbres to be created, but it made note production more difficult. I believe the reason for this is the flat rim which seems to anchor the lips, hindering their freedom to vibrate. Consequently, a stronger tonguing action is required to make a note sound. The flat rim also affects the transition from one note to the next. To achieve a smooth transition from pitch to pitch the aperture between the lips needs to adjust, but the flat rim impedes this motion, making a smooth legato difficult. Brass players usually call this transition “flexibility”, and it is further impeded by the cylindrical nature of the bore, as Hickman observed (quoted above). However, both the anchoring of the lips and the lack of flexibility enable note-focus to be reliably maintained; sustained notes in the higher register seem to gradually fade away rather than fall off in pitch when the player’s lip tires. The

problems I experienced when using a contemporary mouthpiece were recognised by Adam Carse in the late 1930s when he observed that “the old mouthpiece, with its shallow cup and sharp edge at the lower outlet, was well suited to play the old parts in which every note was tongued, but was not so well adapted for slurring from note to note” (Carse 1939: 241).

The strength of articulation required to produce a note can be heard in the first recording (CD Track 12, Ex. 17.1 in Appendix 17) which is the first exercise on page 1 of the Morrow tutor-book. The first few notes do not speak easily, and an accentuated use of the tongue was required for clear production. However, this recording also demonstrates the security of pitch that can be achieved on this mouthpiece/instrument combination. There seemed to be little danger, for me the player, of “falling off” any notes.

The design of the Boosey & Co. F trumpet does not include the provision of a water key. This affects the sound in sustained passages when an accumulation of condensation gathers and causes a “bubbling” quality in the tone. This can clearly be heard on the recording of the first exercise on page 1 of the Morrow tutor-book (CD Track 12, Ex. 17.1 in Appendix 17). The water key had been invented many years previously, as is evidenced by its presence on many cornets from the latter half of the nineteenth century, and the reason for its omission on this particular F trumpet is not known.

The tone of the F trumpet is rich and full in the lower and middle registers, but less so in the upper register, where the sound becomes rather thin and tends to acquire a fragile quality. This could lead to the lack of projection of higher notes in an orchestral setting. However, this would be offset by the capacity of higher pitches to cut through an orchestral texture. The full tone of the lower and middle registers, but fragile upper register, can be

heard on the recording of the second Morrow exercise (CD Track 13, Ex. 17.2 in Appendix 17). When playing this instrument there seems to be a considerable change in the quality of tone and security of production between *c'* and *d'*,⁷³ for example when progressing from bar 12 to 13. The tone up to *c'* is consistent and full, but the tone from *d'* upwards becomes increasingly fragile and thin. Another feature demonstrated by the recording of this study is the difficulty of playing quietly. The strong articulation needed to produce reliable note production hinders the ability to fully realise quieter dynamics.

Secure pitching is problematic on the F trumpet, particularly in the upper register, since the long tubing creates a harmonic series based on a lower fundamental than a B-flat instrument. As can be seen from the diagram of the harmonic series,⁷⁴ the upper partials become closer as the pitch ascends. These closer intervals, and the issues of producing the transition from pitch to pitch alluded to above, increase the difficulty in securely realising fast-moving music with wide intervallic jumps. The recording of the third exercise from the Morrow tutor-book (CD Track 14, Ex. 17.3 in Appendix 17) demonstrates this difficulty. I found that playing in a more staccato manner eased this problem; the gaps in sound between each note gave me time to adjust my embouchure, and this was particularly needed to achieve the leap up to the problematic *d'* at the beginning of bar 4.

The multitrack recording of the duet by Durante from the Morrow tutor-book (CD Track 15, Ex. 17.4 in Appendix 17) illustrates the rich tonal qualities of the F trumpet which, in my opinion, are enhanced when two are sounded together. Their tone blends well, suggesting that in an orchestral setting the sound of the trumpet section playing on F trumpets would

⁷³ All pitches in this thesis are in concert pitch using the Helmholtz system of notation, outlined in Appendix 7. The written pitch of extracts 1 to 11 are for trumpet in F - concert pitch is a perfect 4th above this written pitch.

⁷⁴ Please see Appendix 1.

combine well with the other brass instruments, rather than being obtrusive. This recording also illustrates that slurring, in the modern sense of not using the tongue to re-articulate the second or subsequent notes, is effective and reliable when the interval between the notes is small. However, slurring of larger intervals is much riskier. This is illustrated in the multitrack recordings of excerpts from the works of Elgar, discussed below.

The number of trumpets Elgar included in his scores increased during his career. *Light of Life* was the first occasion that Elgar scored for the F trumpet but he only calls for two and, as shown in Chapter Three, the writing is sparse. However, a number of excerpts from this work have been recorded that illustrate the sound of the two instruments playing in unison, octaves and in harmony. The nobility of the F trumpet sound is particularly prominent when the two trumpets play in unison in this passage from the first movement (CD Track 16, Ex. 17.5 in Appendix 17). This is enhanced by the use of accents which are an effective articulation on the F trumpet. The next excerpt, also from the first movement, illustrates the difficulty in slurring. CD Track 17 (Ex. 17.6 in Appendix 17) is a multitrack recording of this passage with the marked slurring attempted. As can be heard, this was only partly successful because some intermediate notes are “caught” when slurring the larger intervals. I did not feel confident that this passage could be reliably rendered slurred. However, by using a “soft tonguing” technique, identified as the playing style of this period in Chapter Six, I was able to reliably play this passage (CD Track 18, Ex. 17.6 in Appendix 17). The excerpt from the opening of No.6, “Light out of Darkness”, is scored for trumpet in E flat, but as the E-flat crook is missing from my instrument it was played on the F trumpet and transposed (CD Track 19, Ex. 17.7 in Appendix 17).⁷⁵ This recording demonstrates that slurring is possible when the intervals are close and in the middle register. The nobility of sound of the F trumpet is conveyed in the last excerpt taken from the ending of *Light of*

⁷⁵ Arnold Myers has informed me that my instrument would originally have been supplied with 3 crooks for pitches F, E-flat and D.

Life (CD Track 20, Ex. 17.8 in Appendix 17). The rising triadic figure on the trumpets, which is reminiscent of many passages written for natural trumpet by earlier composers, enhances the triumphant quality of the ending to the work.

Two multitrack excerpts from the later works of Elgar scored for three F trumpets demonstrate the increased tonal variety achieved by the greater number of trumpets. The excerpt taken from *The Dream of Gerontius* illustrates a number of different textures (CD Track 21, Ex. 17.9 in Appendix 17). Firstly, an effective texture is created when two trumpets are playing in octaves with the other trumpet providing harmony notes in between. Interestingly, Elgar uses both the second and third trumpeters to provide these harmony notes, creating a seamless quality to the overall texture. Secondly, three-part triadic harmony is convincing, but during the preparation of this excerpt two bars were problematic. It was difficult to get the triple tongued passage at rehearsal figure 56 even and clear. I believe the reason for this is, again, the flat of rim of the mouthpiece.⁷⁶ The ‘K’ sound travels from the back of the player’s tongue, much further in the mouth than the ‘T’ sound which emanates from the behind the teeth, so that the ‘K’ articulation needs to be stronger than the ‘T’. My difficulty perfecting this execution can clearly be heard on the recording.

The final orchestral excerpt played on the F trumpet (CD Track 22, Ex. 17.10 in Appendix 17) is taken from *Enigma Variations* at the end of “I.V. (W.M.B.)”. This extract illustrates the collective sound of three F trumpets playing in a loud staccato manner, producing effect of blocks of sound. The full tone of the F trumpet in the lower and middle registers provides a solid foundation to the chords produced by the lower trumpet parts. This solid base supports the rather fragile sound of the first trumpet part played in the upper register,

⁷⁶ The development of triple tongue technique is explained in the previous chapter.

achieving a balanced section sound which, in my view, is superior to that achieved using modern B-flat trumpets. The F trumpet responds well and is more controllable when played loud, and note production is reliable when strongly articulated. I was confident recording this excerpt as all the notes are accented and played *fff*.

The final recording performed on the F trumpet (Track 23, Ex. 17.11 in Appendix 17) is a substantial portion from a work composed for F trumpet (with an alternative part supplied for B-flat cornet) and piano, *Legend*, by Orlando Morgan (1865-1956). *Legend* is a lyrical work in ternary form; it is uncomplicated with a “slavish” minor key mood and only in the faster middle section does the music have a martial quality. It is pitched in the middle and upper registers of the F trumpet and the recording illustrates all of the points made above regarding the sound qualities and characteristics of the F trumpet. The F trumpet sounds noble and heroic, but its fragile quality in the upper register can be heard at the climactic point of the faster section. Quiet note production is uneven on the recording and the multiple tonguing techniques of this faster section were, and sound to the listener, difficult to realise cleanly and evenly.

Performing on the F trumpet is like a game of risk and reward: note production is unreliable at a quiet dynamic; sustained notes at a quiet dynamic can easily fade away unintentionally; the high register is fragile and insecure; pitch security is difficult in the realisation of large interval jumps, and to achieve clean slurring is something of a lottery. All these risks are to a certain extent negated when an adapted modern mouthpiece is used. However, using a modern mouthpiece greatly reduces the rewards of playing the F trumpet. The true tonal quality and variety can only be realised by the use of a contemporaneous mouthpiece. The full nobility of tone produced by the F trumpet cannot be replicated on any modern instrument I have played in over forty years of professional

playing. The variety of tone that the F trumpet is capable of from a full, projecting and ringing sound, demonstrated on the excerpt from the ending of *Light of Life* (CD Track 20, Ex. 17.9 in Appendix 17), to the mellow blending tone, demonstrated in the Durante duet (CD Track 15, Ex. 17.4 in Appendix 17), is the reward in performing on the F trumpet.

When working as second trumpet in the Hallé Orchestra in the 1950s, Arthur Butterworth proposed that the section play parts written for the F trumpet on the F trumpet, but the section leader Willie Lang objected, stating they would not be able to perform their parts with the security that was required – “they had to earn a living” (personal interview transcribed in Appendix 18). Over the period of Elgar’s career contemporary views regarding the F trumpet changed. For example, in 1859 Charles Mandel writes “The best key … for the trumpet, is … F.” (Mandel 1859: 45) but by 1914, George Forsyth dismisses the F trumpet with the remark that “at most one or two in a generation can make it bearable” (Forsyth 1914: 93).

The B-flat Trumpet

There are immediate, noticeable differences when playing the historic B-flat trumpet compared to the F trumpet. Note production is easier and more reliable at lower dynamic levels, and the sound in the upper register is focused and well projected. However, the tone is not consistent across the range. The sound in the lower register is thin and hollow, and, interestingly, the B-flat trumpet does not blow as freely as the F trumpet. These characteristics are not unique to a particular instrument; I have obtained four instruments, including a Windsor (made in Birmingham) and a Brown (made in London) in addition to the Boosey & Co. used on the recordings, and all exhibit these characteristics.

The ease of note production on the B-flat trumpet extends the expressive and technical possibilities of the instrument. A variety of articulation is possible, and slurring in the upper register is reliable, thereby increasing the expressive potential of the instrument. This expressive potential was explored when performing an exercise from the Hall tutor-book (CD Track 24, Ex. 17.12 in Appendix 17). I could confidently play this exercise, in A minor, with a gentle articulation and a fluid, legato style. The ability to produce quiet entries, without using the strong articulation that produces an “explosive” start to the note, enables passages such as the statement of the opening theme in the slow movement of Elgar’s Symphony in E flat to be effectively realised (CD Track 25, Ex. 17.13 in Appendix 17). In addition, I found I could maintain a smooth legato at a quiet dynamic level when moving from note to note; I do not believe I could have achieved this on the F trumpet with such ease and reliability.

There are a number of reasons why the sound of the B-flat trumpet in the upper register is focused and projects well. The rim of the mouthpiece has a slightly more rounded profile compared to the mouthpiece of the F trumpet, but is flat compared to a modern mouthpiece. There is a noticeable “anchoring” effect of the flatter rim, and this is magnified by the smaller internal diameter of the mouthpiece cup. Historic mouthpieces for B-flat trumpets are readily available, and all that I trialled had a smaller cup diameter compared with the F trumpet mouthpiece. The smaller cup enhances the ease and reliability of the B-flat trumpet in the upper register. This reliability is further enhanced by the wider intervals between the harmonics in the upper register of the B-flat trumpet, make pitching more secure. Furthermore, the B-flat trumpet has a narrower bore than the F trumpet, which allows a more focused sound in the upper register.

The ease of approach towards the upper register on the B-flat trumpet can be heard in the next four recordings (CD Tracks 26, 27, 28 and 29), consisting of exercises from the Hall tutor. No “breakpoint” was discernible in either tone quality or ease of playing when ascending into the upper register performing exercise 12 (CD Track 26, Ex. 17.14 in Appendix 17). However, the performance of exercise 13 (CD Track 27, Ex. 17.15 in Appendix 17) demonstrates that the sound quality of the B-flat trumpet becomes less robust when descending into the lower register, and note production in the lower register lacks a clean, crisp articulation. It can clearly be heard in the performance of exercise 14 (CD Track 28, Ex. 17.16 in Appendix 17) that the sound of the B-flat trumpet gains a brilliant quality as pitch ascends above c' , and the difference in the clarity of production from the lower, through the middle to the upper register can be heard in the performance of exercise 20 (CD Track 29, Ex. 17.17 in Appendix 17). Elgar’s enthusiastic response to the famous “Hall” note in the last movement of the Symphony in E flat, described in Chapter Four, was probably due not only to the exceptional ability of the player but also to the brilliant quality of sound that is possible on a B flat trumpet.

The brilliant sound quality in the upper register of the B-flat trumpet is noticeable on the multitrack recording of the excerpt from Elgar’s *Falstaff* (CD Track 30, Ex. 17.18 in Appendix 17). The scoring is for three trumpets and in the chordal passages the first trumpet sound projects well with security. This excerpt also demonstrates another advantage of the B-flat trumpet as compared to the F trumpet, that wide intervals can be jumped reliably and smoothly. As was noted previously, only by playing in a staccato manner could wide intervals be securely realised on the F trumpet. The intervallic leaps in the *Falstaff* excerpt are exceptionally wide, up to an 11th, and are chromatic, including augmented 4ths and minor 7ths. This excerpt is technically demanding for all three trumpeters, but the first player has an extremely difficult rapid scale ascending to b'' flat

and then descending beyond the lowest note normally possible on the B-flat trumpet, sounding e flat. On the historic B-flat trumpet this note was achieved by “lipping”, i.e. loosening the embouchure, and this can clearly be heard on the recording. On a modern B-flat trumpet, valve slides are easily adjustable by means of saddles, rings and triggers, depending on the make, to play this low note. No historic B-flat trumpets I have seen were equipped with such devices.⁷⁷

The sound quality of the B-flat trumpet lacks fullness and projection in the lower register when compared to that of the F trumpet. This is particularly noticeable below d'; the c' seems to have a hollow quality and the sound loses focus as pitch descends. This is not a drawback unique to the Boosey & Co. instrument used on the recordings; all the historic B-flat trumpets in my collection have a similarly weak-sounding lower register. The factors that enhanced the upper register, narrow bore and a small cupped mouthpiece are detrimental to a full sound in the lower register. In all the exercises recorded from the Hall tutor, the change in sound quality between the upper and lower registers of the B-flat trumpet can be heard. In addition, I found that the B-flat trumpet “overblew” readily in the lower register, making pitch security unstable at higher dynamic levels. It was possible to overwhelm this narrow-bored instrument with the volume of air. This finding concurs with Mandel’s comments that “the broader the tube of an instrument, the more certain will be the low notes, and the narrower the tube, the more certain will be the higher notes” (Mandel 1859: 25).

The inconsistent sound quality on the B-flat trumpet leads to problems of balance in an orchestral trumpet section. The lower-pitched trumpet parts cannot match the louder dynamics of the higher-pitched parts. This is noticeable throughout the *Falstaff* excerpt. In

⁷⁷ Another solution to the production of this note is discussed in Chapter Four.

the three-part chords the lowest note lacks projection, and melodic detail in the lower register is not as prominent as in the upper register. When recording the third trumpet part of this excerpt I “overblew” the instrument to such an extent that the note completely broke up and a retake was required; in a concert situation I could not have balanced with the first trumpet part.

None of Elgar’s works requires the trumpets to play with portamento. In Chapter Six, I commented on the use of portamento in the string sections during Elgar’s career and also discussed the section in Hall’s tutor regarding portamento and anticipation of the next beat. The exercise on page 21 of this tutor (CD Track 31, Ex. 17.19 in Appendix 17) was recorded using the B-flat trumpet to ascertain just how flexible the instrument could be. It responded easily to the use of a slow valve action to accomplish the sliding effect between the notes. This was my expectation, as jazz trumpeters during the 1920s, such as Louis Armstrong, were making much use of similar half-valve effects in their improvised solos.

The B-flat Cornet

Throughout this thesis evidence has been presented that demonstrates the widespread use of the cornet during the early part of Elgar’s career. This is further substantiated by the wide availability of historic cornets today on internet auction sites. I have assembled a collection of six cornets which were made over a period of approximately fifty years, from the 1880s to, and including, the 1920s. The design of these different instruments, by four different manufacturers, is remarkably similar.

Playing the historic cornet is more akin to playing a modern B-flat trumpet than the historic B-flat trumpet: on the historic cornet the notes speak easily, the sound has a consistent

quality throughout the range, pitching is well focused, effective dynamic contrast is possible, and note-to-note flexibility is easily managed. The second recording of exercise 20 on page 14 of the Hall tutor (CD Track 32, Ex. 17.20 in Appendix 17), played on the cornet, demonstrates some of these qualities, particularly when compared to the recording of the same exercise on the historic B-flat trumpet (CD Track 29).⁷⁸

In Chapter Three, it was concluded that at the first performance of *Froissart*, in 1890, the trumpet parts were probably played on the cornet. The multi-track recording of an excerpt from this work was performed on the cornet (CD Track 33, Ex. 17.21 in Appendix 17) and the qualities of the instrument, listed above, are demonstrated on this recording. Particularly noticeable are the immediacy of tone and the large dynamic range achieved; dynamic contrast was much easier to achieve on the cornet than on either the F or the B-flat trumpets.

In his lecture to the Musical Association in 1895 Morrow illustrated his comments with performances on various instruments. He invited his audience to compare the sound of the cornet with the trumpet:

The assertion that the cornet can be played with a trumpet tone is good, and remains good until the two are heard at the same time, and under equal conditions; then, I think, the comparison will be in favour of the trumpet ... I propose to play a short passage on both instruments. You will hear the difference and judge for yourselves whether the loss of the superior quality of tone which I claim for the trumpet is to be so much deplored. (Morrow 1895: 139/140)

⁷⁸ The difference in pitch evident between these two recordings is due to the cornet only having the high-pitched B flat crook available.

Elgar scored for two F trumpets and two cornets in a small number of works written around 1901, the most significant being the concert overture *Cockaigne*. The recording of an excerpt from this work (CD Track 34, Ex. 17.22 in Appendix 17) provides an opportunity to judge Morrow's statement. In this passage the cornets play a short repeated figure of three notes which is then taken up by the trumpets. One of the main themes of *Cockaigne* is then taken up by the cornets, and the trumpets join in after four bars with Trumpet 1 playing an octave higher. The tone of the F trumpet has a dense quality when compared to the cornet, but the cornet tone is more immediate. In a large concert hall the dense sound of the F trumpet may have more projection than the sound of the cornet. When recording this excerpt the greatest contrast for me was the ease of fast passage work on the cornet; the F trumpet felt stiff in comparison. Finally, when comparing the sound quality of these two instruments the F trumpet in the upper register has a more brilliant, slightly edgy sound. In Elgar's scoring for two trumpets and two cornets he normally writes the highest-pitched parts for Trumpet 1, utilising this brilliant sound quality, whilst the lowest part is given to the second trumpet, which gives a solid bass to the chord. The recording of this extract was problematic regarding the matching of intonation. The B-flat crook with the Gisborne cornet is in high pitch, so that all the slides of the cornet had to be fully extended to synchronise pitch with the F trumpet, which had all the slides fully in.

Comparisons between the instruments: are the statements of Harper Jnr. and Morrow corroborated?

Is the cornet easier to play than the F trumpet?

Thomas Harper Jnr., the teacher of Morrow, was scathing in his condemnation of the cornet:

[the cornet] is attractive to many persons who wish to produce the loudest music with the least trouble ... It is easier to produce the harmonic notes on the Cornet than on the Trumpet ... it [the cornet] somewhat resembles the Trumpet tone, but still more differs from it ... having ... a looser or less dense, piercing, brilliant character than ... the trumpet. (Harper Jnr. 1875: Preface)

Although Harper Jnr. was comparing the cornet with the slide trumpet his comments apply equally to the F trumpet, as the slide trumpet has the same overall length as the F trumpet, 6 feet, therefore producing a similar quality of sound. The cornet is an easier instrument to play than the trumpet, for two main reasons. Firstly, the cornet has a greater proportion of tapered tubing. Secondly, the larger intervals between the harmonics of the shorter cornet enhances pitch security in the upper register.

The playing characteristics of the F trumpet and cornet identified in this chapter are corroborated by the differences between the two versions of *Legend* (CD Tracks 23 and 35, Ex. 17.11/17.23 in Appendix 17). The cornet part for this piece differs from the trumpet part with the addition of many slurs, which enhances the expressive quality of the slow melody of the outer sections, as demonstrated on the recording of the solo cornet part of

the first section (CD Track 34, Ex. 17.23 in Appendix 17).⁷⁹ In the first section no slurs are indicated for a trumpeter but a cornettist is asked to play seventeen different slurred groups of two or three notes. This also corroborates the conclusion in the previous chapter that cornettists, in solos, played in a different style to trumpeters. As the performer I can confidently state that the work is far easier to play on the cornet than the F trumpet.

A comparison of playing the F trumpet and the B-flat trumpet

As scathing as Harper Jnr. was towards the cornet, Morrow's view of the B-flat trumpet, the "trumpetina", was even more condemning:

It is excused by saying that it has a *trumpet bore*, but even this cannot make a short tube give a tone equal to the longer. I have tried it and had it tested by persons qualified to judge. It is a veritable jackdaw in peacock's feathers. A deception. Do not use it or countenance it. (Morrow 1895: 140)

After playing these historic instruments extensively I have empathy with Morrow's statement. The B-flat trumpet does not have the rich, dense sound of the F trumpet. This can be heard when comparing the recordings made on the F trumpet with those made on the B-flat trumpet. In particular, the martial character demonstrated on Track 3, an exercise from Morrow's tutor-book, is enhanced by the full sound of the F trumpet. The quality of tone is not matched by the B-flat trumpet on Track 15, an exercise from the tutor by Hall.

⁷⁹ The high pitch of the cornet made an alternative recording of *Legend* by Morgan impossible with piano accompaniment.

This music has a march-like character but the sound of the B-flat trumpet is rather “tinny”.

The reason for the superior tone of the F trumpet is its longer length of tubing.⁸⁰

The rich tone quality of the F trumpet blends with the rest of the brass section. As a listener I attended a performance of *The Dream of Gerontius* performed on period instruments;⁸¹ it was noticeable how well the trumpet section, all playing F trumpets, blended with the other brass instruments, and with the whole orchestra. This observation is at odds with Simon Baines’ assertion that developments in orchestral brass during the twentieth century were partly to produce more homogeneity: “instruments evolving to sound more like each other” (Baines 1996: 10). The brilliant sound of the B-flat trumpet, particularly in the upper register, contrasts much more with the sound produced by the horns, trombones and tubas, than does the fuller sound of the F trumpet.

The tone of the B-flat trumpet does have more projection and brilliance in the upper register when compared with the F trumpet. This is clearly demonstrated in the recordings of the orchestral excerpts from Elgar’s works. The incisive sound of the first trumpet part in the recording of the excerpt from *Falstaff* is not matched in any of the excerpts played on the F trumpet from *Light of Life*, *The Dream of Gerontius* or the *Enigma Variations*. Arguably, an ideal trumpet section sound would be created by having the highest parts played on the B-flat trumpet and lowest parts played on the larger F trumpet. This is

⁸⁰ The effect of a longer tube changing the tone colour of an instrument applies to all the brass family. When describing the tenor cor, which is pitched an octave above the horn in F or E flat, Humphries states: “Their shorter length means their tone is quite unlike that of the horn”. (Humphries 2000: 42)

⁸¹ The concert was held at Birmingham Town Hall on Sunday 28 November 2009. The Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment (led by Margaret Faultless) and Ex Cathedra Choir were conducted by Jeffrey Skidmore. The trumpeters listed in the programme were David Blackadder, Phillip Bainbridge and Timothy Hayward.

specified by some, particularly Russian, composers: for example, Shostakovich scores for two B-flat trumpets and one F trumpet in his Symphony No. 1 (1925).⁸²

The B-flat trumpet enables technically difficult passages to be rendered more securely than on the F trumpet. Steele-Perkins agrees regarding the difficulty of playing the F trumpet: “The works of Elgar for example, such as the *Enigma Variations*, are extremely difficult for a modern player to pitch on one of these old trumpets” (Steele-Perkins 2001: 71).

Conclusions

The playing styles identified in Chapter Six are to a large extent characteristics of the manner in which the instruments play, particularly when using historic mouthpieces. The strong, often accentuated, articulation heard on early recordings and recommended in contemporary tutor-books I found to be necessary, to force both the F trumpet and, to some extent, the B-flat trumpet to speak clearly when played with a flat-rimmed, sharp-edged mouthpiece. Slurring, particularly across wide intervals, I found to be difficult to realise cleanly on the F trumpet, more reliable on the B-flat trumpet, but easy on the cornet. I believe the design of the mouthpiece, particularly the flatter rim of the trumpet mouthpieces, is the main reason for this difference. The use of portamento, briefly addressed by Hall in his tutor has been demonstrated to be possible on the B-flat trumpet.

Performing on the three historic instruments, the F trumpet, B-flat trumpet and cornet has highlighted the differences in the tonal qualities between them. The criticism of the

⁸² Paul Benistone, principal trumpet of the London Philharmonic Orchestra, informs me that when performing this work and others with similar scoring a trumpet pitched in low G, similar to the old F trumpet, is used in their orchestra for the lowest part to achieve the correct balance of sound.

substitution of the F trumpet by the cornet made by many commentators, quoted throughout this thesis, I found to be justified. The sound produced by each of these instruments is significantly different. The tone of the F trumpet is dense and focused, with much projection in the middle and lower registers, particularly at the louder end of the dynamic spectrum, whereas the tone of the cornet is mellow and fluid, qualities lost at louder dynamic levels. From my performances on three historic instruments I can corroborate the claims of both Harper Jnr. and Morrow that the cornet is the easier instrument to play and that the B-flat trumpet does not produce the sound quality of the F trumpet, particularly in the lower and middle registers.

The wide repertoire that trumpeters of the late nineteenth century had to realise was highlighted in Chapter Two. The slide trumpet is not capable of realising much of this repertoire as it is not a fully chromatic instrument. The F trumpet could be described as a slide trumpet fitted with valves, but although a fully chromatic instrument, I have found its high register to be difficult to secure and lacking in projection. The anecdote, alluded to in Chapter One regarding Richard Strauss's *An Alpine Symphony* in London is not factually accurate, but the sentiment it expresses is entirely correct: the piece would be impossible to play reliably on the F trumpet. The cornet could be used to play all of the repertoire, and was used by many of the leading contemporary players. The cornet has the range, the flexibility and the reliability to render all the parts that were given to the trumpeters of the day. However, the tone quality of the cornet I found to be inferior.

The final section of this thesis draws together the various strands of research to form some overall conclusions concerning the trumpet world at the time of Elgar, and identifies areas for further research.

Conclusions to the project and areas for further research

This project set out to examine the transition of the trumpet in the United Kingdom from an instrument that was not fully chromatic to the almost universally accepted valved B-flat trumpet, four-and-a-half feet in length. Elgar's composing career coincided with the period of greatest change in the trumpet world, namely from c.1870 to c.1930, and the thesis examines this transition primarily as manifest in Elgar's works. The available literature concerning this topic is limited, so the research mainly focused on primary sources: scores of Elgar's works and those of his contemporaries; documents including concert programmes; journals and books; contemporary tutor-books; early recordings; the instruments themselves; and through the experience of playing three historic instruments from the period.

The analysis of the scores of Elgar's works in chronological order provided a timeline for these changes in the trumpet world, highlighting the different trumpets used and developments in the way Elgar wrote for them. The concert programmes proved to be extremely useful in correlating the individual works of Elgar with the trumpeters who first performed them. In addition, these programmes, along with other concert programmes, provided evidence of the daily demands made on trumpeters during the period. The three tutor-books, written by the leading trumpeters of their day and spanning a period from 1875 to 1937, yielded valuable evidence regarding playing styles, which was corroborated through the study of early recordings. Performing on the historic instruments afforded unique insights into the attributes and drawbacks of the instruments, which were, to a large extent, explained by the construction of the instruments and mouthpieces themselves. From these diverse studies, fresh insights emerged into the ever-changing world of the trumpet from the 1870s until 1934, the year of Elgar's death.

This study exposed six strands of research that can elucidate the practice of trumpet playing in the period of Elgar's career: the identification of trumpeters working both in London and in provincial centres; the everyday work of orchestral trumpeters towards the end of the nineteenth century; the reasons for the changes in the trumpet scoring of Elgar; the testimony of Elgar's contemporaries as witnesses to the changes in the trumpet world; the development of brass playing styles at the end of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries. Finally, the playing characteristics of instruments from this time are identified and related to all of the above.

This project has gone further than any other published research, to my knowledge, in identifying trumpeters working in England during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. As Elgar both began and ended his career in Worcestershire, with important first performances in Birmingham and other Midland and northern cities, the emphasis has mostly been on identifying trumpeters working in the provinces. It has demonstrated how few professional trumpeters were active compared to the numerous cornet players. The Corfield directory is a significant find for all researchers interested in musicians working in and around Birmingham in the first decade of the twentieth century. The identification of trumpeters performing in the Three Choirs Festivals shows how far professional players journeyed in search of work. From the programme details of other local concerts, for which Elgar often, in his youth, led the orchestra, the presence of a group of trumpeters and cornettists around Worcester has been identified. Finally, an important find from the research into the Hallé Orchestra's personnel listings and other concert listings is the identification of two continental-born trumpeters, Jaeger and Valk, who played the principal trumpet parts in the first performances in most of Elgar's major works from one of his most productive periods, 1899 to 1908.

Examples of the everyday work of trumpeters in the last decades of the nineteenth century are provided both by the detailed analysis of a season of Hallé Orchestra concerts, and by the concert programmes of various provincial music festivals. These concert programmes show that the demands made upon trumpeters, across the country, were increasing by the performance of much music that had recently been composed. The works of Wagner were particularly popular, and a fully chromatic instrument is required to realise the trumpet parts in his works. Any attempts by trumpeters of the time to perform these works on the slide trumpet could only have been partially successful, at best. These increasing technical challenges were a major reason for the changes in the trumpet world witnessed during Elgar's working life. However, trumpeters of the late nineteenth century were also required to perform the ever-popular works of Handel, and the slide trumpet was the traditional instrument on which to perform such obbligato parts as "The Trumpet shall sound" from *Messiah*. Trumpeters, then as now, had to be versatile and would have needed more than one instrument to perform all the different styles of music they were called upon to play.

This thesis demonstrates how close Elgar was to his trumpeters and their practices, and thus the extent to which his trumpet writing reflects the practices of his age. He was a pragmatic composer in close contact with the musicians with whom he was working. The correspondence to and from Elgar adds to the body of knowledge regarding the composer's relationship with the trumpeter Walter Morrow, from whom he sought advice. During the decades either side of the turn of the century when Elgar scored for the large F trumpet, the evidence leads to the conclusion that he was influenced by Morrow. The changes in Elgar's scoring for the trumpet over his career were, undoubtedly, a reflection of his observations of trumpeters of the time.

Elgar could also be considered a driver of change in the trumpet world. His instruction to the first trumpet in *The Kingdom* to change instruments to a D trumpet for a high-pitched, sustained passage, and then to change back to the B-flat instrument, appears to be unique and pioneering for the time.

The overview in Chapter Five of the trumpet writing in works by Elgar's contemporaries highlighted the variety of trumpets named in their scores. Some composers seemed to be looking back with, perhaps, nostalgia to the sound of the natural, valveless, trumpet. Each composer reacted to the changes in the trumpet world at their own pace. However, the changes in Elgar's writing for trumpet closely match those in the scores of Holst. These two composers, both orchestral players and conductors themselves, were indubitably responding to the changes in the trumpets they observed being used.

Brass playing styles of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries have been unjustifiably neglected by researchers in the field of performance practice. This thesis identifies features of the playing styles of the era from a limited number of historical recordings and compares these with evidence from three tutor-books written by leading players spanning the whole of Elgar's career. The conclusion was reached that trumpeters of Elgar's time performed in a style that I identify as martial in character: notes were played in a detached manner, they were strongly articulated (i.e. the start of the note loud and abrupt like the striking of a bell), and slurring was sparingly used, although slurring did gradually become more widespread towards the end of the period when a more lyrical style was often required. There was an increasing emphasis by composers during the period under study on the upper range of the trumpet, and reliability in this tessitura, coupled with a brilliant sound quality, could only be provided by the B-flat trumpet.

The discovery that the playing styles of band cornettists were completely different to that of orchestral cornet players was surprising. The use of a constant vibrato by the cornet soloists contrasts with the unwavering tone of the orchestral cornettists whose playing style was similar to orchestral trumpeters. This suggests that cornettists performing in bands could not have easily moved to an orchestral context without much adaptation of playing styles.

The performances on historic instruments provide unique observations regarding the way these instruments play, and are corroborated sonically by the recordings on the CD. The relative difficulties of each instrument are explored and the crucial role of the mouthpiece identified. The varying sound qualities of each instrument are demonstrated and related to the works of Elgar. These observations were then correlated with the comments of contemporary trumpeters. It was found that the playing characteristics of these instruments affected the playing styles of the era, and that pragmatic composers, such as Elgar, exploited the positive characteristics in the way they scored for the trumpet and the cornet. The differences, in both sound and playing characteristics, between the various trumpets and the cornet are described and demonstrated. Overall, the evidence from these performances indicates that the sound world that Elgar experienced can only be recreated by using instruments and, very importantly, mouthpieces of the period.

A surprising feature of all the works studied that are scored for the F trumpet is that the extended lower range of this instrument is not used. In fact, the lowest note Elgar calls for throughout his works, *e* flat, is scored for the B-flat instrument. The most likely reason for the avoidance of writing in the F trumpet's lower register is that the range overlaps with horns and trombones in an orchestral setting. Despite the fact that this lower range could

be considered as an extra resource for a composer, very few solo works that I have found for the F trumpet exploit the lowest register.

All endeavours which involve performance – sporting or artistic – are rife with anecdotes of the exploits of past performers and sportsmen. This is particularly true of occasions that took place before the invention of sound recording and photography, which could provide physical evidence to challenge or corroborate these anecdotes. Anecdotes are ubiquitous in the music profession in general, and the brass world in particular. They are interesting, but, like Chinese whispers, have changed over time. This thesis challenges anecdotal evidence, providing a narrative that is grounded in primary research, and is offered as a contribution to the growing body of scholarly knowledge concerning the trumpet world of the past.

Areas for further research

This thesis has exposed some new lines of enquiry in the following fields: the identification of trumpeters both nationally renowned and local players; the working lives and social status of these trumpeters; the solo and chamber music compositions for the trumpet, particularly the F trumpet; and brass playing styles at the end of the nineteenth and beginning of the twentieth centuries in the United Kingdom.

Foreign musicians have influenced the musical life of the United Kingdom for centuries, both as composers and performers. The influence of the two continental trumpeters, Gustav Jaeger and Johannes Valk, who, apart from a period of three years at the turn of the century, held the principal trumpet position of the Hallé Orchestra between 1872 and 1917, is a vital area for further research to fully understand this period in the history of the

trumpet in the United Kingdom. What did they do before joining the Hallé and where did they go after? What types of trumpet did they play? Were their trumpets rotary or piston valved? These questions are only partially answered by this thesis.

A potential area for further research into this period of transition in the world of the trumpet would be the lives of other individual trumpeters. For example, the letterhead used by Morrow in his correspondence to Elgar gives his address and phone number. Some use was made of the census returns in this thesis regarding Jaeger and Valk; Morrow would have completed his return many times during his long life, and perhaps through other civic records it may be possible to trace living descendants. This research (i.e. the study of personal lives) would bring to light the social and financial standing of trumpeters during this period and would be a fascinating area of further study. The Hallé Orchestra started a pension scheme in the early twentieth century, the ledgers for which provide much information regarding their personnel, including some press cuttings inserted in these. The archive of the Musician's Union would also be a good starting point for such a project.

The solo and chamber music compositions for trumpet from this period also constitute a promising area for further research. The known solo repertoire for the trumpet from the late romantic era is sparse, although York Bowen's recently rediscovered *Andante and Allegro* for two F trumpets and piano, unfortunately undated, has been published. Are there other extant works, long forgotten, in the archives?

There is ongoing research into the performance styles of singers, pianists and string players during Elgar's career, but brass playing styles in general, and trumpet playing styles in particular, have not received the same attention. The research included in this thesis was concentrated on three contemporary tutor-books and a limited number of

recordings. There is much further work needed, perhaps involving the observations of contemporary commentators and critics, that could potentially identify any national styles of brass playing.

Excluded from this study was the influence of the emerging genres of jazz and dance band styles. These musical styles grew rapidly in importance after World War 1, and their cross-fertilization with classical trumpet performance within the United Kingdom is another important area for further research. The dance band was a prominent feature in many of the high-quality hotels in London and the major cities of the United Kingdom, and many dance halls were opened between the two world wars. The dance bands provided numerous employment opportunities for trumpeters in general, and in particular young players, until well into the 1960s, when I played in a dance band, resident in a working men's club, while still at school. The emergence of dance bands between the world wars coincided with the rapid growth in the recording industry. The dance bands made a great number of recordings, and these recordings could be set alongside contemporary classical recordings to compare playing styles. Furthermore, the influence of jazz and dance-band styles on the trumpet writing of composers such as Constant Lambert is an under-researched area.

Although the changes in the world of the trumpet, identified and examined in this thesis, may seem confined to this area of musicology and rather small in relation to the huge social and political changes that occurred during Elgar's life time, they are nonetheless also of importance for anyone interested in Elgar's compositions and their performance. It is a sobering thought that as a boy Elgar often travelled with his father around the country houses of Worcestershire, on his piano tuning round, by pony and trap, but in the last year of his life he travelled from London to Paris, by aircraft, to conduct his Violin Concerto.

Bibliography

Adams, B. (2004), 'Elgar's Later Oratorios: Roman Catholicism, Decadence and the Wagnerian Dialectic of Shame and Grace', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 81–105.

Alder, M.B. (1982), 'Memories of a Pupil', in *An Elgar Companion*, ed. C. Redwood (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing), pp. 147–149.

Anderson, R. (2004), 'Elgar and his Publishers', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 24–31.

Anderson, R. and Kent, C. (1983), Commentary to *The Apostles*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 8 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Anderson, R. and Moore, J. N. (1984), Commentary to Symphony No.2, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 31 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Anderson, R. and Moore, J.N. (1985), Commentary to *Caracatus*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 5 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Anzenberger, F. (1992), 'The Earliest French Tutor for Slide Trumpet: An Annotated Bibliography', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 4, pp. 106–111.

Anzenberger, F. (1993), 'Method Books for Natural Trumpet in the 19th century: An Annotated Bibliography', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 5, pp. 1–21.

Anzenberger, F. (1995), 'Method Books for Trumpet and Cornet using Stopped Notes in the 19th century: An Annotated Bibliography', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 7, pp. 1–11.

Anzenberger, F. (1996), 'Method Books for the Slide Trumpet: An Annotated Bibliography', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 8, pp. 1–13.

Anzenberger, F. (1997), 'Method Books for Valve Trumpet to 1850: An Annotated Bibliography', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 9, pp. 1–13.

Arban, J. B. (1907), *Cornet Method* (Hawkes & Son: London).

Archer, B. (1995), 'The Nature of Research' in *Co-design, Interdisciplinary Journal of Design* January 1995 pp 6-13 – accessed on 20/09/2017 from:

<https://ia800201.us.archive.org/21/items/TheNatureOfResearch/Archer1995Codesign.pdf>

Bach, V. (1916 reprinted 1969), *The Art of Trumpet Playing* (Elkhart: Vincent Bach Corp.).

Baines, A. (1976), *Brass Instruments: Their History and Development* (London: Faber).

Baines, S.G. (1996), 'The Evolution of Orchestral Brass in the last Hundred Years: Organology, Trends in Performance Practice and their Effects' (unpublished PhD thesis, Keele University).

Ballard, G. (2006), commentary to *Andante and Allegro* by Edwin York Bowen, (York: Emerson).

Barclay, R. (1997), 'Design, Technology and Manufacture before 1800', in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 24-37.

Bate, P. (1978), *The Trumpet and Trombone* (London: Benn).

Baughan, E.A. (1898 reprinted 1982), 'Caractacus' in *The Musical Standard*, reprinted in *An Elgar Companion*, ed. C. Redwood (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing), pp. 19-25.

Berlioz, H. (1844), enlarged and revised by Strauss R. (1904) translated by Front, T. (1948) republished 1991, *Treatise on Instrumentation* (New York: Dover).

Bird, M. (2013), *Edward Elgar: Collected Correspondence: Provincial Musician: Diaries 1857-1896* (Rickmansworth: Elgar Works).

Bird, M. (2014), An *Elgarian Who's Who* (Rickmansworth: Elgar Works).

Birkemeir, R.P. (1984), 'The Orchestral Trumpet of the Nineteenth Century: an Historical and Acoustical Survey' (unpublished DM dissertation, Northwestern University USA).

Birkemeier, R.P. (1985(1)), 'The History and Music of the Orchestral Trumpet of the Nineteenth Century Part I', *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, vol. 9/3, pp. 23–39.

Birkemeier, R.P. (1985(2)), 'The History and Music of the Orchestral Trumpet of the Nineteenth Century, Part II', *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, vol. 9/4, pp. 13–27.

Birkemeir, R.P. (1989), 'The F Trumpet and its Last Virtuoso, Walter Morrow', *Brass Bulletin*, vol. 65, pp. 34–45.

Blake, C. E. (1957 reprinted 1982), 'Memories of my Father', *The Musical Times*, reprinted in *An Elgar Companion*, ed. C. Redwood (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing), pp. 165-167.

Bradley, S. (2015), *The Railways: Nation, Network and People* (London: Profile Books).

Brekke, J. (2004), 'The Forgotten Trumpet: A Historical Examination of the Low F Valve Trumpet' (unpublished DA thesis, University of Northern Colorado).

Brownlow, A. (1996), *The Last Trumpet: A History of the English Slide Trumpet* (New York: Pendragon Press).

Carse, A. (1939), *Musical Wind Instruments* (London: MacMillan).

Carse, A. (1948), *The Orchestra from Beethoven to Berlioz* (Cambridge: Heffer and Sons).

Corfield, L. (1903), *Corfield's List of Local Instrumentalists containing the Names, Addresses, Instruments etc., of a Thousand-and-One of the Best Known Players in Birmingham - (Professional and Amateur)* (Birmingham: self-published).

Dale, C. (2007), 'The Provincial Musical Festival in Nineteenth-century England: A Case Study of Bridlington', in *Music in the British Provinces, 1690-1914*, ed. R. Cowgill and P. Holman P (Aldershot: Ashgate Publications), pp. 325–347.

Dauverné, F.G.A. (1857 translation 1991), 'Method for Trumpet', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 3, pp.179–261.

Day, T. (2004), 'Elgar and Recording', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 184–194.

Dibble, J. (2004), 'Elgar and his British Contemporaries', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 15–23.

Doctor, J. (2004), 'Broadcasting's Ally: Elgar and the BBC', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 195–203.

Dudgeon, R. (1997), 'Keyed Brass', in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 131–142.

Drummond, P. (2011), *The Provincial Music Festival in England 1784-1914* (Farnham: Ashgate).

Duffin, R.W. (2007), *How Equal Temperament Ruined Harmony* (New York; London: Norton).

Ehrlich, C. (1985), *The Music Profession in Britain since the Eighteenth Century* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Fenby, E. (1936), *Delius as I Knew Him* (London: Quality Press).

Forsyth, C. (1914), *Orchestration* (London: Macmillan & Co. Ltd. and Stainer & Bell).

Fuller Maitland, J. A. (1906 reprinted 1922), 'Hallé', in *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edition, ed. Fuller Maitland (London: Macmillan), vol. II, pp. 275–276.

Fuller Maitland, J. A. (1906 reprinted 1922), 'Portamento', in *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edition, ed. Fuller Maitland (London: Macmillan), vol. III, p. 795.

Hall, E. (1937), *OTTO LANGEY'S / PRACTICAL / TUTOR / for the / CORNET OR TRUMPET / NEW EDITION / REVISED AND ENLARGED BY / ERNEST HALL, A.R.C.M. / PROFESSOR OF THE TRUMPET AND CORNET / ROYAL COLLEGE OF MUSIC, LONDON / PRINCIPAL TRUMPET B.B.C. SYMPHONY ORCHESTRA* (London: Hawkes and Son).

Harper Snr., T. (1835 1st edition / 1837 2nd edition), *Instructions / FOR THE / TRUMPET / With the use of the Chromatic Slide, / Also the / Russian Valve Trumpet, / THE / CORNET À PISTONS OR SMALL STOP TRUMPET, / AND THE / Keyed Bugle, / In which the RUDIMENTS of MUSIC and the / VARIOUS SCALES, / Are clearly explained in a SERIES of / Examples, Preludes, Lessons, Solos, Duets &c. / for each Instrument, / Composed, Arranged, and Dedicated (by Permission) TO / The Right Hon[our]able. / General Lord*

Hill / Commander in Chief / By / THOMAS HARPER / Professor of the Trumpet at the Royal Academy of Music, First Trumpet at the King's Theatre, Philharmonic Concerts & c.
 (London: self-published).

Harper Jnr., T. (1865), *HARPER'S / SCHOOL / for the / Cornet à pistons / CONTAINING / in addition to complete instructions in the Art of playing the Instrument / 100 / PROGRESSIVE / EXERCISES.* (London: Rudall, Rose, Carte & Co.).

Harper Jnr., T. (1875), *HARPER'S / SCHOOL / FOR THE / TRUMPET / Containing (in addition to the usual Instructions) a full description of the Instrument, / Observations on the use of the Slide / and / on the mode of writing music for the Trumpet, / also / several remarks connected with the Art of playing the Instrument, / and / 100 / PROGRESSIVE / EXERCISES.* (London: Rudall, Carte & Co.).

Harper-Scott, J. P. E. (2004), 'Elgar's Unwumbling: the Theatre Music', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 171–183.

Hendrei, D. (2007), 'Development of Bore Reconstruction Techniques Applied to the Study of Brass Wind Instrument' (unpublished PhD thesis, University of Edinburgh).

Henley, D. and McKernan, V. (2009), *The Original Liverpool Sound: The Royal Liverpool Philharmonic Story* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press).

Herbert, T. (1992), 'Victorian Brass Bands: The Establishment of a "Working Class Musical Tradition"', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol.4, pp. 1–11.

Herbert, T. (1997), 'Brass Bands and Other Vernacular Brass Traditions', in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 177–192.

Herbert, T. (2001), *Music in Words* (London: ABRSM).

Herbert, T. (2006), *The Trombone* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press).

Herbert, T. (2002), 'Wind Instruments', in *A Performer's Guide to Music of the Romantic Period*, ed. A. Burton (ABRSM: London), pp. 57–70.

Herbert, T. (2010), 'Trombone Glissando: A Case Study in Continuity and Change in Brass Instrument Performance Idioms', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 22, pp. 1–18.

Herbert, T. and Barlow H. (2013), *Music and the British Military in the Long Nineteenth Century* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Hickman, D. R. (2006), *Trumpet Pedagogy* (Chandler: Hickman Music Editions).

Hipkins, A. J. (1906 reprinted 1922), 'Trumpet', in *Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edition, ed. J. A. Fuller Maitland (London: Macmillan), vol V, pp. 167–171.

Holloway, R. (2004), 'The Early Choral Works', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 63–80.

Humphries, J. (2000), *The Early Horn: A Practical Guide* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Hunt, D. (1999), *Elgar and the Three Choirs Festival* (Worcester: Osborne Books).

Husk, W. H. (1906 reprinted 1922), ‘Three Choirs of Gloucester, Worcester and Hereford’, in *Grove’s Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd edition, ed. J. A. Fuller Maitland (London: Macmillan), vol. V, p. 97.

Kelly, J. E. (2013), *Elgar’s Best Friend: Alfred Rodewald of Liverpool* (Lancaster: Carnegie).

Kennedy, M. (1960), *The Hallé Tradition: A Century of Music* (Manchester: Manchester University Press).

Kent, C. (1978), ‘Edward Elgar: A Composer at Work’ (unpublished PhD thesis, University of London, King’s College).

Kent, C. (1993), *Edward Elgar: A Guide to Research* (New York and London: Garland Publications).

Kent, C. (2004), ‘Magic by Mosaic: Some Aspects of Elgar’s Compositional Methods’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 32–49.

Koehler, E. (2014), *Fanfares and Finesse* (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press).

Lloyd, S. (1982), 'Elgar as a Conductor', in *An Elgar Companion*, ed. C. Redwood (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing), pp. 291-306.

Lyle, A. (2008), Commentary to *Music For Powick Asylum*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 22 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Laurence, D.H. (1981), *Shaw's Music: The Complete Musical Criticism of Bernard Shaw Volume 1 1876-1890* (London: The Bodley Head).

Laurence, D.H. (1981), *Shaw's Music: The Complete Musical Criticism of Bernard Shaw Volume 2 1890-1893* (London: The Bodley Head).

Laurence, D.H. (1981), *Shaw's Music: The Complete Musical Criticism of Bernard Shaw Volume 3 1893-1950* (London: The Bodley Head).

Mandel, C. (1859), *A TREATISE / ON / THE INSTRUMENTATION / OF / MILITARY BANDS; / DESCRIBING THE CHARACTER AND PROPER EMPLOYMENT OF EVERY / MUSICAL INSTRUMENT USED IN / REED BANDS.* (London: Boosey & Sons).

Mark, C. (2004), 'The Later Orchestral Music (1910-1934)', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 154-170.

McGrattan, A. (2015), 'George Eskdale Cornet Prodigy, Military Bandsman and Trumpeter at the Savoy: the Prelude to a Glittering Career', *The Brass Herald*, vol. 60, pp. 30–33.

McVeagh, D. (2004), 'Elgar's Musical Language: the Shorter Instrumental Works' in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 50–62.

Mitchell, W.R. (1987), *Elgar in the Yorkshire Dales* (Giggleswick: W.R. Mitchell).

Moore, J.N. (1972), *Elgar: A Life in Photographs* (London: Oxford University Press).

Moore, J.N. (1982), 'Young Elgar at the Festival' in *An Elgar Companion*, ed. C. Redwood (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing), pp. 26–34.

Moore, J.N. (1984), *Edward Elgar: A Creative Life* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Moore, J.N. (1992 revised 1993), CD liner notes to *The Elgar Edition: The Complete Electrical Recordings of Sir Edward Elgar* (London: EMI Classics).

Moore, J.N. (2012), *Letters of a Lifetime* (Rickmansworth: Elgar Works).

Morrow, W. (1895), 'The Trumpet as an Orchestral Instrument', in *The Proceedings of the Musical Association 1894-1895* pp. 133–147 (accessed from <http://jstor.org/stable/765374> on 22/08/2012).

Morrow, W. (1907), *JULIUS KOSLECK'S / SCHOOL FOR THE TRUMPET / Revised and adapted to the study / of the Trumpet-à-pistons in F. as used in the orchestras / of England and America. / BY / WALTER MORROW / ASSOC. PHIL. SOC. / Teacher of the Trumpet at The London Royal College of Music / and The Guildhall School of Music.* (Leipzig and London: Breitkopf & Hartel).

Morrow, W. (1911), *OTTO LANGEY'S / TUTOR / for the / Cornet / REVISED, RE-ARRANGED & MANY STUDIES ADDED, SELECTED FROM THE WORKS OF THE GREAT MASTERS, ALSO SOME EXERCISES / & MELODIUS STUDIES WITH MARKS OF PHRASING & EXPRESSION CAREFULLY MARKED, COMPOSED FOR THIS TUTOR BY / WALTER MORROW, / PROFESSOR OF THE CORNET & TRUMPET AT THE GUILDHALL SCHOOL OF MUSIC & MEMBER OF THE ORCHESTRAS;- / PHILHARMONIC SOCIETY, ROYAL CHORAL SOCIETY, RICHTER CONCERTS, LONDON SYMPHONY CONCERTS, ETC.* (London: Hawkes and Son).

Myers, A. (1997(1)), ‘How Brass Instruments Work’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 19–23.

Myers, A. (1997(2)), ‘Design, Technology and Manufacture since 1800’ in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 115–130.

Myers, A. (2012), ‘How Different are Cornets and Trumpet?’, *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 24, pp. 113-128.

Myers, A. & Eldredge, N. (2006), 'The Brasswind Production of Marthe Besson's London Factory', *Galpin Society Journal*, vol. LIX, pp. 43-75.

Nettel, R. (1944), *Music in the Five Towns* (London: Oxford University Press).

Nettel, R. (1945), *Ordeal by Music* (London: Oxford University Press).

Nightingale, J. (2014), 'The Decline of the Clarino Style in Central Europe during the Late Eighteenth Century', *International Trumpet Guild Journal*, vol. 39/1, pp. 45-49.

Philip, R. (1992), *Early Recordings and Musical Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press).

Philip, R. (2004), *Performing Music in the Age of Recording* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press).

Prout, E. (1898), *The Orchestra Vol. 1* (London: Augener & Co.).

Reed, W. H. (1936), *Elgar as I Knew Him*, (London: Victor Gallant).

Redwood, C. (1982), *An Elgar Companion* (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing).

Ridgeon, J. (1986), *The Physiology of Brass Playing* (Oakham: Brass Wind Publications).

Rose, A. (1895), *Talks with Bandsmen* (London: republished by Tony Bingham).

Rushton, J. (2004), 'In Search of the Symphony: Orchestral Music to 1908', in *The Cambridge Companion to Elgar*, ed. D. Grimley and J. Rushton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 139–153.

Short, M. (1999), *Gustav Holst The Man and his Music* (Oxford: Oxford University Press).

Smithers, D. L. (1973), *The Music and History of the Baroque Trumpet before 1721* (London: Dent).

Steele-Perkins, C. (1994), 'Dart's Dated Drums Dropped', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 6, pp. 338–342.

Steele-Perkins, C. (2001), *Trumpet* (London: Kahn & Averill).

Sutcliffe Smith, J. (1944), *The Story of Music in Birmingham* (Birmingham: Cornish Brothers).

Tarr, E. (1988), *The Trumpet* (London: Batsford).

Tarr, E. (1993), 'The Romantic Trumpet part 1', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 5, pp. 213–261.

Tarr, E. (1994), 'The Romantic Trumpet part 2', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 6, pp. 110–215.

Tarr, E. (1997), 'The Trumpet before 1800', in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 84–102.

Tarr, E. (1999), 'Ferdinand Weinschenk (1831-1901), Pivotal Figure in German Trumpet History', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 11, pp. 10–36.

Tarr, E. (2005), liner notes to *European Cornet and Trumpet Soloists 1899-1950*, ITG CD 114 (Westfield Massachusetts: International Trumpet Guild).

Terry, R. (1934 reprinted 1982), 'Elgar as I knew him', *The Radio Times* reprinted in *An Elgar Companion*, ed. C. Redwood (Ashbourne: Sequoia in association with Moorland Publishing), pp. 150–153.

Vereeck, H. and Carter, Stewart (2014), 'Mouthpieces for Brasswinds in the Writings of Victor-Charles Mahillon: A Historical and Analytical Review', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 26, pp. 43–61.

Wallace, J. (1997), 'Brass Solo and Chamber Music since 1800', in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and Wallace J. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 236–254.

Wallace, J. and McGrattan, A. (2011), *The Trumpet* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press).

Waterhouse, W. (1993), *The New Langwill Index* (London: Tony Bingham).

Webb, J. (1993), 'The English Slide Trumpet', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 5, pp. 262–279.

Whitehead, L. & Myers, A. (2004), 'The Köhler Family of Brasswind Instrument Makers', *Historic Brass Society Journal*, vol. 16, pp. 89-123.

Williamson, J. and Cloonan, M. (2016), *Player's Work Time* (Manchester: Manchester University Press).

Wills, S. (1997), 'Brass in the Modern Orchestra' in *The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. T. Herbert and J. Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 157–176.

Worthington, E.C. (2013), 'The Modernisation of Wind Playing in London Orchestras, 1909-1939: a Study of Playing Style in Early Orchestral Recordings' (unpublished PhD Thesis, University of York).

Young P. M. (1967), *A History of British Music* (London: Ernest Benn).

Scores discussed:

Delius, F. (1909), *Paris: The Song of a Great City* (Leipzig: Universal Edition).

Delius, F. (1921), *Violin Concerto* (London: Augener).

Delius, F. (1927), *Appalachia* (London: Universal Edition assigned to Hawkes & Son (1939)).

Elgar, E. (1879-84), *Powick Music*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 22, (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Elgar, E. (1890), *Froissart* (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1893), *The Black Knight* (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1896), *The Light of Life* (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1896), *Scenes from the Saga of King Olaf*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 4, (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Elgar, E. (1898), *Caractacus*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 5, (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Elgar, E. (1899), *Variations for Orchestra (Enigma)* (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1900), *The Dream of Gerontius*; (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1902), *Pomp and Circumstance Military Marches No.1 and No.2* (London: Boosey).

Elgar, E. (1903), *The Apostles*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 8, (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Elgar, E. (1904), *In the South (Alassio)* (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1906), *The Kingdom*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 9, (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).

Elgar, E. (1907), *Pomp and Circumstance Military March No.4* (London: Boosey).

Elgar, E. (1908), *Symphony No.1 in A flat* (London: Novello).

Elgar, E. (1910), *Violin Concerto* (London: Novello).

- Elgar, E. (1911), Symphony No.2 in E flat (London: Novello).
- Elgar, E. (1912), *The Crown of India*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 18 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).
- Elgar, E. (1913), *Falstaff: Symphonic Study in C minor* (London: Novello).
- Elgar, E. (1915), *Polonia*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 33 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).
- Elgar, E. (1915), *The Starlight Express*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 19 (London: The Elgar Society).
- Elgar, E. (1917), *The Sanguine Fan*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 21 (London: The Elgar Society).
- Elgar, E. (1919), Concerto for Violoncello (London: Novello).
- Elgar, E. (1928), *Beau Brummel*, Elgar Complete Edition, vol. 21 (Rickmansworth: The Elgar Society).
- Holst, G. (1899), *A Cotswold Symphony* (London: Faber).
- Holst, G. (1906), *A Somerset Rhapsody* (London: Novello).
- Holst, G. (1911), *Ben Mora* (Florida: Kalmus).
- Holst, G. (1918), *The Planets* (London: Goodwin and Tabb later assigned to Boosey & Hawkes).
- Holst, G. (1923), *The Perfect Fool* (London: Novello).
- Holst, G. (1925), *First Choral Symphony* (London: Novello).
- Holst, G. (1928), *Egdon Heath* (London: Novello).
- Parry, H. (1889), Symphony No.3 (*The English*) IMSLP61404-PMLP125510.
- Stanford, C. V. (1887), Symphony No.3 (*The Irish Symphony*) (London: Novello).
- Stravinsky, I. (1911), *Petrushka* (Editions Russes de Musique: Berlin; reprinted Dover Publications: Mineola)

Vaughan Williams, R. (1910), Symphony No. 1 (*A Sea Symphony*) (London: Stainer & Bell).

Vaughan Williams, R. (1912), Symphony No. 2 (*A London Symphony*) (London: Stainer & Bell).

Vaughan Williams, R. (1924), Symphony No. 3 (*A Pastoral Symphony*) (London: Boosey and Hawkes).

Walton, W. (1931), *Belshazzar's Feast* London: Oxford University Press).

Selected Discography

1. Historical recordings discussed

European Cornet and Trumpet Soloists 1899-1950; ITG CD114 (Westfield MA) - a 2-CD compilation of performers from France, Algeria, Germany, Italy, Switzerland, Austria, Russia and Great Britain.

From CD 2

Track 12. Gounod, *Serenade*, performed by Sergeant Leggett with unknown band (1910-11).

Track 16. Damaré, *Cleopatra*, performed by Edwin Firth (cornet) with Foden's Prize Brass Band (1913-14).

Track 22. Handel, 'Hallelujah Chorus' from *Messiah*, performed by the Royal Choral Society, Royal Albert Hall Orchestra cond. Malcolm Sargent (live recording 2 April 1926).

The Elgar Edition: The Complete Electrical Recordings of Sir Edward Elgar; E.M.I. Classics 5099909 569423: London.

From CD 2

Elgar, Symphony No.2, London Symphony Orchestra cond. Edward Elgar (1927)

From CD 7

Elgar, *Cockaigne*, Royal Albert Hall Orchestra cond. Edward Elgar (1926)

From CD 9

Elgar, *Cockaigne*, London Symphony Orchestra cond. Edward Elgar (1933)

2. Other relevant historical recordings

The Elgar Edition: The Complete Electrical Recordings of Sir Edward Elgar, E.M.I.

Classics 5099909 569423: London.

Complete listing:

CD 1: Symphony No.1 in A flat (1930); *Falstaff* (1932).

CD 2: Symphony No.2 in E flat (1927) (including the whole of the rehearsal sequence and both versions of the Rondo).

CD 3: *The Dream of Gerontius* (excerpts 1927); *Civic Fanfare and National Anthem* (1927); *The Music Makers* - (excerpts 1927).

CD 4: 'Enigma' Variations (1926); Violin Concerto (Yehudi Menuhin, vn; 1932).

CD 5: *The Ward of Youth* (Suites 1 & 2) (1928); *Nursery Suite* (1931); *Severn Suite* (1932).

CD 6: *The Crown of India* (Suite 1930); *Three Bavarian Dances* (1927/1932); *Chanson de nuit* (1927); *Chanson de matin* (1927); *Three Characteristic Pieces* (1933); *Land of Hope and Glory* (1928); Bach/Elgar Fantasia and Fugue in C minor (1926).

CD 7: *Froissart* (1933); *Cockaigne* (1926); *In the South* (1930); *Falstaff* (Interludes 1929); Cello Concerto (Beatrice Harrison, cello 1928).

CD 8: *Beau Brummel* (Minuet 1928); *Beau Brummel* (Minuet); *Rosemary; Salut d'amour*; Minuet Op. 21; *Sérénade lyrique*; *May Song*; *Carissima* (1929); Five Piano Improvisations (1929); Pomp and Circumstance Marches 1–5 (1926-30); *Land of Hope and Glory* (1931).

CD 9: *The Kingdom* (Prelude 1933); Pomp and Circumstance Marches 1, 2 and 4 (1932-3); *Cockaigne* (1933); Serenade in E minor (1933); Elegy (1933).

Appendix - contained on CD 9 "Woodland Interlude & March" from *Caractacus* cond. Collingwood (1934); *Mina* cond. Murray and Wood (1934 and 1935); Coronation March cond. Ronald (1935).

Two other collections of Elgar's recordings are currently readily available:

Elgar conducts Elgar: The Complete Recordings, 1914-1925; 2011 restorations by Lani Spahr; Music and Arts Programs of America. Inc. CD 1257: (Kensington CA) a 4-CD collection of all Elgar's recordings using the acoustic process.

CD 1: *Carissima* (1914); *The Sanguine Fan* (1920); *The Fringes of the Fleet* (1917); *Carillon* (1915); *Polonia* (1919); *The Starlight Express* (1916).

CD 2: *Cockaigne* (1917); *In the South* (1921/23); Violin Concerto (Marie Hall, vn. 1916); Cello Concerto (Beatrice Harrison, cello 1919/20); *Salut d'amour* (1914); *Chanson de nuit* (1919); *King Olaf* - (excerpt 1921); *The Dream of Gerontius* (excerpt 1917); *The Light of Life* Meditation (1925).

CD 3: *Sea Pictures* (Leila Megane mezzo sop. 1922/23); 'Enigma' Variations (1920); Pomp & Circumstance Marches Nos. 1 & 4 (1914); *Three Bavarian Dances* (1914); Bach/Elgar - Fantasia and Fugue in C (1921/23); Handel/Elgar - Overture in D (1923).

CD 4: *The Wand of Youth* Suite No.1 (1919); *The Wand of Youth* Suite No.2 (1917); Unissued takes from both Suites (1917/19); Symphony No. 2 in E flat (1924/25).

Elgar Remastered; - Elgar's recordings remastered by Lani Spahr including stereo reconstructions and unissued takes; Somm Recordings: Thames Ditton Surrey England SOMMCD 261-4. A 4-CD collection containing some remastered and unissued takes from the complete electrical recordings of Elgar quoted above.

Web sites quoted

www.lso.co.uk/1900s-1910s accessed 28/07/13 - this link does not work as of April 2018.

The information is now visible on the LSO website at <http://www.lso.co.uk/orchestra/history/chronology-alt/1910s.html>

www.vintagedrumforum.com accessed 18/09/16

www.vaughanwilliams.uk

<https://ia800201.us.archive.org/21/items/TheNatureOfResearch/Archer1995Codesign.pdf>

accessed on 20/09/17